

Food and the Spanish Nation
Islamic Influences in Early Modern Spanish National Cuisine

Zachary Cho

May 1, 2020

A thesis submitted to Professor James Krippner and Professor Alexander Kitroeff in partial fulfilment of History 400: Senior Thesis Seminar at Haverford College

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| ABSTRACT..... | 2 |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS..... | 3 |
| INTRODUCTION..... | 4 |
| FOOD AND NATIONAL IDENTITY..... | 8 |
| CONCEPTUALIZING “SPAIN” AND “SPANISHNESS” VIS-À-VIS THE LEGACY OF AL-ANDALUS..... | 13 |
| a. Defining a “Spanish” Nation and a “Spaniard” | |
| b. The Question of Iberian Muslims | |
| COOKBOOKS IN EARLY MODERN IBERIA AND THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NATIONAL CUISINE..... | 24 |
| a. <i>Libre de coch</i> (Mestre Ruperto) | |
| b. <i>Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería</i> (Francisco Martínez Montañó) | |
| c. <i>Libro del arte de cozina</i> (Diego Granado) | |
| d. <i>Libro del Arte de Cozina</i> (Domingo Hernández de Maceras) | |
| AL-ANDALUSIAN COOKING MANUSCRIPTS..... | 37 |
| a. <i>Kitab al tabikh fi-l-Maghrib wa-l-Andalus fi `asr al-Muwabbidin, limu'allif majbul</i> | |
| b. <i>Fudalat-al-Hiwan Fi Tayyibat al-Ta'am Wa-l-Ahwan</i> (Ibn Razin al-Tugibi) | |
| CONFRONTING THE ISLAMIC ROOTS OF “SPANISH” NATIONAL CUISINE..... | 47 |
| a. Islamic Culinary Traditions in Early Modern Iberia | |
| b. Segregations of Taste and Differentiating “Spanish” Cuisine from that of Al-Andalus | |
| CONCLUSION..... | 57 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY..... | 62 |

ABSTRACT

This thesis discusses the visibility of Islamic influences in the cuisine of early modern Iberia and its cultural and political implications on the emerging discourse of a “Spanish” national identity. Formerly divided into numerous independent and competing kingdoms, the Iberian Peninsula was mostly unified under Christendom in 1492 and the new joint monarchs, Ferdinand of Aragon and Isabel of Castile, chartered several imperial expeditions under the name of the crown. Having this semblance of unity, the peninsula’s inhabitants started to think of what notions such as “Spain” and “Spanishness” meant and how factors such as race, geography, and culture constituted this nascent sense of national identity. Eventually, the idea that “Spaniards” were descended from a long line of non-convert Christians became firmly ingrained in society, meaning Hispano-Muslims and *mudéjares* (Muslim converts to Christianity) were not considered to be “Spanish” despite their longstanding legacy in the Iberian Peninsula. However, food, which is significant to discussions of national identity as it plays a crucial role in forming individual and collective identities, presented a more complicated picture in how early modern Iberia dealt with the cultural imprint of Al-Andalus. Cookbooks published in early modern Iberia mirrored their medieval Al-Andalusian counterparts in terms of their content and conventions, from including ingredients and recipes particularly prized in the culinary sphere of Islam to approaching food from a medicinal perspective. But food culture in early modern Iberia also distanced itself from that of Muslims, as seen through privileging pork (which is prohibited in Islam) and cookbooks heavily focusing on Christian dietary laws such as food for Lent. All in all, there remains no doubt that constructions of a “Spanish” national identity through food in the early modern period extensively borrowed from the gastronomy of Hispano-Muslims, but overt segregations of tastes in numerous instances complicates the issue of whether the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus in the Iberian Peninsula was truly recognized.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I owe the completion of this thesis to the many people that supported me during this journey. First, I would like to thank my advisor Jim Krippner and second reader/seminar leader Alex Kitroeff for their guidance and faith in my abilities as a historian throughout the entire project. I would also like to thank Haverford College's History Department in general for giving me the opportunity to engage in this rich intellectual endeavor that not only challenged me to put in my best work but also provided rigorous training for my future endeavors in the world of academia. In addition to that, I have the aforementioned two as well as Linda Gerstein and Paul Smith to thank for inspiring my decision to be a history major in the first place.

I am also very grateful for the emotional support that my family and friends gave me over the course of writing this thesis. To my family, I love y'all for your unconditional support. To friends from my first-year hall (Ari Benkov, Rob Borek, Alison Champagne, Brooke Garbarini, Jackson Jin, Kaitlin Murphy, Pamela Pabon, Dan Van Beveren, Yuchao Wang, and Matt Yacavone), I thank you for all the fun times we had together. To Lloyd upper 60s & co. (Juliana Benitez, Ashley Boyette, John Burgess, Sarah Curtis, Matt Leibold, Claire Mao, Ben Paul, Carolin Schmidt, and Rory Seymour), I am very grateful for our lunchtime hangouts as well as the weekly zoom calls/movie nights that are keeping me sane through quarantine. To Saket Sekhsaria, I appreciate all the times we spent talking about and watching the insanity known as pro-wrestling. To the good folks I met during my stint at LSE (Phil Esterov, Jirka Schmalfuß, and Georgiy Stepanyan), *Vielen Dank* for always providing me with endless sources of entertainment. Finally, to Haverford/LSE Cricket (everyone that I ever played with, and special shout-outs to our coach Kamran Khan as well as Nicky Miranda and Taylor Weiss who I had the pleasure working with this year for S&C), thanks for an amazing four years and inspiring me to strive for excellence in both academics and athletics.

INTRODUCTION

A slice of day-old bread is soaked in a mixture of milk, honey, and spices, dipped in an egg batter, and fried in olive oil until golden-brown and crispy; such is the process of making a *torrija*, a decadent Spanish dessert that has been celebrated nationwide for several centuries, with the word “*torrija*” first appearing in the work of renowned poet and playwright Juan del Encina in 1496.¹ Some Spaniards also value *torrijas* for their symbolic value, as they are traditionally consumed during the week of Easter—hence the alternate name for the dish, *torrijas de la Semana Santa*—due to the process of revitalizing pieces of stale bread resembling the death and rebirth of Christ.² To some extent, *torrijas* can be seen as the archetype of Spanish cuisine, as they are beloved throughout Spain and rife with Catholic symbolism, thus exemplifying and materializing certain ideas and values that people normally associate with Spain. What is ironic, however, is that *torrijas* likely derived from a source whose influence the Spaniards so desperately tried to repress and even eradicate as the Iberian Peninsula became united under a single polity and its inhabitants began to philosophize about what “Spain” and being “Spanish” meant: Al-Andalus—or Muslim Iberia.³

In fact, Iberian Muslim contributions to the food culture of Spain simply cannot be understated. Throughout the years during which Islamic Caliphates ruled over the southern half of the Iberian Peninsula and even after the Christian reunification of the Peninsula under the forces of Ferdinand of Aragon and Isabel of Castile, the culinary legacy of Muslims left a lasting imprint in the area. On one hand, Spanish food culture readily adopted Muslim influences, using various crops and spices introduced by Muslims as key ingredients in many foods that came to be known as Spanish

¹ Ana Vega, “De dónde vienen las torrijas,” last modified April 12, 2017, El Comidista,

https://elcomidista.elpais.com/elcomidista/2017/04/05/articulo/1491420251_030252.html

² Esteban Fernández, quoted in “El árbol genealógico de las torrijas,” last modified April 16, 2014, Desconecta,

<https://www.europapress.es/desconecta/curiosity/noticia-arbol-genealogico-torrijas-20140416121942.html>

³ “El árbol genealógico,” <https://www.europapress.es/desconecta/curiosity/noticia-arbol-genealogico-torrijas-20140416121942.html>

dishes, such as almonds, coriander, cinnamon, rice, and saffron.⁴ The use of almonds and almond milk in particular revolutionized Spanish cuisine during the early modern period, with many cookbooks of the time listing dishes that use the two either as a thickener that emulsifies savory items such as soups and sauces or as part of a dessert.⁵ On the other hand, the same forces behind the banishment and persecution of Iberian Muslims impacted Spanish food culture in an attempt to distance Spanish national cuisine from the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus. The practice of hanging ham legs that is still very common to this day originates from the early modern period during which Christians, *conversos* (Jewish converts to Christianity), and *moriscos* (Muslim converts to Christianity)—including those who were nominally converts but continued to be practicing Jews or Muslims in secret—participated in “public displays of pork eating” so as not to be subject to the Inquisition.⁶ As seen through this duality, Spaniards during the early modern period faced the task of incorporating Muslim influences into their national cuisine without explicitly recognizing them.

This thesis lies at the intersection of early modern Spanish intellectual discussions of national identity and nationhood—particularly those regarding Iberian Muslims—and the relationship between food and national identity. Through examining these two areas of inquiry in conjunction, this thesis seeks to contribute to the ongoing discourse in the fields of Spanish history and nationalism. By addressing the paradox presented by the visibility of Al-Andalusian influences in Spanish cookbooks in a time when systemic exclusion and repression of Iberian Muslims were the norm, the thesis comments on not only issues that pertain to the pluralistic cultural legacy of Spain, but also those that are apparent in larger academic fields such as Spanish historiography and the

⁴ Tor Eigeland, “The Cuisine of Al-Andalus,” *Aramco World* 40, no. 5 (1989): 28-35, <https://archive.aramcoworld.com/issue/198905/the.cuisine.of.al-andalus.htm>

⁵ Francisco Martinez Montañó, *Arte de Cocina, Pastelería, Vizcochería y Conservería* (Madrid: Luis Sanchez, 1611), 25-26.

⁶ Antonio Pita, “Spain decides to make up for its persecution of Jews — but won't do the same for Muslims,” last modified June 30, 2014, *The Week*, <https://theweek.com/articles/445777/spain-decides-make-persecution-jews-but-wont-same-muslims>

general study of nationalism. In answering this question, this thesis argues that the constructions of Spanish national identity through food was multifaceted. On one hand, the various implicit and explicit references to Al-Andalusian ingredients, dishes, and cooking styles in the cookbooks of early modern Spain suggest that nation building through food tended to be more appreciative of the Iberian Peninsula's Islamic heritage. On the other hand, discriminatory attitudes towards Spain's Muslim population, which stemmed from the belief that there was an "eternal Spaniard"⁷ that predated the arrival of Muslims in the Iberian Peninsula, often bled into how food culture manifested in early modern Spain.

The main argument of the study is that the constructions of Spanish national identity vis-à-vis the legacy of Al-Andalus through food was a series of complex, and often contradictory, interactions between prevailing social currents of the time and various elements of contemporaneous food culture. Granted, the authors of early modern Spanish cookbooks were not hesitant to incorporate ingredients with strong Islamic connotations in their recipes or list dishes that have clear Islamic origins as they seemingly prioritized good taste over sociopolitical tensions. However, the incorporation of Al-Andalusian gastronomy into early modern Spanish cuisine was an extremely selective process, as seen by certain ingredients extensively used in Al-Andalusian kitchens remaining popular while others fell out of favor. Furthermore, discussions of national identity and nationhood that were largely antagonistic towards Iberian Muslims often infused social manifestations of food culture in early modern Spain.

In explaining this argument, this thesis will be divided into five sections. The first section explains the significance of using food culture as a tool to examine the construction of national

⁷ A term used by Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz to support his ideology that there was an essential Spanish race. See Brian A. Catlos, "Christian-Muslim-Jewish Relations, Medieval "Spain," and the Mediterranean: An Historiographical Op-Ed," in *In and Of the Mediterranean: Medieval and Early modern Iberian Studies*, ed. Michelle M. Hamilton and Núria Silleras-Fernández (Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press, 2015), 2.

identity. The second section focuses on the historical context of the study, tracing the emergence of Spain as a single united polity after the completion of the Reconquista (the Christian “reconquest” of the Iberian Peninsula from Islamic Caliphates).⁸ The third and fourth sections of the study are dedicated to elements of early modern Spanish food culture. The third will elaborate on the efforts of early modern Spaniards in framing their national cuisine. Here, the section will progress into the analysis of cookbooks, tracing the constructions of taste made by each author and how that fed into the formation of a national cuisine. The fourth section looks to expand on the discussion of constructing a national cuisine in early modern Spain by examining the process of incorporating elements of Al-Andalusian food culture into that of early modern Spain. This section will look at Al-Andalusian cookbooks and will posit them alongside their early modern Spanish counterparts to note parallels between the two in terms of ingredients, cooking methods, and dishes. The fifth and last section brings the previous sections together in a comprehensive analysis that summarizes the main argument of the study, which is that the constructions of Spanish national identity during the early modern period through food in relation to Iberian Muslim influences was neither fully tolerant nor fully intolerant, which is reminiscent of the modern consensus on the topic of *convivencia* (referring to the supposed peaceful coexistence between Christian, Muslim, and Jewish communities in medieval Iberia) in Iberian historiography. The thesis will finally be capped off by a conclusion that reiterates this complexity, as well as commenting on the larger topics that this thesis touches upon, namely the issues present in the historiography of Spain and Spanish nationalism as well as the need to redefine nationalism from its current, exclusionary state.

⁸ María Elena Martínez, *Genealogical Fictions: Limpieza de Sangre, Religion, and Gender in Colonial Mexico* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2008), 30.

FOOD AND NATIONAL IDENTITY

All humans have a biological need for sustenance, thus making food an essential component of life. Such a primacy often has lent to food and food culture—comprised of not just mere ingredients or dishes, but also the various institutions and practices that dictate food conventions such as how ingredients are prepared and under what circumstances particular dishes are served—taking up political significance. Examining this interdisciplinary notion through a scholarly lens (often labelled with the terms “food studies” and/or “culinary studies”) has been recently rising in popularity in academia, with numerous texts about issues regarding the intersection between food and sectors such as policy, public health, and the economy emerging over recent times. Yet due to this branch of scholarship still being fairly new, the extent of the impact that food has on numerous different sociopolitical functions and institutions has not been fully explored. The development of nationalism and national identity through food—more specifically by the definition of a national dish/cuisine—is one such understudied area of food studies to which this thesis seeks to make a contribution.

The argument that food has a significant impact on the development of nationalist sentiments derives from the understanding of the role that food plays in developing a sense of community. From family gatherings to celebratory feasts, there are many visible instances in which the consumption of food becomes a collective experience. The various elements that makes up such experiences—which can be anything, from family recipes handed down from generations to simple preferences in taste—in turn become the basis of collective identity with which a certain group of people can identify. For instance, the African American activist Amiri Baraka coined the term “soul food” to describe the traditional cookery of African Americans as a response to those claiming that

African Americans did not have a characteristic cuisine.⁹ The role of food in shaping collective identity becomes even more visible by examining the segregation of taste in different communities, such as availability of sweet tea being used to demarcate the American South, both culturally and geographically, from the rest of the country. In fact, the different ways in which similar, or even the same, dishes are prepared in different places are sometimes so standardized and ingrained within the cultural fabric of a specific locale that they are not just indicative of the region's food habits but are even synonymous with the region itself to the extent that it becomes common wisdom. A perfect example is the different styles of pizza within the United States, with cities such as New York and Chicago often identified by their distinct way of preparing the popular delicacy.

The process of designating a national dish, and by extension formulating a national cuisine, rests on this very premise of the centrality of food—more specifically common food habits and practices—in forming collective identity. From a top-down perspective, the development of a strong national identity is imperative to a nation state's sustainability as nationalism serves as “an integral aspect of politics, political economy, and international relations.”¹⁰ Therefore, the leadership of a nation state has the incentive to use dishes that are unique (or at least seen as being that way by the majority of the populace) and popular throughout the nation to evoke a sense of national pride among the masses as well as to guarantee political and economic stability. One such example is the Swiss Cheese Union's declaration of fondue as a national dish in the 1930s during an agricultural crisis.¹¹ The motives behind this move was twofold: (1) to stimulate the nation's stagnating economy

⁹ Frederick Douglass Opie, *Hog and Hominy: Soul Food from Africa to America* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2008), 133.

¹⁰ Atsuko Ichijo and Ronald Ranta, *Food, National Identity, and Nationalism: From Everyday to Global Politics* (Basingstoke, Hampshire, UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 1.

¹¹ Jakob Tanner, “The Arts of Cooking: Modern Times and the Dynamics of Tradition,” in *Changing Tastes: Food Culture and the Processes of Industrialization: Proceedings of the 14th Conference of the International Commission on Ethnological Food Research, Basel and Vevey, Switzerland, 30 September-6 October 2002*, ed. Patricia Lysaght and Christine Burckhardt-Seebass (Basel, Switzerland: Schweizerische Gesellschaft für Volkskunde, 2002), 24.

by cheese sales and (2) uniting the Swiss people under the sense of communality in food.¹² As a result of this decision, fondue and Swiss-produced cheeses such as Emmental and Gruyère continue to be seen as culinary symbols of Switzerland, promoting a sense of nationalism within as well as attracting considerable revenue from abroad through tourism and exports.

In addition to engendering a sense of national identity and creating political stability within the nation state, a well-defined national cuisine can greatly enhance a nation's social and cultural assets to the extent that it can be used as a diplomatic currency. Such a process is what is known as "gastrodiplomacy" or "culinary diplomacy," and academic works regarding this topic have slowly begun to take center stage in the literature of the field in food studies. Over the past couple of decades or so, the promotion of a national cuisine and consequent creation of a national brand as a method to solidify and/or improve a nation's diplomatic status has been used by middle powers such as Thailand, Taiwan, Peru, and South Korea.¹³ Thailand in particular has been seen as a pioneer of this movement and has experienced resounding success with its "Global Thai" initiative of opening Thai restaurants around the world contributing to a significant rise in global soft-power as well as an improvement in its national image.¹⁴ Aside from large-scale projects such as gastrodiplomacy, the national branding of food items like Canadian maple syrup or Turkish coffee is also another way that a nation's image is conveyed through their food.¹⁵

However, the expression of nationalism through food does not just manifest through state-driven initiatives of classifying certain dishes as a national dish or belonging to a national cuisine. In

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Tara Sonenshine, Paul Rockower, Sam Chapple-Sokol, and Gary Weaver, in *Culinary Diplomacy, Gastrodiplomacy, and Conflict Cuisine: Defining the Field* (Washington D.C.: Stimson Center, 2016), 10.

¹⁴ Tanja Strugar, "Eastern Gastrodiplomatic Efforts: Asian Nations as Pioneers in the Use of Cuisine in Cultural Diplomacy," in *Art of Food: Culture and Food Diversity, Gastrodiplomacy* (Barcelona, Spain: International Institute of Gastronomy, Culture, Arts, and Tourism, 2015), 30.

¹⁵ Ichijo and Ranta, *Food, National Identity, and Nationalism*, 6.

fact, the intricate relationship between food and national identity also emerges in equal importance to official means through more subtle, everyday forms of nationalism—or banal nationalism. Even a simple “promotion of food items as authentic and part of a particular cuisine” greatly impacts the way in which people think about their respective national identities.¹⁶ With people having the cultural significance of the food they eat in mind, expressions of national identity can almost subconsciously manifest through “commonplace [food-related] activities...such as cooking, eating, and drinking.”¹⁷ Thus food transcends its basic function of fulfilling the need for sustenance and becomes a medium through which people view themselves as part of a nation. This thought is perhaps best represented through recent mass movements such as the 2011 “Pita riots” in Egypt and the “Tortilla riots” in Mexico.¹⁸ Both events were carried out in protest of the price hike of each nation’s respective staple food, alluding to the centrality of pita bread to the Egyptian national ethos and tortillas to that of Mexico.¹⁹

One crucial premise of this thesis is that food played a significant role in the formation of pre-modern manifestations of nationalism and national identity, in addition to the importance of food in the expression of national identity within the context of the modern nation state. Conceptualizing and developing a communalist sentiment such as nationalism often hinges on emphasizing commonalities that exist within a particular community and is facilitated by differentiating those shared properties with that of the “other.” In many instances, cultural elements such as language, dress, and food are often pointed out as examples of such commonalities due to their visibility and tangibility in society. In other words, the everyday use of such cultural elements makes it easier for people to identify commonalities within the community and differences with

¹⁶ Ibid., 2.

¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ Ibid., 2-3.

¹⁹ Ibid.

other communities. One great example from history would be how early Muslims in Arabia distinguished themselves from Jewish tribes that co-inhabited the region. While the religious divide certainly played a role, the various parallels in doctrine and practices due to both of them being Abrahamic religions made Arabians look to cultural elements—such as language and dress—for two crucial reasons: (1) establishing a concrete identity for themselves and (2) differentiating themselves from the Jews.²⁰

This thesis' focus on food and national identity is especially important in the context of early modern Spain. Other cultural elements like language and religion proved far more durable in terms of demarcating difference. Language is an especially difficult tool for analyzing emerging nationalist sentiments in the Iberian Peninsula following the completion of the Reconquista due to the existence of culturally autonomous kingdoms and provinces that retained their own, non-Castilian and even non-Latinate origin languages, such as Catalonia, the Basque speaking, and even Portuguese speaking regions, where linguistic differences retain political vibrancy into the present. Religious differences were either forcefully expelled or erased, or perhaps partially absorbed in the uneven practices of daily life until gradually disappearing over time by the end of the early modern period. In this milieu, food often became the most useful cross-cultural bridge in the formation of modern Spanish nationalism.

²⁰ *A History of Jewish-Muslim Relations, From Their Origins to the Present Day*, ed. Abdelwahab Meddeb and Benjamin Stora (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2013), 653-675, 676-682, 891-927.

CONCEPTUALIZING “SPAIN” AND “SPANISHNESS” VIS-À-VIS THE LEGACY OF AL-ANDALUS

To this day, the notion of a single Spanish nation continues to be a hotbed of impassioned debates. Some fervently believe that Spain is a completely unified nation while others—namely Basque and Catalan separatists—maintain that Spain is merely a term used to address a haphazard collective of autonomous communities that are culturally and politically disparate. The same discussions have been present throughout the history of Spain. Nascent conceptualizations of “Spain” as a single polity began to emerge in the marquee year of 1492, when the two most momentous events in the history of the Iberian Peninsula occurred: (1) the completion of the Reconquista with the Emirate of Granada surrendering to the united forces of Christian monarchs Isabel of Castile and Ferdinand of Aragon and (2) the start of Castile’s conquest of the Americas and the Philippines, subsequently leading to the rise of the Spanish Empire. Prior to such changes as well as the fateful marriage between Isabel and Ferdinand, the Iberian Peninsula was comprised of “a number of competing independent kingdoms,”²¹ both Christian and Muslim. On the Muslim side, there was the Nasrid Dynasty in southern Spain that governed the city of Granada. On the Christian side, there were the domains of Castile and Aragon. The Crown of Castile, then the most powerful domain in Spain “in terms of size, population, and economic resources,” was a coalition of “the old kingdoms of Galicia, Leon, Asturias, Cantabria, Old and New Castile, Extremadura, Murcia, the so-called Basque provinces, and all of Andalusia with the exception of Granada” that had formed prior to 1450.²² The Crown of Aragon consisted of what roughly corresponds to modern day Catalonia,

²¹ Antonio Feros, *Speaking of Spain: The Evolution of Race and Nation in the Hispanic World* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2017), 16.

²² *Ibid.*

the Balearic Islands, Valencia, Sicily, and Naples.²³ Other smaller kingdoms that also existed during this period were Portugal and Navarre.²⁴

Defining a “Spanish” Nation and a “Spaniard”

With the marriage of Isabel and Ferdinand in October 1469, the two most powerful Christian crowns were able to establish peace with one another as well as the kingdom of Portugal.²⁵ The union also spearheaded territorial conquests and subsequent unification of the Iberian Peninsula. Particularly important was the fall of Granada in 1492 as the collapse of the last remaining Muslim polity in the Peninsula gave rise to a semblance of a nation state, governed by a single sovereign entity (the joint rulers Isabel and Ferdinand) and under a single religion, which was one of the defining cultural elements that make up national identity and nationhood—especially in a time before the modern-day trend of political secularization. In fact, the monarchy specifically desired for a single Spanish kingdom, with the most apparent indicator being Isabel and Ferdinand renouncing their individual titles as the queen of Castile and the king of Aragon respectively, instead opting to become the joint monarchs of the Kingdom of Spain.²⁶ With such a goal in mind, the newly coined Spanish monarchy would strive to prevent the dissolution of this nascent “Spain” into independent kingdoms that had existed before the completion of the Reconquista.

As a consequence, the initial qualifications of being considered as a “Spaniard” were being a loyal subject to the ruler of the Kingdom of Spain and being a devout Christian. Once political loyalty and religious uniformity began to take hold in the Iberian Peninsula, the constituents of the Kingdom of Spain began to look for other indicators that would further clarify the national identity

²³ Ibid.

²⁴ Ibid., 16-17.

²⁵ Ibid., 12, 17.

²⁶ Ibid., 18.

of “Spain” as well as “Spanishness.” Self-definition through labelling outsiders was one practice that aided such an initiative.²⁷ The fact that people from the likes of France and Italy could be clearly defined as foreigners in that they were culturally and ancestrally disparate from the inhabitants of the Iberian Peninsula greatly facilitated the development of a common Spanish identity through a combination of *jus sanguinis* and *jus solis*.²⁸ The former meant that a continued descent from Spanish ancestors became an indicator for “Spanishness”, and the latter meant that a “Spaniard” had to be born within territories that were considered to be part of the Kingdom of Spain.

Conceptualizing a single “Spain” also necessitated the official establishment of a Spanish nation. However, this presented complications due to the pluralistic dynamic of different regions in the Iberian Peninsula. This was especially the case as the monarchy sought to appropriate the term *patria*, which primarily signified the region of one’s birth, as a synonym of the singular “Spain.”²⁹ But as the Spanish monarchy was based in the most powerful domain in Castile, it had a strong sense of its own regional identity.³⁰ This in turn clashed with strong currents of regionalism that still persisted in other kingdoms, particularly those that had a well-established tradition of political and cultural autonomy such as Catalonia and Portugal.³¹ Therefore, a *patria* that was quintessentially Spanish did not exist in the 16th and 17th centuries. Granted, Castile’s preeminence and association with the royal family elevated the domain as the de facto *patria* of the Kingdom of Spain, but whether that can be seen as a Spanish nation state or a mere imposition of Castilian hegemony in the Iberian Peninsula remains debatable. Furthermore, there was a juridical roadblock to the undisputed formation of a Spanish nation state in that an individual pledging their allegiance to the monarchs of Spain legally could not be considered a Spanish citizen due to local legal systems being a sovereign right of each

²⁷ Ibid., 19.

²⁸ Ibid., 25.

²⁹ Ibid., 22-23.

³⁰ Ibid., 29.

³¹ Ibid., 27.

kingdom.³² In other words, the individual's legal citizenry would be defined by their local *patria*, meaning one could be, for instance, a Catalanian, Asturian, or Leonese but never Spanish by law.

But despite the absence of a true Spanish nation state in the 16th and 17th centuries—or perhaps because of it, thoughts on a quintessential “Spaniard” from a demographic perspective were rather prevalent in intellectual discourse throughout the period. The primary point of discussion amongst Spanish intellectuals was the notion of race, or *raza*, but its 16th and 17th century connotations meant that the word was used as “an indication of ‘quality’” pertaining to lineage—specifically from Old Christians.³³ The Spaniards, in their construction of their demographic history, heavily emphasized the nativity and purity of “real Spaniards” compared to those who were not. Partly, this was in response to the European “tendency to view Spaniards as a mixed people,” as many different ethnic groups had come to and gone away from the Iberian Peninsula over time.³⁴ The Spanish response also echoes a larger European phenomenon during the same era, in which the increasing awareness of human diversity challenging the pan-European belief of monogenesis prompted Europeans to come up with explanations behind such differences.³⁵

In addition to this responsive quality, the fixation on a pure Spanish *raza* likely stemmed from the very process of territorial unification that gave rise to thoughts about “Spain” and “Spanishness.” The unstable political condition created by the division of the Iberian Peninsula into numerous competing kingdoms during the medieval period brought about a dynamic wherein peace and tolerance between interfaith, and consequently interracial, communities coexisted with periodic repressions.³⁶ This was especially the case when Christian and Muslim rulers were dealing with the

³² Ibid., 26.

³³ Ibid., 49.

³⁴ Ibid., 50.

³⁵ Ibid., 51-53.

³⁶ Alex Novikoff, “Between Tolerance and Intolerance in Medieval Spain: A Historiographic Enigma,” *Medieval Encounters* 11, no. 1-2 (2005): 7-9.

Jewish population, as a relentless and systematic wave of persecution would have dramatically increased the likelihood of the Jews joining forces with one group against whomever was the oppressor. However, once the two most powerful polities of Castile and Aragon joined forces in marriage and put most of the Iberian Peninsula under their sphere of control, the need to tolerate religious and ethnic minorities was gone. Thus, Spaniards that undoubtedly descended from a pure line of Old Christians (i.e. non-converts) were deemed to be pure and consequently privileged over those whose *raza* from Old Christians was less apparent.³⁷

Many 16th and 17th century Spanish authors supported this singular demographic origin of Spaniards, drawing on various lines of argumentation to prove that real Spaniards were of a pure *raza*. One area that these authors and intellectuals looked into was history, with some even going as far back as the first century by citing the work of Josephus, and more certainly looking at the sixth century historian Isidore of Seville.³⁸ The prevailing narrative constructed with such sources was that the Spaniards had descended from Tubal, the grandson of Noah.³⁹ The biblical reference certainly provided Spaniards with a much needed sense of antiquity and legitimacy that they could use as a sign of superiority over the people of other European nations.⁴⁰ Regarding the influx of other peoples into the Peninsula, including but not limited to the Romans, Celts, Carthaginians, and Phoenicians, many proponents of the pure Spaniard narrative downplayed the prevalence and significance of mixing amongst native Spaniards and non-native groups, claiming that the mingling between the two did not alter the fundamental characteristics of a pure Spaniard.⁴¹ As for mixing with the Jews and Muslims that had inhabited the Peninsula for a significant amount of time, many Spaniards cited medieval laws that prohibited marriage and sexual relations between Christians and

³⁷ Feros, *Speaking of Spain*, 51.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 57.

³⁹ *Ibid.*

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 58.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, 59.

non-Christians as proof of their purity.⁴² This was especially apparent through the notion of blood purity (*limpieza de sangre*)⁴³ that served as the criteria for being a Spaniard and particularly for being a member of the elite, as well as the foundation for social honor and privilege.⁴⁴

The Question of Iberian Muslims

Aside from more fundamental questions regarding notions such as “Spain,” “Spanishness,” and *patria*, the presence of Muslims and Muslim converts to Christianity (known as Moriscos) in the Iberian Peninsula posed an additional challenge to 16th and 17th century Spanish intellectuals who were conceptualizing national identity and nationhood. What made the situation more complex was that the situation of Iberian Muslims and Moriscos was constantly in flux after 1492 and all the way up to 1609, when the crown issued a royal edict that decreed the expulsion of all Moriscos from the Kingdom of Spain. Since the 13th century onward, Granada was the last remaining territory of Al-Andalus and a significant number of Iberian Muslims, or *mudéjares*, lived under Christian rule.⁴⁵ These communities differed in terms of the level of integration and the freedoms they enjoyed, with some gradually losing their language and religious customs while others held steadfast to them.⁴⁶ The Nasrid Dynasty capitulating to Isabel and Ferdinand in 1492 also did not lead to the immediate expulsion of *mudéjares*, unlike the Jews. In fact, the monarchs of the Kingdom of Spain granted them the right to practice their religion without any legal repercussions.

However, the semblance of tolerance by Isabel and Ferdinand faded away with the onset of the 16th century, as many Spanish elites, in their quest for religious uniformity around the Iberian

⁴² Ibid., 61.

⁴³ *Limpieza de Sangre* was first used against *conversos* (Jewish converts to Christianity), defining “blood purity as the absence of Jewish and heretical antecedents.” See María Elena Martínez, *Genealogical Fictions*, 1.

⁴⁴ Feros, *Speaking of Spain*, 61.

⁴⁵ Ibid., 92.

⁴⁶ Ibid., 92-93.

Peninsula, clamored for the conversion of *mudéjares*.⁴⁷ This desire for conversion became increasingly apparent in the recently conquered Granada. While some such as Archbishop Hernando de Talavera sought to reconcile with the new converts by allowing them to perform their traditional dances at Mass, others such as Cardinal Francisco Jiménez de Cisneros launched a more belligerent effort at conversion, conducting mass baptisms and threatening to persecute those who refused to convert.⁴⁸ In addition, various sanctions against the *mudéjares* from the prohibition of carrying arms to buying land accompanied the aggressive campaign of Christianization in Granada.⁴⁹ Such practices, which the *mudéjares* considered to be a violation of the capitulation treaty that the last Nasrid ruler had signed when he surrendered to Isabel and Ferdinand, ultimately culminated in the first Rebellion of the Alpujarras (1499-1501).⁵⁰

The uprising of *mudéjares* in Granada did not better their situation, however, as the event prompted the Spanish crown to respond with a heavy hand, issuing various initiatives that mandated the conversion of all Muslims in the Iberian Peninsula—with those refusing facing expulsion. By 1502, the first decree that required conversions appeared in Castile, soon followed by an order in 1525 in Aragon.⁵¹ Still, the situation for Iberian Muslims was not as bad as that of the Jews for the time being, as they were exempt from bearing the full brunt of the Spanish Inquisition until the mid-16th century.⁵² For instance, the Muslim community in Granada was able to buy certain privileges such as the right to use their traditional garb and speak Arabic from Charles I in 1527, with the royal grant lasting for a period of forty years.⁵³ Despite the momentary inclusion of the now-

⁴⁷ Ibid., 94.

⁴⁸ Karoline P. Cook, *Forbidden Passages: Muslims and Moriscos in Colonial Spanish America* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016), 13-14.

⁴⁹ Ibid., 14.

⁵⁰ Ibid.

⁵¹ Feros, *Speaking of Spain*, 94.

⁵² Ibid., 95.

⁵³ Ibid.

Morisco/New Christian communities into Spain, debates still raged on about whether these New Christians could coexist alongside the aforementioned pure Spaniards that had existed since antiquity.⁵⁴

There were various anxieties about such “new converts” that particularly plagued Old Christians. One such worry was the possibility of Moriscos being Crypto-Muslims or, in other words, converts that officially claimed to be Christian and adhered to Christian practices in public but continued to practice Islam in the private sphere. Another potential concern was that many Moriscos were indistinguishable from Spaniards in terms of complexion.⁵⁵ In fact, Antonio Feros cites Inquisitor Martín García, who wrote that the Moriscos “are Spaniards, not Armenians, or Africans.”⁵⁶ These anxieties seemingly reflect the desire of many Spaniards to designate the quintessential Spaniard as an Old Christian that has certain characteristic traits, both physical and mental, and various potential modifications to such a definition that would have been necessary with the Morisco community’s potential integration into Spanish society.

Yet there is a need to point out that Spanish society did not recognize all Moriscos as equals. Spaniards saw Moriscos that had ancestors that were noblemen as people that had links with a group that continually inhabited the Peninsula for an elongated period of time, with their status being officially legitimized once they had converted into Christianity.⁵⁷ For instance, there was Don Juan de Granada Venegas, who represents the case of members of the noble family in Granada who had converted to Christianity and chose to remain in Spanish society, thereby receiving land grants and official titles.⁵⁸ Juan de Granada Venegas played a significant role in Spanish politics as well,

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Ibid., 97.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ Ibid., 99.

⁵⁸ Ibid., 98.

becoming a member of the Valladolid city council and later the governor of Galicia.⁵⁹ His descendant Pedro de Granada Venegas, who by lineage would have been seen as a Spaniard with Morisco ancestry, rose to the elite as a successful military commander and an intellectual whose personal library shows his complete integration into the upper echelon of Spanish society.⁶⁰

However, aside from the older and younger de Granada Venegas and a few that were involved with the universities or medicine, Moriscos that were integrated into Spanish society were a very small minority. For the most part, non-noble Moriscos were seen and represented as nothing more than unintelligent degenerates who lacked a sense of honor, virtue, and civic duty.⁶¹ The suspicion of Moriscos being Crypto-Muslims and consequently disloyal to the Spanish king as well as being secret conspirators of foreign Muslim powers—particularly the Ottoman Empire—did not help resolve the negative and hostile attitude of many Spaniards towards Moriscos. Furthermore, the Moriscos were still prevalent throughout the Iberian Peninsula unlike the Jews, with all those who resisted conversion already having been expelled in 1492,⁶² furthering the distrust against the converts. Many Moriscos also continued to have connections with Islamic communities abroad, which cast their desire to fully assimilate as Christian converts into severe doubt.⁶³

The crown was well-aware of what was going on with the Moriscos and actively pulled back on previous liberties that had been granted to the Morisco community while increasingly deploying strict assimilation strategies, which in turn resulted in backlash and ultimately a series of revolts that would lead to the eventual expulsion of Moriscos in the early 17th century. Phillip II, the son of Charles I, officially overturned the agreement his father had with the Morisco community of

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ Ibid., 99.

⁶² Ibid., 81.

⁶³ Ibid., 101.

Granada in an attempt “to de-Islamicize and hispanize” them.⁶⁴ The monarch’s attempt to root out all elements of Moorish culture from the Morisco community resulted in petitions that argued that Spain was a pluralistic nation and that customs that are perceived to be Islamic in origin are no less Spanish than Old Christian ones.⁶⁵ Such petitions was not able to change the attitude of the King, and resulted in the ill-fated War of the Alpujarras (1568-1570; also referred to as the second revolt of the Alpujarras).⁶⁶ The war had both immediate and long-lasting consequences for the Morisco community. As for the former, the Spanish monarchy resettled the Morisco community of Granada throughout territories of the crown of Castile.⁶⁷ As for the latter, this was enough of a justification for Spanish elites to conclude that they could not be fully integrated into Spain due to their lack of and resistance to traits exemplifying “Spanishness,” which in turn resulted in Philip III’s ordering of the expulsion of Moriscos from the Iberian Peninsula that were carried out from 1609 to 1614.⁶⁸

The development of proto-nationalistic and anti-Muslim sentiments during the early modern period in the Iberian Peninsula impacted the region’s gastronomy in notable ways. For one, the standardization of food practices and habits through cooking manuals and cookbooks mirrored intellectual discussions that began to conceptualize notions of “Spain” and “Spanishness” and determined which cultural elements present in the Iberian Peninsula at the time demonstrated such qualities. In fact, some early modern Iberian cooks expressed their opinions through their texts as to which foodstuff could be characterized as “Spanish.” Also having a crucial role in this process was the audience of these cookbooks and cooking manuals that either voiced what Spanish cooking should be or simply circulated in the Iberian Peninsula during the early modern period, as their

⁶⁴ Ibid.

⁶⁵ Ibid., 101-102.

⁶⁶ Ibid., 102.

⁶⁷ Ibid., 103.

⁶⁸ Ibid., 107.

acceptance of a particular text—often indicated by the number of publications/editions—signified their agreement with the text’s author in which food practices and dishes were “Spanish.”

As for the gradually increasing suppression of Muslims and Moriscos in early modern Iberia, the extensive legacy of Al-Andalusian food culture in the region made the complete segregation of food practices and taste extremely difficult. This was especially the case compared to other cultural elements such as Arabic language and dress, which instantly differentiated Muslims and Moriscos from early modern Iberians descending from an Old Christian lineage. However, the long history of coexisting communities in the Peninsula meant that tastes and culinary habits among Christians, Muslims, and Jews alike had become so intertwined over time, as evidenced by the prevalence of shared ingredients, dishes, and methods of preparation in the food culture of said communities.⁶⁹ Granted, certain practices, most notably the incorporation of pork in Christian diets, served as demarcating lines that culinarily segregated Old Christian Iberians from their Morisco counterparts.⁷⁰ Yet on the other hand, even products with strong Muslim connotations such as eggplants and rice were commonly consumed by early modern Christian Iberians.⁷¹ Thus, from the perspective of creating a national cuisine, incorporating Al-Andalusian food culture posed a challenge considering the simultaneous repression and subsequent expulsion of Muslims and Moriscos from the Iberian Peninsula. In the following sections, this thesis explores the intricacies of this process, looking at culinary texts to observe how early modern Spaniards negotiated syncretic tastes with political developments.

⁶⁹ Due to this thesis’ focus on Al-Andalusian/Muslim influences in early modern Iberian food culture, Jewish contributions will not be explored to such a great extent. But since a comprehensive analysis of early modern Iberian food history would be incomplete without it, I look to address it meticulously with a future work.

⁷⁰ Carolyn A. Nadeau, *Food Matters: Alonso Quijano’s Diet and the Discourse of Food in Early Modern Spain* (Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press, 2016), 11.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*, 126-129, 132-137.

COOKBOOKS IN EARLY MODERN IBERIA AND THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NATIONAL CUISINE

Presenting a complete account of early modern Iberian food culture that encompasses all the aspects addressed in the previous section is a challenging task. However, close readings of cooking manuscripts and cookbooks that were produced during this time provide a significant, albeit partial, understanding of the discourse regarding food in early modern Iberia. For one, such printed material, through presenting a collection of recipes and—more often than not—an accompanying prologue, traces the various food habits and practices that were formulated during this time. In addition, the value statements that are present throughout the text—ranging from the most basic of things such as the use of descriptive adjectives or adverbs to the emphasis on particular ingredients or methods of preparation—often intimate popular constructions of taste. But the most important function of these cookbooks in the context of this thesis, which concerns the rise of Spanish proto-nationalist sentiments contemporaneous to the aforementioned cookbooks, is that such texts have a particular implication on the formation of Spanish national identity. More specifically, the narrative voices present in cookbooks published during this period did not merely enumerate dishes that were being consumed by early modern Iberians but exercised their agency, both directly and indirectly, in shaping a distinct “Spanish” cuisine.

While cookbooks during the early modern period were elitist in nature due to their authors often occupying a prominent social position as royal or noble cooks,⁷² the formation of a “Spanish” national cuisine was far from a top-down and linear process in which cookbook authors were the sole decision makers. Rather, the construction of a gastronomic identity that was distinctly “Spanish” was far more dialogical, requiring the recognition of not just other individuals involved in

⁷² Ibid., 4.

the culinary sphere, but also the literary elite of the Iberian Peninsula that often were the intended audience for cookbooks. In other words, while this audience accepted some cookbooks and attributed a sense of primacy to them as exemplifications of “Spanishness” from a culinary perspective, they rejected others for lacking the same qualities. And while extant primary material that specifically concerns the opinions of elites on such matters is extremely limited, publication records of cookbooks—particularly during the early modern period, during which printing became systemized and more accessible due to Gutenberg’s invention of the movable type in the mid-15th century—can attest to the popularity of certain texts over others. For instance, Mestre Ruperto’s *Libre de coch* and Francisco Martínez Montañó’s *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* enjoyed prominence in the 16th and 17th centuries in the Iberian Peninsula while Diego Granado’s *Libro del arte de cozina*, a voluminous account that does a remarkable job in showcasing various modern cooking techniques and culinary influences from all across Europe to a Spanish audience, did not enjoy the same success.⁷³ This section of the thesis examines this selectivity in the formation of a “Spanish” national cuisine through a careful analysis of a selection of cookbooks published in early modern Iberia.

Libre de coch (Mestre Ruperto)

The first cookbook printed in the Iberian Peninsula after the completion of the Reconquista was *Libre de coch* written by Catalan cook Mestre Ruperto (also known by his Castilian Spanish name Roberto de Nola), with the first extant edition of the text dating back to 1520.⁷⁴ There is not a lot of detail on the life of Mestre Ruperto, except for the fact that he was Catalan and served as a royal cook for Ferdinand I of Naples, the ruler of Naples from 1458 to 1494.⁷⁵ In terms of content, the

⁷³ Ibid., 23.

⁷⁴ Ibid.

⁷⁵ Ibid.

book “contains chapters on ten different kitchen and dining room positions, on cutting meat and serving food, on medical advice, and 243 recipes for soups, stews, baked, boiled, and simmered dishes, and sauces” alongside a section on food to be consumed during Lent and for the sick.⁷⁶ Throughout the text, Mestre Ruperto also demonstrates “a consciousness of the cook’s social standing” and consistently emphasizes the pride and humility that is required in his line of work. Such a consciousness is perfectly summarized in the following sentence:⁷⁷

Puesto que haya otros mayores oficiales en mi oficio que yo...ninguo, por experiencia...sabr  los apetitos y viandas y guisados que son m s agradables al gusto de vuestra voluntad como yo (There might be other officials in my field with higher ranking than myself...but nobody, by way of experience...knows the appetite, food, and dishes that are in accord with your liking like I do).⁷⁸

By attesting to his credentials, Mestre Ruperto gives a strong incentive for his audience to use *Libre de coch* as a prototype, with cooks following his instructions given in the book and cookbook authors taking inspiration from the layout and content of the book.

Libre de coch’s significance can also be seen through the number of re-publications in the Iberian Peninsula throughout the early modern period. First published in Mestre Ruperto’s native language of Catalan, *Libre de coch*’s Castilian Spanish translation came into circulation in 1525. This translated version was published eleven times in a span of less than fifty years,⁷⁹ demonstrating *Libre de coch*’s eminence in the culinary sphere of the Iberian Peninsula, with the text being cast as a prototype for cooks as well as later generations of cookbook authors. Furthermore, as Carolyn Nadeau’s assertion in *Food Matters: Alonso Quijano’s Diet and the Discourse of Food in Early Modern Spain*

⁷⁶ Ibid.

⁷⁷ Ibid., 25.

⁷⁸ Mestre Ruperto/Roberto de Nola, *Libre del coch/Libro de guisados* (1520; repr. Madrid: Compa a Ibero-Americana de Publicaciones, 1929), 231.

⁷⁹ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 23.

points out, Mestre Ruperto's cookbook was the first of its kind to display "modern" qualities that distinguished the work from its medieval counterparts.⁸⁰ There are various bits of textual evidence in *Libre de Coch* that attest to Nadeau's claim, with two notable instances being Mestre Ruperto stressing "the valued position of the cook and that cooking is a culinary art" as well as two dishes that are described with the adjective "*moderno* (modern)"—hinting at the evolution of cooking methods from previous times.⁸¹ The modern quality of *Libre de Coch* is further accentuated with its incorporation of regional and international culinary influences and styles, thereby "aid[ing] in the development of a distinct national style."⁸² Coupled with the emerging discourse of "Spain," "Spanishness," and the notion of *patria* during the same period, the association of a particular dish or ingredient to a location would have likely contributed to nascent discussions of defining a "Spanish" national cuisine.

Another notable aspect of *Libre de Coch*, and one that is also crucial in the context of this thesis, is in Mestre Ruperto's recognition of the role that Moorish food culture had in the formation of gastronomy in the Iberian Peninsula. For instance, there are two dishes that are described with the phrase *a la morisca* (Morisco-style): *Berenjenas a la morisca* (Morisco-style eggplants) and *Calabazas a la morisca* (Morisco-style calabash).⁸³ The notable commonality between these two dishes is the inclusion of ground spices that are characteristic of the cuisine of Al-Andalus such as cumin and coriander. *Salsa Granada* (Granada sauce) is also a dish that references the culinary heritage of Al-Andalus, due to Islamic polities having occupied the city of Granada for a lengthy time as well as the inclusion of orange juice as one of its ingredients.⁸⁴ The version included in *Libre de Coch* is particularly notable in that it removed all mentions of *tocino*, which are salt-cured cubes of pork belly

⁸⁰ Ibid., 26.

⁸¹ Ibid.

⁸² Ibid.

⁸³ Mestre Ruperto, *Libre de Coch*, 285-287.

⁸⁴ Ibid., 313.

akin to bacon, that was present in an iteration of the dish that had previously appeared in *Libre de Sent Soví*, a 14th century Catalan cooking manual written by an anonymous author. Such an omission suggests that this was a conscious decision on part of Mestre Ruperto as a recognition of the fact that pork and pork products are considered *haram*—or forbidden by Islamic law.⁸⁵ The recognition of Castilian Spanish’s linguistic derivation from Arabic also appears in the text, with *almojávanas*, a word used in *Toronjas de Xativa que son almojávanas*⁸⁶ (Xativa grapefruits which are cheese fritters),⁸⁷ deriving from the Hispano-Arabic word *almugabbana* (made of cheese), which in turn comes from the Arabic word *gubn* (cheese).⁸⁸

Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería (Francisco Martínez Montañó)

If *Libre del coch* was the first early modern cookbook published in the Iberian Peninsula to enjoy prominence, Francisco Martínez Montañó’s *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería*, published in 1611, is the text that had the most prominence throughout the early modern period out of all cookbooks published in the Iberian Peninsula during this time. In fact, the primacy held by *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* was apparent by the fact that it continued to be “the most published Spanish cookbook before the twentieth century, with over twenty-five editions.”⁸⁹ Content-wise, the book is separated into two chapters, with the first discussing cleanliness in the kitchen and the standard for banquets and the second being a collection of the 448 recipes the author had compiled.⁹⁰ A notable feature of Montañó’s cookbook is the presence of personal commentary. For instance, Montañó shows an intense dislike of turnips, even going as far as to say:

⁸⁵ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 27.

⁸⁶ Describing these cheese fritters as “grapefruits” was likely a visual metaphor used by Mestre Ruperto to refer to the fritters being shaped like a sphere.

⁸⁷ Mestre Ruperto, *Libre de Coch*, 323.

⁸⁸ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 27.

⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, 33.

⁹⁰ *Ibid.*

“*soy muy enemigo de ellos, porque en qualquier platillo donde cayere algun caldo de navos se hecha á perder* (I am their enemy because any dish with turnip broth is a waste).”⁹¹

What is important in the context of this thesis, however, is that Montañó’s cookbook seems to be the first work that directly voiced what Spanish cooking should be. The most notable indicator of Montañó’s intent to contribute to a Spanish national cuisine appears in his concluding statement to the book, in which he remarks that every recipe that he included is “*al uso Español* (typically Spanish).”⁹² By referring to all of the dishes included in his book as “Spanish,” Montañó attributed a quality of “Spanishness” to the regional dishes and products throughout the Iberian Peninsula mentioned in his text. In addition, the fact that the publication of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* was contemporary to the publication of Spain’s first monolingual vernacular dictionary, *Tesoro de la Lengua Castellana o Española* by Sebastián de Covarrubias, strongly suggests that early modern Spaniards considered the cookbook to be a quintessential work to the development of their national cuisine. In fact, a close analysis of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería*’s prologue implies that Montañó himself was also intent on establishing his book as the eminent culinary text of his time, which can be inferred through Montañó’s stated goal and qualifications for writing the text.

Montañó stating that his intent in writing *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* is to create an authoritative guide for his contemporaries to follow clearly communicates his desire to express his agency in shaping Spanish gastronomy. The prologue of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* starts with Montañó lamenting that there have been no texts that can be used by those serving in *el Oficio de la Cocina* (the office of the kitchen)—presumably referring to aristocratic cooks—and everything had to be done by memory.⁹³ Through this statement, Montañó emphasizes

⁹¹ Francisco Martínez Montañó, *Arte de Cocina, Pastelería, Vizcochería y Conservería* (Madrid: Luis Sanchez, 1611), 234.

⁹² *Ibid.*, 462.

⁹³ Francisco Martínez Montañó, Prologue in *Arte de Cocina, Pastelería, Vizcochería y Conservería* (Madrid: Luis Sanchez, 1611), 2.

the originality and primacy of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* as the most important culinary text of the period, as the fact that it was the first written cooking manual would have allowed for the standardization of food practices in the royal court of early modern Spain, at least to a certain extent. Granted, the subjectivity of taste and the lack of specific measurements in *Arte de Cocina* likely meant that dishes prepared by Montañó's contemporaries and his successors were not necessarily faithful recreations of those listed in his text. Nonetheless, they would have drawn upon Montañó's distinct conceptualization of Spanish gastronomy, thereby establishing him—via his text—as the primary agent in the development of Spain's national cuisine.

Montañó referencing his position as a royal cook also alludes to his intent of making *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* the most prominent culinary text of early modern Spain, as well as one that contributes to the nation-building agenda of the Spanish Habsburgs. In the prologue of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* Montañó proudly proclaims that he has “many years of experience working for the king [Philip III]” and has served dishes in the court that were to the “satisfaction of his superiors.”⁹⁴ In doing so, Montañó seems to betray his desire to cement the status of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* as a culinary blueprint for early modern Spaniards. More specifically, Montañó was likely aware that specifically mentioning his qualifications would encourage his intended audience—from royal cooks to aristocrats interested in gastronomy—to view *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* as the most important extant culinary manual. Furthermore, Montañó's intimate relationship with the court suggests that he would have been well-aware of the Spanish Habsburg ambition of nation-building. With that in mind, Montañó would have wanted to create a cookbook that would make significant contributions to the conceptualization and advancement of a national cuisine for Spain, which is something the Spanish

⁹⁴ Ibid.

crown—which had sanctioned the publication of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería*—also desired.

Like Mestre Ruperto, Montañó also shows a direct recognition of the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus present in the food culture of early modern Iberia. While the inclusion of pork dishes in *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería* immediately separates Montañó's vision of "Spanish" national cuisine from its Al-Andalusian counterpart, there are various instances in which Muslim Iberia's food habits and practices are apparent. This is primarily seen through the inclusion of dishes with ties—both implicit, like certain ingredients that are prevalent in traditional Al-Andalusian cooking, and explicit, such as the title of the dish including the word "*morisca* (Morisco-style)"—to the Iberian Peninsula's Muslim heritage as well as current Morisco communities. The most notable, and quite glaring, recognition of Al-Andalusian cuisine in Montañó's cookbook, however, is the inclusion of couscous—a dish with distinct Berber origins.⁹⁵ Montañó even goes as far as to pay respect to the intricate process of preparing couscous, saying that one should "*cueza amorosamente* (cook it [the couscous] lovingly)."⁹⁶

Libro del arte de cozina (Diego Granado)

Diego Granado is another early modern Spanish cookbook author, with his text, *Libro del arte de cozina*, being published in 1599. Granado's main contribution to Spanish cuisine seems to be in bringing a smorgasbord of recipes—a grand total of 763 that is divided into fifteen sections—from other European nations, namely Italian ones that are taken from Bartolomeo Scappi's cookbook *Dell'arte del cuicnare* published in 1570 as well as Catalan ones from Mestre Ruperto's, into the Iberian Peninsula.⁹⁷ While many historians have understated the importance of Granado's work due to its

⁹⁵ Montañó, *Arte de Cocina*, 326-330.

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*,

⁹⁷ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 28-33.

derivative nature, a more careful evaluation of the text done by Carolyn Nadeau reveals that Granado shows his agency by selectively incorporating, modifying, and removing recipes from the cookbooks of Scappi and Mestre Ruperto.⁹⁸ According to Nadeau, while the fact that Granado took a majority of his recipes without proper citations remains undisputable, Granado duly considered the fact that his text reached out to a different audience. For instance, Granado accounts for the differences between the Italian and Iberian Peninsulas in the availability and seasonality of certain produce and ingredients, such as replacing Italian cheeses with their Iberian counterparts.⁹⁹

However, the text did not have the same prominence as those of Mestre Ruperto and Francisco Martínez Montañó. A possible reason behind this lack of success was Montañó's scathing diatribe on Diego Granado in the prologue of *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería*. Although there is no name given in the prologue, there are many clues that suggest that the individual on the end of Montañó's wrath is indeed Granado. The criticism of Granado starts immediately after Montañó's very first statement of the prologue that there have been no cookbooks that can guide royal cooks, stating that while there has been one—referring to Granado's book that was published prior to Montañó's, it is so flawed that whoever follows the instructions in that text will be ruined.¹⁰⁰ Montañó soon follows that assertion by denouncing Granado as a cook that barely anyone his field has ever heard of,¹⁰¹ alluding to Granado plagiarizing recipes from Bartolomeo Scappi and Mestre Ruperto—which has been significantly documented by scholars¹⁰²—by emphasizing the originality of the recipes in his own text, and criticizing specific recipes in Granado's text such as pies with chestnuts.¹⁰³ Montañó dedicating a significant portion of his prologue to lambast and delegitimize

⁹⁸ Ibid., 32-33.

⁹⁹ Ibid., 31.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., 1.

¹⁰¹ Ibid., 2.

¹⁰² Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 29-31.

¹⁰³ Montañó, Prologue in *Arte de Cocina*, 3.

Granado strongly hints at Montañó's intent to posit his text as the primary culinary text of Spain by replacing Granado's text.

Thus Mestre Ruperto, Granado, and Montañó showcase food habits and customs that were prevalent in the Iberian Peninsula during the early modern period, and—through the discussion of regional and international cuisines—allude to the construction of a “Spanish” national cuisine. In order to better understand gastronomy in the Iberian Peninsula during the early modern Period and its impact on the formation of national identity, however, there is a need to assess more sources. In particular, there is a need to analyze a cookbook that caters to a different social group than those of Mestre Ruperto, Montañó, and Granado. The issue here primarily lies in the fact that the aforementioned three were royal cooks, meaning all three cookbooks sought to outline recipes that catered towards the tastes of the social elite—the royals and aristocrats. Granted, assessing the construction of Spain's national identity through food via the lens of these cookbooks may not prove to be problematic given that early modern discourses of proto-nationalism and national identity were predominantly top-down processes. Yet there is a case to be made about the impact of expressions of national identity and “togetherness” from more grassroots sources as well, especially given that many dishes that have peasant origins eventually came to be celebrated by the upper class and even nationwide.¹⁰⁴

Libro del Arte de Cozina (Domingo Hernández de Maceras)

One source that partially addresses this concern is Domingo Hernández de Maceras' *Libro del Arte de Cozina*, published in 1607. Unlike Mestre Ruperto, Francisco Martínez Montañó, and Diego Granado, Domingo Hernández de Maceras was not a royal cook associated with the court. Instead, he was a cook in the University of Salamanca, working in the Colegio Mayor de San Salvador de

¹⁰⁴ Michael Billig, *Banal Nationalism* (London: SAGE Publications, 1995), 4-12.

Oviedo.¹⁰⁵ Hernández de Maceras' more local position thus makes his text an integral one in understanding food habits and practices at a more popular level outside of the royal court. Though much like contemporaries Montañó and Granado, Hernández de Maceras takes immense pride in his position and seeks to use his prestige to convince people in his line of work to follow his instructions. But where Hernández de Maceras differs from his peers is in his intended audience, stating that his "book is intended for those without the same specialized knowledge as the author."¹⁰⁶ This implies that Hernández de Maceras wanted to reach out to fellow Spanish cooks that may not necessarily have the same experience as he does, but those with an undoubtable passion for their craft.

Another notable element of *Libro del Arte de Cozina* that distinguishes the work from contemporary cookbooks in early modern Iberia is in its methodical organization. Although both Montañó and Granado, and even Mestre Ruperto before them, divided their recipes into multiple sections, they do not match Hernández de Maceras in terms of how specific the categorization gets in their texts. Hernández de Maceras starts his cookbook with a brief introduction discussing seasonal foods (summer and winter), salads, and desserts.¹⁰⁷ The book is then organized into three sections: (1) on how to carve different kinds of meat and fowl (this section is especially impressive in terms of its specificity, with the author not only including many different kinds of animals but also various different parts and cuts of the same animal and their uses), (2) foods for partial abstinence days, and (3) foodstuff such as fish, eggs, and vegetable soup/stew for full abstinence days.¹⁰⁸ A recurring pattern throughout *Libro del Arte de Cozina* is Hernández de Maceras' juxtaposition of complex dishes with their less fancy—and often comedically simplistic—counterparts. For instance,

¹⁰⁵ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 37.

¹⁰⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁰⁷ Domingo Hernández de Maceras, *Libro del arte de cozina* (Salamanca, Spain: Antonia Ramirez, 1607), 1-3.

¹⁰⁸ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 39.

Hernández de Maceras' salad in the introduction of the book consists of chopped vegetables and capers tossed in a vinaigrette, then is complemented by an assortment of ingredients including fatback, tongue, trout/salmon, and sugared pomegranate; his recipe for "quotidian" salad that immediately follows his elaborate salad is only made of cooked capers with a simple vinaigrette and sugar.¹⁰⁹

With two sections of the book being dedicated to Christian days of observance, *Libro del Arte de Cozina* is undoubtedly centered on Christian eating habits. However, Hernández de Maceras does not shy away from listing the Iberian Peninsula's gastronomic heritage from Al-Andalus in a similar manner to Mestre Ruperto and Francisco Martínez Montañó. For one, the first section of *Libro del arte de cozina* that features different kinds and cuts of meat and fowl does not heavily feature pork, instead opting to emphasize other types of meat that are more prevalent in Hispano-Muslim cuisine such as beef, mutton, and goat.¹¹⁰ In fact, out of the eleven kinds of meats/cuts that are listed, only two of them, *lechón* (suckling pig) and *pierna* (ham hocks), are pork related.¹¹¹ Furthermore, Hernández de Maceras features ingredients and food practices that are derivative of Al-Andalusian gastronomy, such as using nuts in desserts as well as "spice combinations of coriander, saffron, and black pepper, orange blossom water, and rice."¹¹² A parallel to the work of Mestre Ruperto can be seen in Hernández de Maceras' use of Arabic names for certain dishes, such as using "*bollos maimones* (maimones buns)" as an alternative name for "*bollos de clauonia* (clavonia buns)."¹¹³

Yet there is still a particularly thorny issue that even the inclusion of Hernández de Maceras into this thesis' analysis cannot fully address: the risk presented by determining the degree of

¹⁰⁹ Hernández de Maceras, *Libro del arte de cozina*, 2-3.

¹¹⁰ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 41.

¹¹¹ Hernández de Maceras, *Libro del arte de cozina*, 3, 6-7.

¹¹² Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 41.

¹¹³ *Ibid.*, and

incorporation of Al-Andalusian cultural elements solely through cookbooks catering towards the tastes of the elite. Granted, this might apply to a lesser extent in the case of Hernández de Maceras' cookbook due to his affiliation with the University of Salamanca rather than the court. But his intended audience were still members of the social elite, which can be inferred from the fact that his audience would have to be literate. For one, there are different implications with a member of the social elite consuming dishes with clear Al-Andalusian influences compared to a regular citizen doing the same. While the former would likely be seen as nothing more than an appreciative gesture towards the diverse gastronomic heritage of Spain, the latter, especially with the degree of persecution suffered by Iberian Muslims at a communal level, could be seen as a transgressive act that was even subject to the Inquisition.

There are also questions of power and politics that are at play here. The elite consumption of Al-Andalusian dishes, particularly taking historical context into consideration, could be interpreted as a symbolic act that implied the Christian conquest of Muslims and the unification of the Iberian Peninsula under a Christian hegemony. This would be akin to the thought behind Isabel and Ferdinand when they used the Alhambra as their royal court following the surrender of the Nasrid caliph in Granada. Commoners, however, did not have that power with the notion of *limpieza de sangre* and the Spanish Inquisition in full swing during the early modern period. In other words, their consumption of certain dishes or engagement with food practices that have strong Muslim connotations could have been a justification that their community and/or authority figures could use to denounce them as crypto-Muslims.

AL-ANDALUSIAN COOKING MANUSCRIPTS

Recipes listed in cookbooks and the opinions of their authors provide a cursory insight on the extent to which Muslim food habits and practices were tolerated, but a more profound analysis of the legacy of Al-Andalusian gastronomy on that of early modern Iberia only becomes possible with a detailed analysis of Al-Andalusian cooking manuscripts. There are only two texts from the period that survive to this day: (1) *Kitab al tabikh fi-l-Maghrib wa-l-Andalus fi `asr al-Muwabbidin, limu'allif majbul* (*Tratado sobre cocina en el Magrib y al-Andalus en época almohade, de autor desconocido*) by an anonymous author and (2) *Fudalat-al-Hiwan Fi Tayyibat al-Ta'am Wa-l-Ahwan* (*Relieves de la mesa acerca de las delicias de la comida y los diferentes platos*) by Ibn Razin al-Tugibi. Before moving into a discussion of the contents of these texts, however, there is a need to clarify the distinction this thesis makes between Al-Andalusian sources and their early modern counterparts by using the term “cooking manuscript” and “cookbook.” The use of the terms is down to the two extant Al-Andalusian texts being a compilation of various written material “that have been amended along the way by other cooks.”¹¹⁴ In other words, there are various unseen sources, from “unknown factors [to] lost manuscripts [and] oral traditions,” that one needs to take into consideration when analyzing cooking manuscripts as opposed to the more straightforward process of looking at cookbooks.¹¹⁵

Kitab al tabikh fi-l-Maghrib wa-l-Andalus fi `asr al-Muwabbidin, limu'allif majbul

Emblematic of a cooking manuscript's composite nature is *Kitab al tabikh fi-l-Maghrib wa-l-Andalus fi `asr al-Muwabbidin, limu'allif majbul* (hereon *Kitab al tabikh*), an anonymous cookbook from 13th century Al-Andalus that haphazardly combines over 500 recipes from different authors. Aside from recipes, *Kitab al tabikh* includes various opinions and guidelines on notions of taste, the material

¹¹⁴ Ibid., 4.

¹¹⁵ Ibid., 5.

of kitchen utensils, and serving. The text also references food and diet through the lens of medicine, with a brief citation of Hippocrates included as well as the association of different tastes with different bodily humors.¹¹⁶ Within this framework of viewing food through medicine, certain ingredients are described as having certain beneficial properties to the body, such as vinegar being helpful with “foods that form a crust and are harmful to the stomach” and cumin aiding digestibility.¹¹⁷ The most notable trait of this manuscript is arguably in its disorganization. While *Kitab al tabikh* does have a few sections dedicated to recipes that somewhat belong together—such as the first section that details various roasted and grilled meat dishes,¹¹⁸ the text does not come close to the meticulous categorization of recipes based on numerous criteria used by authors of cookbooks in early modern Iberia. The fourth section of *Kitab al tabikh*, for instance, lists simmered meat dishes, pies, recipes with semolina, sugary dishes, and other miscellaneous items together.¹¹⁹

Another fascinating feature of *Kitab al tabikh* is in its inclusion of Jewish recipes, which in a way mirrors how cookbooks published in early modern Iberia included Al-Andalusian or “Moorish” dishes. Charles Perry’s translation of the text lists six recipes that include the word “Jewish” in the name of the dish.¹²⁰ Four of them are poultry-based, with two partridge dishes (“Jewish Partridge” and “A Jewish Dish of Partridge”) and two chicken dishes (two entries listed with the name “A Jewish Dish of Chicken”).¹²¹ The other two dishes are “A Stuffed, Buried Jewish Dish”, what Carolyn Nadeau describes as “a unique take on spaghetti and meatballs,”¹²² and “A Jewish Dish of Eggplants Stuffed with Meat.”¹²³ The inclusion of Jewish recipes not only is notable in that the text

¹¹⁶ *Kitab al tabikh fi-l-Maghrib wa-l-Andalus fi `asr al-Muwahhidin, limu'allif majbul*, trans. Charles Perry, http://www.daviddfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

¹¹⁷ Ibid.

¹¹⁸ Ibid.

¹¹⁹ Ibid.

¹²⁰ Ibid.

¹²¹ Ibid.

¹²² Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 11.

¹²³ *Kitab al tabikh*, http://www.daviddfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

is the only extant one of its kind that documents Jewish cuisine in Iberia during the medieval period,¹²⁴ but also mirrors the dynamic that appears in early modern “Spanish” cookbooks with their acknowledgement of the Iberian Muslim culinary legacy. Much like Muslims and Moriscos under early modern Iberian Christendom, Jews under caliphates had to survive through waves of limited tolerance and outright hostility. Considering this, the integration of Jewish cuisine into that of Al-Andalus could be interpreted as a gesture of cultural appreciation by various authors or simply a statement of superiority, power, and appropriation.

Parts of *Kitab al tabikh* are also notable in its mention of specific regions and nations, much like how Francisco Martínez Montañón did in *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería*. In “Recipe for Mujabbana (Fried Cheese Pie),” for instance, an anonymous author mentions other cities “in the West of *Al-Andalus*” that prepare the dish such as Cordoba, Seville, and Jerez.¹²⁵ The recipe “Tharīda with Lamb and Spinach, Moist Cheese and Butter” mentions the origins of the dish as well, with an anonymous author stating that a doctor named Abu al-Hasan al-Bunani made the dish in Cordoba.¹²⁶ What is especially worth noting, however, is an excerpt in the third section of the manuscript that identifies different constructions of taste in different nations, which suggests a formation of a “proto-national” cuisine prior to the era of emerging nation states. Some of the “national tastes” described by *Kitab al tabikh* include Persians liking rice with sumac and the Egyptians liking a hen dish called *muruzjyya*, which is hated by the Iraqis due to the combination of pears, jujubes, and oil in the recipe reminding them of medicine.¹²⁷ Religious and ethnic divides in food are also shown in this section, with a notable example being the sprinkling of black pepper on

¹²⁴ Again, the discussion of Jewish influences in early modern Iberian cuisine is outside the scope of this thesis, but I hope to return to it having done further research on the subject in a future work.

¹²⁵ *Kitab al tabikh*, http://www.daviddfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

¹²⁶ Ibid.

¹²⁷ Ibid.

a finished dish being labeled as a Christian and Berber practice.¹²⁸ The almost systematic segregation of taste based on regions, nations, ethnic groups, and many other categories appearing in this Al-Andalusian text perhaps could have served as a precedent to later texts in early modern Iberia trying to define which food habits and practices were “Spanish.”

Fudalat-al-Hiwan Fi Tayyibat al-Ta’am Wa-l-Ahwan (Ibn Razin al-Tugibi)

Ibn Razin al-Tugibi’s *Fudalat-al-Hiwan Fi Tayyibat al-Ta’am Wa-l-Ahwan* (hereon *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*) complements *Kitab al tabikh* in providing insight as to what Al-Andalusian food culture was like. One aspect of *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* that is immediately noticeable is the fact that the cooking manual has a known author. Therefore, the text’s targeted audience as well as the intent of writing it is much more identifiable in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* compared to *Kitab al tabikh*, not to mention that preferences in taste that are shown in the book can be attributed to a single individual—at least nominally, since there remains the very likely possibility that Ibn Razin partially derived his work from certain, no longer extant precedents. To provide more information on the author himself, Ibn Razin, while not strictly a cook, belonged to the broad and all-encompassing social strata of the Muslim literary elite.¹²⁹ This fact is further evidenced by Ibn Razin accentuating the nobility of the dishes included in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*.¹³⁰ Ibn Razin was born and raised in Murcia even after it became a *mudéjar* town under Christian rule, but later moved to Ceuta in North Africa when Christian-Muslim relations massively deteriorated in his hometown.¹³¹ Ibn Razin spent the rest of his life moving around North Africa, first moving to Béjaïa (also known as Bugis) before finally settling in

¹²⁸ Ibid.

¹²⁹ Manuela Marín, “Vida de Ibn Razin, Abu l-Hasan ‘Ali b. Muhammad b. Abi l-Qasim b. Muhammad b. Abi Bakr b. Razin al-Tugibi (ca. 625-692/1227-1293),” in Ibn Razin al-Tugibi, *Relieves de las mesas, acerca de las delicias de la comida y los diferentes platos*, ed. and trans. Manuela Marín (Gijón, Spain: Ediciones Trea S.L., 2007), 11-19.

¹³⁰ Ibn Razin al-Tugibi, *Relieves de las mesas, acerca de las delicias de la comida y los diferentes platos*, ed. and trans. Manuela Marín (Gijón, Spain: Ediciones Trea S.L., 2007), 71-72.

¹³¹ Marín, “Vida de Ibn Razin,” in Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 14.

Tunis, likely holding his memories of Al-Andalus dear given that he was inclined to write *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* as well as other texts that unfortunately have not survived to this day.¹³²

Compared to its contemporary work *Kitab al tabikh*, *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* is significantly more organized, likely due to the fact that a single author compiled and wrote the text. The cooking manual has a total of 432 recipes that are sorted into twelve sections as noted in its introduction.¹³³ Each section is in turn divided into chapters based on the main component of the dish, a level of organization that is unparalleled by *Kitab al tabikh*. Aside from its meticulous categorization, *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* is notable in the number of recipes that are included for each section. Carolyn Nadeau, in *Food Matters*, identifies the number of recipes that are included in each of the sections, and the findings are as follows: there are 98 bread and other grain-based dishes, 90 meat dishes, 79 fowl-based recipes, 3 *al-Sanhagi* (the translation of this term is not provided, but it seems to be a particular region) style recipes, 41 dishes featuring fish and eggs, 13 incorporating dairy products, 35 vegetable dishes, 8 legume-based dishes, 25 sweet recipes, 3 dishes of locusts, shrimp, and snails, and finally 9 recipes for soaps and scented powders.¹³⁴ Perhaps the most fascinating inclusion in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* is the section on soaps and scented powders. While dedicating an entire section to sanitary products in a cooking manual may seem out of place, the practice falls in line with medieval Muslims approaching food from a medical perspective alongside studying its gastronomic properties. There are various instances in which this intellectual practice appears, including the aforementioned citation of Hippocrates in *Kitab al tabikh* as well as the publication of 12th century Sevillian doctor

¹³² Ibid., 15-19.

¹³³ See Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 6 and Ibn Razin, *Relienes de las mesas*, 74-77.

¹³⁴ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 6.

Abu Marwan ‘Abd al-Malik b. Zuhr’s *Kitab al-Agdiya wal-adwiya*, a text examining the medicinal benefits of food.¹³⁵

In fact, Ibn Razin himself also adds to the study of food from a medical perspective in his introduction, where he details food-related guidelines such as the order in which food should be consumed and the material that cooking utensils and serving vehicles should be made out of.¹³⁶ In doing so, Ibn Razin particularly places strong emphases on a few things. First is the importance of proper digestion, which is the motive behind his meticulous ordering of consuming specific dishes. Ibn Razin states that heavy dishes that takes longer to digest (he gives dairy products, breadcrumb-based soups [*sopas desmigadas*], *harisas* [an Arabic cracked wheat porridge; not to be confused with the North African chili paste *harissa* which has post-Columbian origins], fatty cuts of meat, fish, and fried grains among others as examples) should be consumed first as well as vegetables, not because of the same reason but because they aid the digestive process by relaxing the organs involved.¹³⁷ Citing similar reasons, he also maintains that anything that is savory should be consumed before sweets.¹³⁸ Ibn Razin additionally outlines an order in which desserts should be served, claiming that egg-based desserts that are liable to congealing should be served first while sesame seed and flaxseed-based desserts should ideally be avoided by those that have an excess of yellow bile in their stomachs.¹³⁹ Aside from digestion, Ibn Razin strongly argues for proper sanitation in the kitchen—in a similar manner to Francisco Martínez Montañó—and use of utensils and serving trays made of good material for food preparation—much like *Kitab al tabikh*. Here, Ibn Razin increases his credibility by citing a doctor, stating his specific recommendations such as not cooking in the same

¹³⁵ Expiración García Sánchez, “La Gastronomía Andalusí,” in *El zoco: vida económica y artes tradicionales en Al-Andalus y Marruecos*, ed. Vicente Salvatierra (Madrid, Spain: Lunewerg, 1995), 50.

¹³⁶ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 6.

¹³⁷ Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 73-74.

¹³⁸ *Ibid.*, 74.

¹³⁹ *Ibid.*

pot twice, or using plates and other tools of serving preferably made of gold and silver, and not clay or copper.¹⁴⁰ The seasonality of ingredients is also stressed throughout the text, such as when Ibn Razin states that calabashes/bottle gourds are best in the summer or fall.¹⁴¹

Going back to the discussion of the number of recipes in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*, the abundance of recipes in certain sections show which ingredients and dishes held utmost importance in the diet of Al-Andalusians. Immediately noticeable in Ibn Razin's cooking manual with the biggest number of recipes are breads and grain-based dishes. The primacy of bread and grains is not just in the number, however, as it can also be seen through the wide variety of grains and grain-products that are used in the section. For one, Ibn Razin's grain recipes use a multitude of grain-related ingredients such as regular wheat flour (*barina de trigo*), fine wheat flour (*barina de adárgama*), semolina flour, millet flour, and rice.¹⁴² In addition to that, the ingredients are in turn used in a variety of ways, from simple breads and porridge to recipes that require a considerable amount of handiwork such as different kinds of noodles and couscous.¹⁴³ The first section of *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* also includes a showcase of the highly developed Muslim tradition of pastry-making.¹⁴⁴ Juxtaposing the likes of *zalabiyya* and *buñuelos* alongside their savory, but also grain-based counterparts in the very first section of *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* instead of relegating them to the much less intensive sweets section towards the end of the text seems much like a conscious decision by Ibn Razin. More specifically, including pastries in arguably the most primary portion of the text suggests a high likelihood that Ibn Razin and many of his contemporaries thought pastries and pastry-making to be an integral part of the Al-Andalusian culinary identity.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid., 73.

¹⁴¹ Manuela Marín, "La *Fudalat al-hiwan fi tayyibat al-ta'am wa-l-alwan* (<<Relieves de las mesas, acerca de las delicias de la comida y los diferentes platos>>)," in Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 35.

¹⁴² Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 77-139.

¹⁴³ Ibid.

¹⁴⁴ Ibid., 104-130.

The section on meat dishes also constitutes a significant portion of *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*, with 90 recipes being divided over six sections. As meat was only readily available to the socioeconomically privileged, the consumption of meat was seen in medieval (as well as early modern) societies as an indication of wealth and prestige.¹⁴⁵ Much like the section on grain-based dishes, the section on meat dishes contains a great variety of different animals, from standard domestic quadrupeds and poultry to game meat.¹⁴⁶ Marín notes that an important distinction that appears specifically in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* that distinguishes Al-Andalusian cuisine from that of other Islamic nations in the Orient is the inclusion of beef dishes.¹⁴⁷ While the number of beef dishes certainly pales in comparison to that of recipes having mutton or poultry as their chief ingredients, the inclusion of beef is certainly a unique element to Al-Andalusian cuisine, which is important given that Islamic cuisine in the medieval period tends to be seen as rather homogeneous.¹⁴⁸

Aside from grains and meat, other ingredients that are heavily featured in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* are legumes (with the exception of lentils), eggplants, and calabashes/bottle gourds. Chickpeas seem to be the favored kind of legumes in Ibn Razin's text, as they not only have a chapter dedicated to them in the legumes section but also feature heavily in other dishes where they are not the primary ingredient.¹⁴⁹ For instance, Manuela Marín, the editor and translator of the most recently published Spanish edition of *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*, notes that chickpeas are used to provide the liquid needed for braised meat dishes, as well as mashed into a paste to accompany meat dishes as a side.¹⁵⁰ Broad beans are the other kind of legumes that are prominently featured in the text, though not as much as

¹⁴⁵ Marín, "La *Fudalat*" in Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 41.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid., 41-42.

¹⁴⁸ David Waines, "The Culinary Culture of Al-Andalus," in *The Legacy of Muslim Spain*, ed. Salma Khadra Jayyusi (Leiden, Netherlands: E.J. Brill, 1992), 726.

¹⁴⁹ Marín, "La *Fudalat*" in Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 32.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid.

chickpeas.¹⁵¹ Lentils, on the other hand, are not discussed to a great extent in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*, with a meager half-page section dedicated to the legume.¹⁵² In explaining the rationale behind this decision, Marín argues that the production of lentils simply could not have been as effective as those of other legumes, and that the lack of lentil dishes in the cooking manual does not necessarily signify that the social elites that *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* catered to saw lentils as a base and lowly product.¹⁵³

The inclusion of eggplants as a prominent ingredient is perhaps the least surprising out of everything in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*, as they were heavily associated with the Muslim diet throughout medieval and early modern Europe.¹⁵⁴ The longevity of this belief is perhaps best represented by a quote in the famous *Don Quixote* by Miguel de Cervantes, in which Sancho states to the titular protagonist:

Por la mayor parte he oído decir que los moros son amigos de berenjenas [For the most part I have heard that the moors are friends of eggplants].¹⁵⁵

The prominence of eggplants, much like that of pastry-making in the first section of the text, portrays the eggplant as a culinary symbol of the ethnoreligious identity of Al-Andalusians. This paramount status of the vegetable can be seen through Ibn Razin dedicating an entire section to dishes with eggplants as a primary ingredient,¹⁵⁶ as well as listing many recipes with them as a secondary ingredient in a similar manner to the use of chickpeas.¹⁵⁷ Calabashes are another vegetable that appears many times throughout the book, but their prominence seems to be mostly due to their

¹⁵¹ Ibid.

¹⁵² Ibid., 32-33.

¹⁵³ Ibid., 33.

¹⁵⁴ Ibid., 34-35.

¹⁵⁵ See Ibid., 35.

¹⁵⁶ Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 268-277.

¹⁵⁷ Marín, “La *Fudalat*,” in Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 34.

culinary versatility rather than any significance in constituting the Al-Andalusian ethnoreligious identity.¹⁵⁸

Ibn Razin also shows his preference for certain spices, herbs, and condiments in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan*. By far the most used spice in all the recipes in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* is black pepper, followed by cilantro (both fresh and dry) and cinnamon.¹⁵⁹ Saffron also features often, being used for its odor as well as a colorizing agent after dissolving it in a moderate amount of vinegar or cold water—which gives a dish a characteristic yellow-orange hue.¹⁶⁰ The inclusion of saffron in various dishes in *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* also signifies that the cooking manual was indeed intended for the elite, as the production and harvesting of saffron are highly labor-intensive and expensive processes.¹⁶¹ Ginger is another spice that is often used in conjunction with cinnamon, particularly as a light dusting over a finished dish.¹⁶² These five spices/herbs (black pepper, cilantro, cinnamon, saffron, and ginger) are the primary ones in Ibn Razin’s text, and others that appear less prominently but are still included multiple times (Marín states ten to fifteen times) are cumin, vetiver, cloves, oregano, caraway, fennel, mint, mastic, anise, and wormwood.¹⁶³ In terms of condiments, Ibn Razin extols the value of vinegar, which Marín attributes to the condiment’s acidity enabling the purification and preservation of dishes.¹⁶⁴

¹⁵⁸ Ibid., 35.

¹⁵⁹ Ibid., 39.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid.

¹⁶¹ “The Spanish Saffron Industry,” in *Journal of the Royal Society of Arts* 61, no. 3166 (1913): 844-846.

¹⁶² Marín, “La *Fudalat*,” in Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 40.

¹⁶³ Ibid.

¹⁶⁴ Ibid., 47.

CONFRONTING THE ISLAMIC ROOTS OF “SPANISH” NATIONAL CUISINE

Islamic Culinary Traditions in Early Modern Iberia

Having established prevalent food habits and practices in both Al-Andalus and early modern Iberia, this thesis now shifts its focus to assessing how and in what ways the latter chose to incorporate/appropriate elements of the former. In other words, the task at hand is identifying how and why certain Al-Andalusian food and food practices carried over to the food culture of early modern Iberia instead of others. For one, there is the question of ingredients that held primacy in the food culture of Al-Andalus that carried over to a developing “Spanish” gastronomy during the early modern period. One of the most notable out of such ingredients is the eggplant. Heavily featured in both *Fudalat-al-Hiwan* and *Kitab al tabikh*, the eggplant was arguably the crystallized essence of Al-Andalusian cuisine in the form of a single ingredient. In other words, the appreciation of the eggplant by medieval Iberian Muslims strongly suggests that they saw the vegetable as a representation of their culinary identity. The eggplant’s significance to the Muslim community was also noted outside of the *mudéjar* community up to the early modern era, as evidenced by the aforementioned reference included in Cervantes’ *Don Quixote*.¹⁶⁵ Despite this strong association, the eggplant did still feature quite frequently in various recipes in early modern Iberian cookbooks. Mestre Ruperto includes a few eggplant recipes (*Berenjenas en cazuela*, *Berenjenas espesas*, *Berenjenas a la morisca*, and *Cazuela moji*) in *Libre de Coch*,¹⁶⁶ and Francisco Martínez Montañó also has some featured in his *Arte de Cocina* (*Cazuela mogi de berengenas*, *Berengenas rellenas*, *Plato de berengenas en dia de carne* and *Memorias de las Verengenas en escaveche*).¹⁶⁷

While they may not have as strong of an association with Muslims like the eggplant, there are also various other ingredients prevalent in the gastronomy of early modern Iberia whose origins in

¹⁶⁵ See footnote 151.

¹⁶⁶ Mestre Ruperto, *Libre de Coch*, 76-77, 121.

¹⁶⁷ Montañó, *Arte de Cocina*, 222-225, 401-402.

the Peninsula are indebted to Muslims. Over the many centuries they were in the Peninsula, Muslims had either brought in or cultivated “rice, saffron...spinach, almonds, sugar, cinnamon, oranges, and lemons” in addition to introducing the use of “cilantro, black pepper...and rose water” that are not as prevalent in modern Spanish dishes but continued to appear in the early modern period.¹⁶⁸ Rice in particular has been thoroughly incorporated into early modern Spanish cuisine, with a variety of rice recipes found in cookbooks published during the period. For both Muslim and early modern “Spanish” cooking, rice could be utilized in many different forms, from the three ways of preparation that Nadeau describes (“*arroz entero* [whole grain rice], *seco* [all broth or water is absorbed], and *grasso* [cooked with animal fat]”)¹⁶⁹ to sweet or savory. Even to this day, rice plays a significant role in Spanish cuisine, with Valencia being the biggest cultivator of the crop in Europe as well as being the main component in paella—what is considered to be a Spanish national dish.¹⁷⁰

Furthermore, there are certain dishes listed in early modern Iberian cookbooks that derive from or even directly pay homage to the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus. Grain-based dishes are notable examples that derive from Al-Andalusian cooking, such as noodles, empanadas (the early modern varieties, according to Nadeau, are “generally understood as freestanding stuffed bread”),¹⁷¹ and pastries. While the spread of noodles throughout the European continent is primarily attributed to Marco Polo’s expedition to China, the culinary manuscripts of Al-Andalus reveals that various forms of pasta were being consumed by Iberians. *Kitab al tabikh* lists various noodle recipes in a section titled “Kinds of Starch Dishes: Couscous, Rice, Meat Porridges (Harisas), Noodles and the Like.”¹⁷² Many of these noodle recipes consisted of noodles being served in a meat broth,¹⁷³ a

¹⁶⁸ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 112.

¹⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, 126.

¹⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, 126-127.

¹⁷¹ *Ibid.*, 123.

¹⁷² *Kitab al tabikh*, http://www.davidfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

¹⁷³ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 122.

method of preparation that continued in early modern Iberia as seen by Mestre Ruperto's *Potaje de fideos* (Noodle stew) in *Libre de Coch*.¹⁷⁴

Even more apparent in early modern “Spanish” cooking than noodles, however, are empanadas. A great amount of empanada recipes appears in both Al-Andalusian and early modern Iberian cooking texts, with varying methods of preparation for each component of the dish. For one, the dough can be made in many different ways. In the Hispano-Muslim manuscripts, the empanada dough can use semolina or regular flour, use oil or butter, be baked or fried, enclosed like the empanadas of today or even open-faced.¹⁷⁵ The fillings can include meat, fish, vegetables, some combination of the three, or even nothing at all, and much like rice recipes, they can be either sweet or savory.¹⁷⁶ Some examples that appear in *Kitab al tabikh* include a selection of fried, cheese-stuffed empanadas referred to as *Mujabbana* as well as a similar, oven-baked version known as *Toledan*.¹⁷⁷ A great amount of empanada recipes are also found in the early modern cookbooks of Mestre Ruperto and Montañó, with the latter having “some two dozen empanada recipes” in *Arte de cocina*.¹⁷⁸ Much like the recipes in the Al-Andalusian texts, the empanadas in *Arte de cocina* are made in various ways. For *Empanadas de perdices* (partridge empanadas), for instance, Montañó uses a dough made of flour, eggs, water, salt, and a little butter.¹⁷⁹ In the recipe that immediately follows for *Empanadas en asador* (Rotisserie empanadas), Montañó instead uses a dough made of rice flour, sugar, egg yolk, and a dash of wine.¹⁸⁰

¹⁷⁴ Mestre Ruperto, *Libre de Coch*, 83.

¹⁷⁵ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 123.

¹⁷⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷⁷ *Kitab al tabikh*, http://www.daviddfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

¹⁷⁸ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 123.

¹⁷⁹ Montañó, *Arte de Cocina*, 36-37.

¹⁸⁰ Ibid., 37-38.

Pastries are yet another kind of dish that appears extensively in both Al-Andalusian and early modern “Spanish” cookeries. Pastries, in a similar vein to eggplants, were emblematic of Al-Andalusian gastronomy. The inclusion of pastries in the primary section of Ibn Razin’s *Fudalat al-Hiwan*—that of grain and grain-based dishes—underscores the importance of pastries in the food culture of Hispano-Muslims.¹⁸¹ More specifically, since many, if not all, of the grain-based dishes included in the first section of *Fudalat al-Hiwan* are those considered as staples (such as bread, porridges, and hearty stews), Ibn Razin’s decision to put pastries alongside those foods indicates that they were much more than complementary desserts to the main course for Al-Andalusians. The paramount importance of the tradition of pastry-making carried over to the gastronomy of early modern Iberians, as seen through their cookbooks. Montaña, for instance, includes a wide array of pastries in *Arte de Cocina* from *buñuelos*, *almojábanas*, and not to mention the renowned *torrijas*.¹⁸²

By extension to pastries, the heavy use of sugar in Al-Andalusian cuisine carried over to that of early modern Iberia as well. Sugar, whose presence in the Iberian Peninsula is first mentioned in a tenth-century Hispano-Muslim document,¹⁸³ is shown to have been the primary sweetener used by Muslims in the Peninsula. In fact, Nadeau notes that in *Kitab al-tabikh*, there are 171 recipes that involve sugar, a sizable total compared to dishes with honey, which is shown to be the next most popular sweetener with 135 recipes.¹⁸⁴ Sugar’s significance in Hispano-Muslim cooking is further demonstrated by the fact that it is not merely relegated to being used in sweet dessert items. Quite to the contrary, sugar is shown to be routinely sprinkled on top of savory dishes, either by itself or combined with other ingredients such as cinnamon or black pepper.¹⁸⁵ *Kitab al-tabikh* even features a

¹⁸¹ See footnote 140.

¹⁸² Montaña, *Arte de Cocina*, 180-184, 207, 212,

¹⁸³ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 128.

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, 129.

¹⁸⁵ *Ibid.*

sweet dish called *Sukkariyya* in which sugar is the main component of the dish.¹⁸⁶ Sugar, and the use of sweeteners in general, continued to play an important role in early modern Iberian cooking. For example, sugar prominently features in both Mestre Ruperto's *Libre de coch* and Domingo Hernández de Maceras' *Libro del arte de cocina*; María Pérez Samper even notes that sugar or honey features in over half of the recipes in the latter.¹⁸⁷ Furthermore, early modern "Spanish" cookbooks do not just replicate the extensive use of sugar seen in Al-Andalusian cooking manuscripts, but also specific practices such as sprinkling sugar and cinnamon together as a finishing touch to a dish.¹⁸⁸

If food such as eggplants and grain-based dishes being prevalent in early modern Iberian gastronomy was an implicit nod to Hispano-Muslim food culture, dishes that are described with the modifying phrase "*a la morisca* (Morisco-style)" are an explicit recognition of "Spanish" cuisine's Islamic heritage. As mentioned in the section detailing cookbooks that were published in early modern Iberia, there are various instances in which Morisco-style dishes (that are openly referred to as such) appear. Mestre Ruperto includes *Berenjenas a la morisca* (Morisco-style eggplants) and *Calabazas a la morisca* (Morisco-style calabashes) in *Libre de coch*,¹⁸⁹ and Montaña includes two similar recipes titled *Gallina morisca* and *Gallina á la morisca* respectively (both referring to Morisco-style hen) in *Arte de cocina*.¹⁹⁰ Granted, an individual cookbook author's recognition of Muslim influences in early modern Iberian cuisine may not seem like much, but given the agency that these two texts in particular held in shaping the culinary identity for an emerging "Spanish nation"—their influence is seen through the high number of editions and publications—the mentions are quite significant. Furthermore, in the case of *Arte de cocina*, the book was published by the crown in a time when

¹⁸⁶ *Kitab al tabikh*, http://www.davidfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

¹⁸⁷ María de los Ángeles Pérez Samper, *La Alimentación en la España del Siglo de Oro: Domingo Hernández de Maceras, "Libro del arte de cocina"* (Huesca, Spain: La Val de Onsera, 1998), 78.

¹⁸⁸ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 130.

¹⁸⁹ Mestre Ruperto, *Libre de Coch*, 77, 79.

¹⁹⁰ Montaña, *Arte de Cocina*, 58, 370.

nation-building efforts by the Habsburgs were arguably at their height, especially given the aforementioned publication of Spain's first monolingual vernacular dictionary. This indicates that royal officials who proofread Montañó's text allowed references to Morisco-style dishes to be included without any censorship.

Other aspects of the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus present in early modern Iberian cuisine are food practices. Methods of preparation and cooking techniques are some areas that can be looked at, but a survey of culinary texts indicate that the kinds of dishes being prepared were relatively homogeneous during the medieval and early modern periods, with only preferences for certain ingredients distinguishing a region's cuisine from another. Therefore, trying to establish a legitimate connection between Al-Andalusian gastronomy and that of early modern Iberia would be difficult. Perceptions of food in both food cultures on the other hand presents a more traceable link between the two. In particular, the medical approach to food as well as the emphasis on using proper material for food preparation and proper sanitation in the kitchen are striking parallels seen in both Al-Andalusian and early modern Iberian texts. Both extant Al-Andalusian cooking manuscripts make many references to the pharmaceutical properties of food as well as the importance of using proper material for kitchen utensils and establishing sanitary guidelines in the kitchen. For instance, *Kitab al-tabikh* cites Hippocrates in one of its sections¹⁹¹ and Ibn Razin invokes the authority of doctors to prove his statements on using good material for utensils and eating foods in the right order according to their digestibility in the introduction to *Fudalat al-hiwan*.¹⁹² These notions are greatly emphasized in early modern "Spanish" cookbooks as well, with Montañó's first chapter of *Arte de cocina* even being titled "*De la limpieza de la cocina* (of the cleanliness of the

¹⁹¹ *Kitab al tabikh*, http://www.daviddfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

¹⁹² Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 73-74.

kitchen).”¹⁹³ While a specific nod to Al-Andalus is absent in Montañó’s text, the highly established practice in the Islamic world of viewing food as medicine makes the possibility that Montañó derived the idea from a translated Al-Andalusian source probable.

Segregations of Taste and Differentiating “Spanish” Cuisine from that of Al-Andalus

However, the rather extensive implementation of Islamic culinary practice into the food culture of early modern Iberia does not suggest a complete recognition of Islamic influences as part of an emerging “Spanish” national cuisine, let alone the notion of “Spanishness.” One aspect of food in particular that makes reaching this conclusion difficult is the fluidity of food culture in symbiotic communities such as many towns and cities in medieval Iberia. While the idea of peaceful coexistence proposed by the notion of *convivencia* in Spanish historiography fails to encapsulate the complex political, economic, and social dynamics that were present in Christian, Islamic, and Jewish communities in medieval Iberia, one thing that is correct about *convivencia* is the fact that these religious groups had significant interactions with another. Specific food practices and habits undoubtedly differed, such as rituals concerning food (which by nature is inextricably tied with religion) and butchering practices (halal and kosher compared to no strict guidelines for Christians), but tastes were definitely shared as evidenced by Inquisitional records and comparing Hispano-Muslim and early modern Iberian culinary texts.¹⁹⁴ Therefore, the inclusion of ingredients and dishes that were integral to the culinary identity of Muslims may not necessarily imply a full recognition of Islam’s imprint on the food culture of an emerging “Spain.” Instead, the inclusion could have rather been a choice based on the tastes of “Spaniards” that grew accustomed to liking such food items and saw such dishes independent of their Al-Andalusian origins.

¹⁹³ Montañó, *Arte de Cocina*, 1-8.

¹⁹⁴ Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 110.

There are also dishes that were integral to the culinary identity of Al-Andalusians that did not successfully cross over to early modern Iberian cuisine. While eggplants, rice, empanadas, and pastries are ubiquitous in recipes that circulated in early modern Iberia—and still immensely popular in modern Spanish cuisine as well, there is one such dish that did not quite make the cut: couscous. Much like the other staple food items in Al-Andalusian cookery, couscous makes a frequent appearance in Hispano-Muslim cooking manuscripts. Ibn Razin even includes five different recipes for couscous in the first section of *Fudalat-al-biwan*, going into excruciating detail to explain the intricate process of making the semolina-based dish.¹⁹⁵ A recipe for couscous does appear in Montañó's *Arte de cocina*, who emulates the attention to detail shown by Ibn Razin and shows no disrespect to its Islamic origins.¹⁹⁶ Despite the approval of Montañó, couscous is nowhere near as apparent in the gastronomy of early modern Iberia—and even less so in modern Spain. Scholars have given various explanations behind this phenomenon, with Inés Eléxpuru stating that couscous' ties with Islam made it fall out of favor whereas Nadeau claims that the complex method of preparation was more the reason than just maurophobia.¹⁹⁷ While Nadeau's argument is more convincing as other foods with heavy Islamic connotations were still enjoyed by early modern "Spaniards", the fact that couscous cannot be visually transformed as easily as foods like eggplants, rice, or pastries lends credence to Eléxpuru's argument to a small extent. In other words, eggplants, rice, and pastries can be modified in a way that does not strictly replicate its Al-Andalusian method of preparation, making it easier for early modern "Spaniards" to detach them from their Islamic connotations. However, since the physical form of couscous cannot be changed even with varying

¹⁹⁵ Ibn Razin, *Relieves de las mesas*, 130-133.

¹⁹⁶ See footnote 91.

¹⁹⁷ See Inés Eléxpuru, *La cocina de Al-Andalus* (Madrid, Spain: Alianza Editorial, 1994), 85 and Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 124.

cooking methods, the difficulty in “de-Islamicizing” the dish could have been what led to its ostracization from the boundaries of an emerging “Spanish” national cuisine.

Moreover, with the newfound notion of “Spanishness” being contingent on Christianity, “Spanish” cuisine in the early modern era naturally reflected the integral role of the Christian religion. This is mostly seen through many cookbooks published in early modern Iberia dedicating a section to foods to be consumed during Lent and partial abstinence days, which account for a significant portion of each cookbook. For instance, the last chapter of Mestre Ruperto’s *Libre de coch*, titled “*Tratado para guisar y aparejar las viandas del tiempo cuaresmal* (Treatise on cooking and preparing food during Lenten time)” accounts for a fifth of the entire text.¹⁹⁸ Granado’s *Libro del arte de cozina* also dedicates around thirty-five pages for two sections on food during Lent,¹⁹⁹ and Hernández de Maceras also has the last two sections—which accounts for eighty pages of his 140 page book—of his *Libro del arte de cocina* dedicated to partial abstinence and full abstinence days.²⁰⁰ Montño is the only author that does not write a section dedicated to Lenten or partial abstinence foods, but that is largely due to his book not being as methodically categorized as the others. In fact, Montño still makes various references in his text to recipes being suitable for consumption on abstinence day, which is referred to as “*dia de pescado* (fish-eating days).”²⁰¹

In addition to the Christian overtones that characterize early modern Iberian cookbooks via referencing Lent, comparing these texts with one another show 17th century authors such as Montño and Hernández de Maceras paid less attention to non-Christian food practices compared to Mestre Ruperto, a 16th century author. In *Libre de coch*, Mestre Ruperto, albeit admitting that he does prefer the Christian method of preparing dishes, demonstrates his sensibility towards other

¹⁹⁸ Mestre Ruperto, *Libre de Coch*, 163-203.

¹⁹⁹ Diego Granado, *Libro del arte de cozina*, 307-342.

²⁰⁰ Hernández de Maceras, *Libro del arte de cocina*, 60-140.

²⁰¹ See Montño, *Arte de Cocina*, 87, 102, 128, 139-140, 221, 228-230, 237, 255-256, 313, 336, 365.

religious groups present in the Peninsula, suggesting various substitutes that Muslims or Jews can use in order to abide by their dietary restrictions.²⁰² Conversely, Granado, Hernández de Maceras, and Montaña, though definitely acknowledging the legacy of Al-Andalusian food culture in early modern Iberian cuisine, do not go to the same extent in proposing substitutes that cater to halal or kosher. The change in language between the latter and the former likely reflects the temporal context, with all Muslims and Moriscos being legally expelled from the Iberian Peninsula by the onset of the 17th century while they were still inhabitants of the Peninsula when Mestre Ruperto wrote *Libre de Coch*. Nonetheless, this change further lends credence to the argument that the acceptance of Islam's culinary legacy on an emerging "Spanish" national cuisine was carried out with an extensive "de-Islamicization" of ingredients and dishes that carried over.

Last but not least, the primacy of pork in early modern Iberian gastronomy further complicates the question of whether the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus was truly appreciated by the newly emerging "Spanish" cuisine. As Nadeau notes in *Food Matters*, the importance of pork in early modern "Spanish cuisine" is represented through the debates and interpretations of the phrase "*duelos y quebrantos*" that appears in *Don Quixote*.²⁰³ Literally translating to "pain and suffering," there have been arguments over whether the phrase represents eggs and lard/bacon or eggs and goat brain. One notable interpretation of the former comes from Américo Castro, who suggested that it represents the pain and suffering of "New Christians" who have to eat pork to indicate the authenticity of their conversion.²⁰⁴ Castro's assessment indicates the significance of pork, not just in terms of its prevalence in the diet of early modern "Spaniards" but also as a political tool in determining those who were authentically "Spanish," or within this context, "Old Christian." This

²⁰² Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 27, 122, 128.

²⁰³ *Ibid.*, 105-109.

²⁰⁴ Américo Castro, "Sentido histórico-literario del jamón y del tocino," in *Cervantes y los casticismos españoles* (Madrid, Spain: Alianza, 1974), in Nadeau, *Food Matters*, 109.

goes hand in hand with the widespread sentiment in early modern Iberia that Muslim and Jewish converts to Christianity, or “New Christians,” remained crypto-Muslims or crypto-Jews (i.e. practicing their original religion in the private sphere while being only nominally Christian).²⁰⁵ The fact that pork could be used to instantly segregate the tastes of Christians from those of Muslims and Jews thus meant that pork was used as a political tool as well as a defining symbol of a “Spanish” culinary identity, and by extension a “Spanish” or “Old Christian” identity. With pork, a culinary representation of “Old Christian” identity, holding primacy in the cuisine of early modern Iberia, Al-Andalusian influences seem to have been less tolerated, than appropriated and stripped of their Islamic origins due to shared tastes.

CONCLUSION

By examining the complex process of how the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus was confronted by early modern Iberians in an age of rising proto-nationalist sentiments this thesis makes a contribution to two distinct fields of scholarship: (1) works on the relationship between food and nationalism and (2) works concerning early modern Spanish history vis-à-vis the presence of Islam in the Peninsula. In doing so, this thesis explained the importance of the rather recent academic practice of using food as a tool to examine the formation of collective identities, and especially the understudied link between food and nationalism. Then, the thesis presented the historical context of early modern Iberia, particularly regarding the conclusion of the Reconquista and attempts at establishing a “Spanish” national identity vis-à-vis the Peninsula’s Muslim/Morisco population. From there, the thesis moved on to a survey of both early modern Iberian and Al-Andalusian culinary texts to establish various food habits, practices, and conventions present or inferred

²⁰⁵ Feros, *Speaking of Spain*, 97.

through such books and manuscripts. This thesis finally outlined a comprehensive analysis of the previous sections to answer how constructions of Spanish national identity vis-à-vis the legacy of Al-Andalus through food was done.

The analysis first demonstrates how many elements of Al-Andalusian cooking and food culture were undoubtedly incorporated into the gastronomy of early modern “Spain.” For one, various elements of Hispano-Muslim cookery that were not just staples but a crucial part of the culinary identity of Muslims in the Iberian Peninsula carried over to the early modern Iberian cuisine. These include ingredients such as eggplants and rice, to dishes and culinary conventions such as empanadas, pastry-making, and looking at the medicinal properties of food as well as establishing sanitary guidelines in the kitchen. However, to say that there was a full acceptance of Al-Andalusian gastronomy and food practices in early modern Iberia based on such evidence would be an incomplete assessment. In fact, difficulties in segregating tastes, the failure of certain Islamic food items (most notably couscous) in gaining popularity in Spain, the emphasis on Christian dietary habits in early modern Iberian cookbooks, and the primacy of pork and its political nature all attest to the fact that the incorporation of Al-Andalusian influences in Iberian cooking was far from a linear process.

Based on these findings, this thesis draws three primary conclusions. The first conclusion, which is the most apparent of the three, deals with the complexities apparent in the construction of a “Spanish” national cuisine, and by extension a “Spanish” national identity, in the early modern period. Particularly focusing on how such a process was carried out vis-à-vis the Muslim legacy that was still visible in the Iberian Peninsula at the time, the relevant evidence points to various difficulties and contradictions in negotiating prevailing social currents of the time and elements of contemporaneous food culture to define a cuisine that was undoubtedly “Spanish.” More

specifically, the pluralistic nature of food that was being consumed in early modern Iberia presented an array of issues that needed to be addressed for the inhabitants of the Peninsula who had begun to express their increasing desire to define what cultural and geographic boundaries were encompassed by nationalist notions such as “Spain,” “Spaniards,” and “Spanishness.” While the scope of this thesis is limited to assessing how the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus reflected on this conundrum, early modern Spaniards would have had to consider Jewish influences as well as the culinary practices of Hispanic domains that were outside the Iberian Peninsula like Naples and Sicily.²⁰⁶ All in all, such matters seem to speak to the more fundamental difficulties at play in establishing connections between the origins of foods belonging to a national cuisine—which are multifaceted and often contentious—and the everyday expressions of national identity to which such foods contribute—which are more uniform and homogenous.

The second conclusion looks at what the findings of this thesis speak to the cuisine of modern Spain, as well as the larger historiography of Spanish nationalism. As for the former, tastes and food habits have obviously changed and evolved over the years and certain dishes that were popular in early modern “Spain” are no longer customary on the dining tables of today’s Spaniards. For instance, large-scale production of meat from domesticated animals due to the advent of factory farming lessened the demand and use of game meat (e.g. pigeons and doves that were often incorporated into recipes seen in Al-Andalusian and early modern Iberian cooking texts). However, as mentioned with *torrijas*, many dishes, and especially those with Islamic origins, that were recognized and prevalent in early modern Iberia remain immensely popular in Spain. The prominence of such foods from *torrijas* to *paella* (which is made with rice—an ingredient introduced

²⁰⁶ Naples and Sicily were ruled by the Crown of Aragon for centuries. See Note 22.

to the Iberian Peninsula by Muslims) goes to show how modern Spanish cuisine still is heavily indebted to the culinary legacy of Muslim Iberia.

As for the larger historiography of Spain and Spanish nationalism, the analytical portion of this thesis in particular comments on the theories and tropes that characterized the discourse of Spanish history. The fact that the cuisine of early modern “Spain” owed much to the culinary legacy of Al-Andalus falls in line with Américo Castro’s idea that the nation of Spain “[embodied] elements of the Islamic and Jewish cultures that it grappled with and internalized.”²⁰⁷ The prominence of Islamic influences in Spanish cuisine also stands in direct contrast to the highly xenophobic bent apparent in the works of historians of Spanish nationalism that were active during and immediately after the Franco regime that emphasized the pure and continuous lineage (based on Catholicism) of Spaniards.²⁰⁸ This was a bastardization of Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz’s ideology that there was an “eternal Spaniard” whose character remained uncompromised by foreign invasions and influences.²⁰⁹ The numerous complexities and contradictions that characterized the gradual incorporation and/or appropriation of Muslim influences into Spanish cuisine, however, speak against the romanticized interpretations of Castro’s theory that often manifests through the notion of *convivencia* (peaceful coexistence between Christians, Jews, and Muslims in the Iberian Peninsula). Ultimately, the crux of this thesis’ argument echoes what has been thoroughly established by the Hispanists of today: that Al-Andalus did leave a lasting cultural imprint on Spain, but the nostalgic idyll of religious tolerance in medieval and early modern Spain is a falsified myth.

The final conclusion is the assertion that the pluralistic construction of national identity through food reveals the rigid and exclusionary way in which the notion of nationalism that has been

²⁰⁷ Catlos, “Christian-Muslim-Jewish Relations,” in *In and Of the Mediterranean*, 2.

²⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, 2-3.

²⁰⁹ *Ibid.*

expressed throughout modern times is historically inaccurate. This thesis primarily concerns the Spanish case, in which the parochial vision of Spanish nationalism propounded by Falangism²¹⁰ that completely disregarded the multiethnic heritage and legacy of the Iberian Peninsula long dominated intellectual discourse despite it being historically inaccurate, particularly in the realm of cuisine. But the use of restrictive nationalist sentiments that contradicts historical legacies is not exclusive to Spain. In fact, this phenomenon has become ever so apparent in the current sociopolitical landscape with the recent backlash to globalization giving rise to nationalist sentiments that are so exclusionary to the extent that they cater to denialism. As a consequence, entire groups of people (particularly ethnic minorities) within nations have been increasingly vilified and marginalized, even in nations where such groups played an integral role in shaping their respective cultural identities. Having taken all of this into consideration, this thesis ends with the hope that by bringing visibility to the pluralistic constructions of national identity through the case study of Islamic influences in early modern Iberian food culture, it will make a small contribution to the difficult task of dissociating nationalism from the exclusion and historical inaccuracy that are rampant in its expression today.

²¹⁰ The political ideology behind Francisco Franco's far-right authoritarian regime. See Stanley G. Payne, *Fascism in Spain: 1923-1977* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1999) for more on Falangism.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources:

De Nola, Ruperto, *Libro de guisados (Llibre del coch)*. Toledo, Spain: 1525.

Granado, Diego. *Libro del arte de cocina*. Madrid, Spain: Luis Manescal, 1614.

Hernández de Maceras, Domingo. *Libro del arte de cocina: En el cual se contiene el modo de guisar de comer en cualquier tiempo, así de carne, como de pescado, para sanos, y enfermos, y convalecientes; así de pasteles, tortas, y salsas, como de conservas, y de principios, como de pos, a la usanza Española de nuestro tiempo*. Salamanca, Spain: Antonia Ramírez, 1607.

Kitab al tabikh fi-l-Maghrib wa-l-Andalus fi `asr al-Muwabbidin, limu'allif majbul (The Book of Cooking in Maghreb and Andalus in the era of Almohads). Translated by Charles Perry.

http://www.daviddfriedman.com/Medieval/Cookbooks/Andalusian/andalusian_contents.htm.

Martínez Montaña, Francisco. *Arte de cocina, pastelería, vizcochería y conservería*. Madrid, Spain: Luis Sánchez, 1611.

Razin al-Tuyibi, Ibn. *Relieves de las mesas, acerca de las delicias de la comida y los diferentes platos*. Edited and translated by Manuela Marín. Gijón, Spain: Ediciones Trea, 2007.

Scappi, Bartolomeo. *The Opera of Bartolomeo Scappi (1570)*. Translated by Terrence Scully. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press, 2008.

The Book of Sent Sovi: Medieval Recipes from Catalonia (Llibre de Sent Sovi). Edited by Joan Santanach. Translated by Robin Vogelzang. Suffolk, UK/Rochester, NY: Tamesis Books, 2008.

Secondary Sources:

Albala, Ken. *Food in Early Modern Europe (Food through History)*. Santa Barbara, CA: Greenwood, 2003.

- Álvarez-Junco, José. *Spanish Identity in the Age of Nations*. Manchester, UK: Manchester University Press, 2001.
- Amelang, James S. "Early Modern Spanish Cultural History: One Opinion." In *History Compass* Vol. 4. No. 1 (2006). 165-171.
- Billig, Michael. *Banal Nationalism*. London: SAGE Publications, 1995.
- Campbell, Jodi. *At the First Table: Food and Social Identity in Early Modern Spain*. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 2017.
- Capel, José Carlos. *La gula en el siglo de oro*. San Sebastián, Spain: R & B Ediciones, 1996.
- Castro, Américo. "Sentido histórico-literario del jamón y del tocino." In *Cervantes y los casticismos españoles*. Madrid, Spain: Alianza, 1974. 25-32.
- Chamorro Fernández, María Inés. *Gastronomía del Siglo de Oro español*. Barcelona, Spain: Herder, 2002.
- Claflin, Kyri and Peter Scholliers. *Writing Food History: A Global Perspective*. London, UK: Berg Publishers, 2013.
- Cook, Karoline P. *Forbidden Passages: Muslims and Moriscos in Colonial Spanish America*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2016.
- Cowans, John. *Early Modern Spain: A Documentary History*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003.
- Díaz Sánchez, Lorenzo. *La cocina del barroco: la gastronomía del Siglo de Oro en Lope, Cervantes y Quevedo*. Madrid, Spain: Alianza, 2005.
- Eigeland, Tor. "The Cuisine of Al-Andalus." In *Aramco World* Vol. 40. No. 5 (1989). 28-35.
<https://archive.aramcoworld.com/issue/198905/the.cuisine.of.al-andalus.htm>

El libro de la cocina española : gastronomía e historia. Edited by Néstor Luján, Joan Perucho, Juan Cabañé Felisart, and Alejandro Doménech. Barcelona: Danae D.L., 1977.

Eléxpuru, Inés. *La cocina de Al-Andalus.* Madrid, Spain: Alianza Editorial, 1994.

Feros, Antonio. *Speaking of Spain: The Evolution of Race and Nation in the Hispanic World.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2017.

Fuchs, Barbara. *Exotic Nation: Maurophilia and the Construction of Early Modern Spain.* Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009.

García-Arenal, Mercedes and Gerard A. Wiegers. *The Expulsion of the Moriscos from Spain: A Mediterranean Diaspora.* Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2014.

García Sánchez, Expiración. “La Gastronomía Andalusí.” In *El zoco: vida económica y artes tradicionales en Al-Andalus y Marruecos.* Edited by Vicente Salvatierra. Madrid, Spain: Lunwerg, 1995. 49-57.

Granja Santamaría, Fernando de la. *La cocina árabe-andaluza según un manuscrito inédito.* Madrid, Spain: Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, 1960.

A History of Jewish-Muslim Relations, From Their Origins to the Present Day. Edited by Abdelwahab Meddeb and Benjamin Stora. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2013.

Ichijo, Atsuko and Ronald Ranta. *Food, National Identity, and Nationalism: From Everyday to Global Politics.* Basingstoke, Hampshire, UK: Palgrave MacMillan, 2016.

In and Of the Mediterranean: Medieval and Early modern Iberian Studies. Edited by Michelle M. Hamilton and Núria Silleras-Fernández. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press, 2015.

La Parra López, Santiago. “Las comidas y los ayunos de los Moriscos: Datos para una convivencia en el ducado de Gandía.” In *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez* Vol. 47. No. 1 (2017). 233-253.

Martínez Enamorado, Virgilio. “Paladares de Príncipes, Recetas Cortesanas, Comidas de Campesinos, Valoraciones en Torno a la Alimentación de los Andalusíes.” Chapter in *Comer en Ceuta en el siglo XIV: La Alimentación durante la Época Mariní*. Edited by José Manuel Hita Ruiz, José Suárez Padilla, and Fernando Villada Paredes. Ceuta, Spain: Museo de Ceuta, 2009. 65-99.

Martínez Lopis, Manuel. *Historia de la Gastronomía Española*. Barcelona, Spain: Altaya, 1998.

Martínez, María Elena. *Genealogical Fictions: Limpieza de Sangre, Religion, and Gender in Colonial Mexico*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2008.

Nadeau, Carolyn A. “Early Modern Spanish Cookbooks: The Curious Case of Diego Granado.” Contribution in *Food and Language: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium of Food and Cookery*. Edited by Richard Hosking. London: Prospect Books, 2010.

Nadeau, Carolyn A. *Food Matters: Alonso Quijano’s Diet and the Discourse of Early Modern Food in Spain*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016.

Novikoff, Alex. “Between Tolerance and Intolerance in Medieval Spain: A Historiographic Enigma.” *Medieval Encounters* Vol. 11. No. 1-2 (2005), 7-36.

Opie, Frederick Douglass. *Hog and Hominy: Soul Food from Africa to America*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2008.

Payne, Stanley G. *Fascism in Spain: 1923-1977*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1999.

Pérez Samper, María de los Ángeles. *La alimentación en la España del Siglo de Oro*. Huesca, Spain: La Val de Onsera, 1998.

Perry, Mary Elizabeth. *The Handless Maiden: Moriscos and the Politics of Religion in Early Modern Spain*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2007.

Sánchez Meco, Gregorio and Armando Jiménez Tejedor. *El arte de la cocina en tiempos de Felipe II*. El Escorial, Madrid, Spain: Ayuntamiento de El Escorial, 1998.

Sonenshine, Tara, Paul Rockower, Sam Chapple-Sokol, and Gary Weaver. In *Culinary Diplomacy, Gastrodiplomacy, and Conflict Cuisine: Defining the Field*. Washington D.C.: Stimson Center, 2016. 9-11.

Strugar, Tanja. "Eastern Gastrodiplomatic Efforts: Asian Nations as Pioneers in the Use of Cuisine in Cultural Diplomacy." In *Art of Food: Culture and Food Diversity, Gastrodiplomacy*. Barcelona, Spain: International Institute of Gastronomy, Culture, Arts, and Tourism, 2015. 29-33.

Tanner, Jakob. "The Arts of Cooking: Modern Times and the Dynamics of Tradition." In *Changing Tastes: Food Culture and the Processes of Industrialization: Proceedings of the 14th Conference of the International Commission on Ethnological Food Research, Basel and Vevey, Switzerland, 30 September-6 October 2002*. Edited by Patricia Lysaght and Christine Burckhardt-Seebass. Basel, Switzerland: Schweizerische Gesellschaft für Volkskunde, 2002. 18-32.

"The Spanish Saffron Industry." In *Journal of the Royal Society of Arts* Vol. 61. No. 3166 (1913). 844-846.

Vaquerizo Gil, Desiderio. "La Alimentación en Al-Andalus a Partir del Registro Arqueofaunístico. Estado de las Cuestion." In *Lucentum* Vol. 36 (2017), 341-358.

Waines, David. "The Culinary Culture of Al-Andalus." In *The Legacy of Muslim Spain*. Edited by Salma Khadra Jayyusi. Leiden, Netherlands: E.J. Brill, 1992. 725-738.