Transforming Khayelitsha: Space, Security, and Problems of Structural Reform in Cape Town, South Africa

Isabella Gross

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Bachelor of Arts in the major Growth and Structure of Cities Bryn Mawr College

December 2018
Abstract

Over the two decades since the end of the Apartheid regime in 1994, Cape Town’s cityscape has scarcely changed; little has been done to transform urban space. Hence, the city still exhibits deeply rooted separation, crime and violence, and inequality. These on going problems, however, can be addressed through urban upgrading and development. In this paper, I discuss space, security, and problems in structural reform in Cape Town’s largest black township, Khayelitsha. Building on relevant ethnography, theory, and case studies, I argue that urban upgrading must be approached as a process of transformation, with limited relocation to bring the quality of life of residents to more equitable standards. I find urban upgrading can only be successful once the local reality of the space is understood (i.e. levels of crime and violence and informal networks). Going forward, urban planners can learn from past upgrading failures and put planning theory into practice to achieve successful implementations of development.
Acknowledgements

Firstly, I’d like to thank the Department of Growth and Structure of Cities at Bryn Mawr College for offering a compelling, interdisciplinary major. Within the department I would like to especially thank Gary McDonogh for being an advisor, professor, and mentor throughout my time at Haverford College. In addition, I would like to thank Min Lee and Lauren Restrepo for providing additional guidance and support while writing my thesis.

A special mention goes out to Kelly Moult, my professor at University of Cape Town. Her course, “Crime and Deviance in South African Cities”, inspired several parts of my thesis.

I would also like to thank my Senior Seminar class, who readily engaged in my thesis process and constantly provided constructive feedback. In addition, a special gratitude goes out to my reading group who shared extensive comments on my first draft. A final thank you to all my friends and family for the constant encouragement through my writing process.

Thank you all for your support and guidance!
# Table of Contents

## Table of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table of Figures</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Introduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Informality</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Literature and Methods</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 1 – Space

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 1 – Space</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Life in Khayelitsha</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Khayelitsha as Place of Danger</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Concluding Thoughts</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 2 – Security

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 2 – Security</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Policing in Khayelitsha</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Environmental Criminology and Spatial Ecology</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Redefining Criminology</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Concluding Thoughts</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 3 – Structural Reform: Failed Urban Upgrading Initiatives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 3 – Structural Reform: Failed Urban Upgrading Initiatives</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Women in New Rest and Makhaza</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Case of Khayelitsha</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 4 – Structural Reform: Future Urban Planning and Development Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 4 – Structural Reform: Future Urban Planning and Development Practices</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Cape Town’s Spatial Framework</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Methods, Rationalities, and Informality</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Technology in the Gauteng Province</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Concluding Thoughts</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Conclusion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conclusion</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Bibliography

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bibliography</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Figures

**Figure 0.1:** Picture from *The Beautiful Struggle: Street Attitude from South Africa’s Townships*.................................10

**Figure 1.1:** Socio-Economic Index, City of Cape Town 2011.................................17

**Figure 1.2:** Picture from *Times Live* (Second-biggest newspaper in South Africa)..........................................................................................................................24

**Figure 1.3:** Picture from *The Beautiful Struggle: Street Attitude from South Africa’s Townships*.................................................................24

**Figure 1.4:** Picture from *The Beautiful Struggle: Street Attitude from South Africa’s Townships*.................................................................28

**Figure 1.5:** Reported murder stats by police districts 2007/2008.........................31

**Figure 2.1:** (Left) Map of Cape Town depicting locations of informal housing. (Right) Map of Cape Town presenting murder rates by Police precinct.........................44

**Figure 5.1:** “Municipal Spatial Development Framework” by City of Cape Town.....69
Introduction

Urban environments offer the opportunity for people with various backgrounds to live together. At the same time, living in a city can amplify the many differences between the people living closely to one another, as seen in Cape Town, South Africa. The post-apartheid inhabitants of Cape Town do not confront the inequality of the past, and people navigate the social and physical spaces representing apartheid’s legacy every day. Anthropologist Catherine Besteman claims South Africa is composed of two nations: one white and wealthy, the other black and poor. To elaborate on this claim, Besteman borrows journalist and political commentator Allister Sparks’ image of a double decker bus that lacks a stairway between a wealthy multiracial upper deck and an increasingly impoverished black lower deck. From 1948 to 1994, Apartheid created deeply divided socio-economic structures reified in physical separations of people and the city by race that still prevail today, keeping the poor and wealthy very isolated from one another while amplifying the problems of the poor. There is a need for a shift of focus onto the deeper structures and inequalities created by the apartheid regime in order to address the ongoing issues of inadequate living conditions and high levels of crime and violence in South Africa’s informal settlements.

After the end of the Apartheid regime in 1994, Cape Town citizens sought to change from being a metropolitan area of state-enforced racial segregation and inequality to one of multiculturalism and equal citizenship. However, these promises made by government leaders did not come to fruition and the city still

---

remains a product of Apartheid, continuing to be segregated today. People live with and among others like them because this became a norm under Apartheid and is something that is deeply rooted in Cape Town’s cityscape. This is due to a lack of focus on transforming institutions, housing, and transportation into being accessible to all, for the chance could simply create a more equitable urban landscape. Those who were exposed to lower quality infrastructure and resources still remain trapped in a place at the bottom of society and those who lived comfortably during Apartheid continue to do so today.

The inheritance of urban space serves as a reflection of Apartheid’s legacy. The Group Areas Act of 1950 allowed municipal authorities to relocate millions of non-whites to separate townships on the outskirts of the city. “The way one moves through and experiences Cape Town has everything to do with where one was placed during the massive urban geography campaign engineered by the Group Areas Act of 1950”\(^2\). The intentional apartheid policies created white neighborhoods with plenty of sustainable, well-serviced housing, and black neighborhoods with overcrowded, low quality housing that resulted in the necessary expansions of squatter and informal settlements. As evidenced by the lack of development initiatives, the government shows little motivation to speed up the slow residential desegregation process, very much keeping the legacies of apartheid a part of daily life.

The end of state-enforced separation did not result in the redistribution of resources. Gaps within society have remained wide causing the most pressing post-

\(^2\) Besteman, Catherine. 47.
apartheid issue to become poverty, not reconciliation. The apartheid regime deliberately produced inequality and perceived the resulting poverty as unfortunate, but inevitable. This racial segregation turned into the formation of deep class divides masked by race and space. Thus, simply de-racializing the system has had a limited effect because the state has neglected directed economic restructuring needed to target class divides. This restructuring demands transformations of space to create more access and equity across the Cape Town metropolitan area.

**I. Informality**

The lack of economic restructuring is especially exemplified in the informal settlements present in various parts of the city. Anton Harber in his book about a township in Johannesburg, *Diepsloot*, provides a description of the conditions of townships/informal settlements that is applicable across the South African landscape. He writes,

“You have come face to face with the hard reality of South African poverty: a dense forest of shacks, crowds of unemployed people milling on the streets, and attempts by some at small-scale commerce in makeshift shops. Men cluster in groups, throwing dice or playing cards. The place has the dull metal glow of aging zinc housing, the chaos of unpaved roads, the noise of a life lived in packed public areas, the smoke of smouldering braziers and the stench of sewage spilling into the streets”.

The rise of informal settlement living was a direct result of the Group Areas Act of 1950 because there was not enough housing available to the black population sent to the city’s peripheries. Spaces officially designated to black populations

---

during the Apartheid are called townships, which include informal settlements. Informal settlements are usually illegal occupations of and constructions on vacant land with elusive owners. Little has changed, as the informal settlements continue to exhibit low-quality infrastructure, lack of access to water and drainage, and limited or unreliable electricity. Although race plays a role in forced living location, the more pressing issue brought up by the housing conditions is class. This lower class population is now stuck and burdened by a lack of resources, education, employment, and development. This lifestyle promotes other forms of survival like building an informal economy and/or resorting to crime and violence.

Informal businesses and markets in the settlements dominate the job market. Figure 0.1 showcases an example of what these informal businesses look like. Many businesses consist of women setting up a small stand on the street to sell their goods.

---

5 Besteman, Catherine.
This aspect of living in informality is functional without government involvement. These systems of survival have with time become entrenched into the local realities of the informal sector. At the same time, due to the high crime and violence rates resulting from poverty and other spatial ecological factors, various informal systems of security have been produced, utilizing the unique spatial framework of the informal settlements. Spatial ecological factors include a broad spectrum of local realities such as limited access to education and violence in the home. This is a topic I will discuss in more depth later on. The creation of informal businesses and security systems is a survival mechanism, but has created a strong sense of community and livelihood within townships and informal settlements over

---

time. However, these systems only allow residents to get by, still keeping
opportunities like employment and education difficult to attain. Khayelitsha, a
township in Cape Town containing informal settlements, exhibits the characteristics
mentioned above. Khayelitsha is the primary case study of this paper and will be
introduced and discussed further in Chapter 1.

Within this framework, organizations and institutions trying to aid in the
urban upgrading and development of these living areas must being with their local
realities and complex informal nature. This paper focuses on how urban upgrading,
as a process, can be used most efficiently going forward in order to bring about
positive changes such as improved living conditions and decreased crime and
violence in the Khayelitsha township and the City of Cape Town. The tool of urban
upgrading is very powerful, but has been underutilized and implemented
incorrectly in the past. Urban planners and developers have attempted to
implement western and formal planning schemes that could work in developed
cities, but do not fit the mold of Cape Town’s unique spatial framework. Therefore,
initiatives to improving living conditions and safety concerns have not been
successful. The upgrading of infrastructure and facilities has been surface level (i.e.
physical upgrades, like added water stations, that do not have long term
developmental impacts) and the projects targeting crime prevention have in many
cases done more harm than good.

Therefore I ask the question, how are space, security, and structural reform
pertinent to improving urban upgrading initiatives in the township of Khayelitsha? I
argue that, in order to address these ongoing issues, urban upgrading in the
township needs to be seen as urban renewal through a process of transformation with limited relocation to bring the quality of life to more equitable standards. The key aspects of my argument are transformation, limited relocation, and equitable standards. Transformation refers to the development and upgrading of a space targeting quality of infrastructure, residents' needs, and local realities. Limited relocation emphasizes the fact that the focus should be on the current residents of the space and the upgrading of their livelihoods. Finally, equitable standards call for the integration of upgraded spaces into the rest of the metropolitan area through accessible networks of resources like transportation, employment, and education.

II. Literature and Methods

To preface how I approach this thesis it is important to mention my personal ties to the city of Cape Town and the topic of urban upgrading and development. Throughout my university studies, I have explored the topic of the development of urban spaces especially in the developing world. To add to my knowledge on this topic, I chose to study abroad in Cape Town in the spring semester of 2019. I was interested to see for myself how starkly the legacy of Apartheid lives on in the city and was not surprised to discover its strong relevance in today's Cape Town. By combining my coursework at University of Cape Town and my experiences living in and visiting various parts of the city, I was able to grasp a good understanding of the dynamics between history, space, and people. This first hand experience informed my understanding and application of literature on the topic. While I am no expert or
native of Cape Town, living there for five months allowed me to generally familiarize myself with the topics discussed in this paper.

This paper will focus particularly on Khayelitsha’s spatial framework, crime and violence, and urban upgrading going forward and is broken down into three domains - space, security, and structural reform. I will explain my methodological approach and introduce three prominent sources that informed my writing in each of the three sections.

By addressing crime and violence and the infrastructure of Khayelitsha, I argue that urban upgrading in the township needs to be seen as urban renewal through a process of transformation with limited relocation to bring the quality of life to more equitable standards. I will break down this paper into three broad subsections. The first will focus on the formation of space in and around Khayelitsha, describing the life and culture of the township. The next subsection highlights security both in Khayelitsha and in South Africa. I will be analyzing crime theory and proving how it is similar to urban upgrading theory. Finally, the last subsection discusses structural reform and is divided into two sections; failed structural reform and future structural reform. The first sub-sub-section focuses on past, failed urban upgrading initiatives while the second presents urban planning theory for future developmental use. Space, security, and structure are highly interrelated in an urban landscape and must all be taken into account when implementing successful urban upgrading initiatives.

Catherine Besteman’s ethnography, *Transforming Cape Town*, is vital when trying to understand the Cape Town landscape and it’s history. This source allowed
me to understand the space of Khayelitsha and its unique structure and networks. Besteman throughout the book explores various areas of Cape Town and interacts with people representing all levels of socio-economic status. Therefore, she presents a well-rounded narrative of the diversity that exists within the rather small Cape Town metropolitan area. Besteman provides unique insights from the different groups of people she surrounded herself with during her time in Cape Town, which makes her ethnography so valuable and holistic. She focuses on the theme of transformation in post-apartheid Cape Town, but realizes that a majority of residents do not feel like there has been much progress. This ethnography was vital in my understanding about the relationships between various groups and neighborhoods in Cape Town and gave me important background in order to place Khayelitsha within the Cape Town framework.

Criminologist Bill Dixon’s article, “Making Further Inquiries: Policing in Context in Brixton and Khayelitsha” (2015), is particularly helpful in understanding the how crime is generally responded to in South Africa. This allows us to better understand how Khayelitsha’s police force interacts with the community and how it should change moving forward. Dixon is of the opinion that there is no hope that governments will change their economic and social policies to address crime. Although it is true that government forces in South Africa have turned a blind eye towards issues relating to grand scale economic and social restructuring, he argues there is a dire need for the government to come around to the long-term benefits of a deeper investigation of poverty, crime, and violence. Hence, if the government were made explicitly aware and given concrete options for reform moving forward
there would be a chance for change. At the moment, according to Dixon, the problem lies in the fact that the government is mostly ignoring the many issues surrounding deep inequality, township living conditions, and crime and violence. The approach the government takes in addressing crime and violence is similar to the way it handles urban upgrading. In order to achieve urban upgrading and decrease crime and violence the government must adopt Dixon’s suggestions.

A prominent piece of writing pertaining the structural reform aspect of this paper is the article, “Competing rationalities and informal settlement upgrading in Cape Town, South Africa: a recipe for failure” by Ruth Massey. She focuses on the differing rationalities between informal settlement residents and those trying to implement upgrading initiatives for them. Massey argues that the rationalities of both sides need to be taken into account when planning a development project, but this did not occur in the case studies she shares. The case studies focus on women in two informal settlements who built vital social networks in their neighborhoods. These networks contain social, economic, cultural, and security opportunities for residents in the settlements, but were destroyed by upgrading initiatives. This case study points out a failed urban upgrading initiative and provides insight on how upgrading needs to be approached going forward. This is addresses both sides of my section on structural reform.
Chapter 1 - Space

Khayelitsha is Cape Town’s largest township with a population of half a million people. Located on the outskirts of the city in the south east, it has not only been separated from the city physically but also socially, economically, and politically. Figure 1, a map form the *Municipal Spatial Development Framework*, is a good representation of how Khayelitsha compares to the rest of Cape Town. As seen in Figure 1.1, Khayelitsha is located far from the Cape Town Central Business District (CBD) (about one hour away by car with limited traffic and an hour and a half to two hours away via public transport) and has a low overall socio-economic index based on census data from 2011. Khayelitsha predominantly falls under the “very needy”, “needy”, and “average” classifications. In addition, it is this map makes it clear that Khayelitsha and its surrounding areas are overall the “neediest” parts of the city.
Figure 1.1: Socio-Economic Index, City of Cape Town 2011.

Khayelitsha is not visited by many non-inhabitants and is generally portrayed as a place of danger, disease, and poverty. The reasons for the current state of Khayelitsha can be explained by the physical relocation of black South Africans during the Apartheid regime. However, it is becoming increasingly difficult

---

to blame the sub-standard quality of life in Khayelitsha on the Apartheid, which ended over two decades ago. There have been few successful upgrading initiatives, but the township receives next to nothing in terms of resources investments.

Although Khayelitsha is doing better than it did immediately after the end of Apartheid, there are still major deterrents in the township that increase the need for social and economic development and upgrading. This chapter aims to provide a vivid picture of the space of Khayelitsha through narrative accounts, descriptions, and facts. In addition, I explain how the space relates to the topics of security (crime and violence) and structural reform.

A prominent reason for the lack of both domestic and international foreigner foot traffic in the streets of Khayelitsha is the representations of the township in mass media outlets. Khayelitsha, like many townships and informal settlements, is given negative press about its dangers and will therefore not be frequented by visitors. However, the multilayered neglect that Khayelitsha receives comes not only from the government, but also from the rest of Cape Town, which further subordinates this populous part of Cape Town. I will present various representations of Khayelitsha from different ethnographic, documentary, and news outlets. These give an overview on how Khayelitsha is seen by the general public and I explain why it is a limited way of seeing the vibrant township.

I. Life In Khayelitsha

Renée C. Fox, a faculty member of the Sociology Department at the University of Pennsylvania, who specializes on topics of sociology of medicine, medical
research, and medical ethics. To complement her research, she has conducted fieldwork in various countries across the world, one of them being South Africa. Fox shares a vivid presentation of the township, as she travelled to Khayelitsha to conduct ethnographic research for her book, *Doctors Without Borders: Humanitarian Quests, Impossible Dreams of Médecins Sans Frontières*. She writes about her impressions of approaching the township:

“The highway along which one drives to Khayelitsha is splendidly paved... Nothing prepares you for the world you enter when your car crosses an overpass and turns into the streets of the township. The fact that these labyrinthine streets, like the highway, are smoothly paved seems incongruous—even ironic—in this crowded, poverty-stricken universe of corrugated iron shacks, most of which are without running water or electricity. Nevertheless, Khayelitsha pulsates with vigorous activity. During the daylight hours, an unending procession of women, men, and children move swiftly and gracefully through its streets. Interspersed with all the people on foot are individuals riding bicycles, an occasional bus, and numerous cars that serve as taxis in this area where public transportation is scarce. The township contains schools, medical clinics, shops (many of them housed in shacks that are labeled with crudely painted, often amusing, promotional signs), an array of open-air stalls from which food and other merchandise is sold, a supermarket that does not seem to be operating, and a large number of churches and funeral parlors”

Here, Fox emphasizes the visible inequality that exists in Cape Town when mentioning the sudden emergence of large informal settlements along nicely paved highways. However, she provides a description that portrays Khayelitsha beyond the initial sight of poverty and vulnerability. Although she later addresses the experiences of hardships and limitations of the Médecins Sans Frontières workers in Khayelitsha, she shines a positive light on life in Khayelitsha. I personally have a similar view as Fox from my memory of walking through Khayelitsha. Even after

---

being in Cape Town for several months the sudden appearance of townships and informal settlements a few minutes away from thriving suburbs was shocking every time. However, after walking through the bustling streets and speaking with inhabitants, it seems as though Khayelitsha is the more enticing place to live. There is a constant stream of music, food smells, and chatter in the air. The lack of uniformity makes walking through the township an intriguing guessing game of attempting to predict what you will encounter around the corner. Khayelitsha makes the suburbs seem bleak, predictable, and simply not exciting. However, living in Khayelitsha comes with unpredictable and often dangerous circumstances that many would give up for a life in the neighboring suburbs. Since this is not an option for most, it is time Khayelitsha receives attention and is transformed into a place that can proudly share its positive attributes with the greater Cape Town metropolitan area.

Cape Town Tourism, the city’s official regional tourism organization, created the “Love Cape Town Neighborhood Series” featuring several 4-6 minute videos about various neighborhoods in Cape Town. Their video of Khayelitsha, even more than Fox’s description, focuses a positive light on the township featuring picturesque cinematography and engaging, friendly locals.

The video introduces a theme of misrepresentation as a man speaks about Khayelitsha being a very special place to him despite the negative media portrayals. Hence, it is clear that the idea of the video is to create a new representation of the township for a tourist audience. The first story highlighted in the film is that of an
artisanal coffee shop called, The Department of Coffee. Since opening in 2012, the goal of the business has been to bring a coffee culture to the township. The business partner, Wongama Balani, illustrates the coffee shop’s success through its ability to raise the prices of their coffee while retaining the same customer count. As a feature in this video, the coffee shop will attract tourists who are always looking for a coffee stop in between sightseeing. It also shows the existence of commerce similar to that expected in other parts of Cape Town, normalizing the life of the township.

Next, we get a glimpse of the 18 Gangster Museum in Khayelitsha and hear about it from the founder, Wandisile Nqeketho. He explains that the small museum is split into two sections – one showcasing the dark side of being involved in gangsterism and its potential outcome, and another exhibiting why avoiding gang activity can positively impact your life. Again, this museum is for both tourist and local audiences, which is possible because the purchase of one tourist ticket allows two young children to visit the museum free of charge. The idea is that while making the museum an interesting tourist attraction that offers information on a different side of Khayelitsha, it also serves as an education center for locals, especially youths, in an effort to decrease gang activity in the township. In addition, the museum employs ex-gangsters and prisoners to share their experiences, adding to the limited employment opportunities in the township.

Continuing the trend of highlighting local businesses, the video introduces us to Lungi’s B&B, a bed and breakfast that mostly houses foreign tourists. Lungi speaks about the tourists being surprised that their experience in Khayelitsha

---

exceeded their expectations. She cooks for her guests and takes them on tours through the township in order allow tourists to comfortably explore Khayelitsha. The availability of guided tours makes the township much more accessible to tourists, allowing them to create their own visuals of what life in a township is actually like, while feeling secure and less obtrusive. This helps alleviate the negative press while the positive attention might allow for more social, economic, and political investment in things like infrastructure or education, to give a couple of examples. The video ends with a message of hope and possibility regarding the future of Khayelitsha and its many businesses and people. Throughout the video viewers are lured into contemplating a visit, but more importantly the video establishes Khayelitsha as an up and coming neighborhood in Cape Town that will one day become an important destination.

A BBC World Short Film\textsuperscript{10}, another visual film about Khayelitsha, follows a journalist, Paul Martin, through the township as he interviews various locals. Although the documentary is uncomfortable at times because Martin displays moments of paternalism and even ignorance from his very limited knowledge of township life, a portion of the short film highlights the sense of community that is built among informal settlement living. Bongi, a Khayelitsha inhabitant and mother of three, speaks about the sense of community spirit she feels around her in the township and the importance of knowing your neighbors. This, she says, is vital for the spreading of information and for security purposes. In addition, a prominent part of the film shows Martin was walking the streets of Khayelitsha with Mboulelo,

a shebeen (social/pub space) owner. When Martin calls the homes shacks instead of houses, Mbouleo gets very upset and shares that he feels undermined when people call the homes “shacks”.

By analyzing these descriptions from books and depictions on film, it is clear that those who work with the image of Khayelitsha are trying to find a balance between showcasing the local reality while moving away from drowning the township in negative images. Figure 1.2 shows the vastness of the township of Khayelitsha showcasing an informal sector characterized by the infrastructure of the houses cramped closely together. Figure 1.3 gives a close up view of the structure of houses present in Khayelitsha’s informal settlements showcasing houses piled onto one another and narrow through streets.
Figure 1.2: Picture from *Times Live* (Second-biggest newspaper in South Africa)\(^\text{11}\)

Figure 1.3: Picture from *The Beautiful Struggle: Street Attitude from South Africa's Townships*\(^\text{12}\).


\(^{12}\) Per Englund. 90-91.
II. Khayelitsha as a Place of Danger

Although the positive representations are a step in the right direction, statistics about inhabitants of Khayelitsha convey the problems with a new and improved image. The township was formed out of the government’s desperate need for housing for black South Africans in 1983, however land allocation and housing came nowhere near the expectations of the people\(^\text{13}\). Half a million people live in the township, of these, over half of them live in informal settlements. 98.7% of the inhabitants identify as black/African, over a quarter of the population is under 15 years old, and the average years of schooling is nine. Over 50% of men 23 and under are unemployed\(^\text{14}\).

Statistics from a case study done on upgrading initiatives in Monwabisi Park\(^\text{15}\), a neighborhood within Khayelitsha, allow us to gain a better sense of general trends in Khayelitsha. The reported statistics come from a group of 60 inhabitants of different genders, ages, and statuses within the informal settlement. Monwabisi Park only makes up one tenth of the total informal dwellings in Khayelitsha; 99% of its residents are black South Africans similar to the rest of Khayelitsha.

One-fifth of the households in Monwabisi Park reported no income, 84% of households live below the poverty line, and the unemployment rate is around 40%. In terms of infrastructure, in 2009 the ratio was 1 water tap to 42 households (the minimum ratio should be 1:25). Regarding toilets in 2009, the ratio was 1 toilet to

\(^\text{13}\) Besteman, Catherine. *Transforming Cape Town*, 48.
23 households (the minimum ratio should be 1:5), but only 27% of people reported using them while 60% reported using nearby bushes instead. Only 54% of the settlement is accessible to emergency vehicles due to the narrow streets. Moreover, the houses are often located below ground level causing major flooding problems reported by more than 50%. Monwanbisi Park is a microcosm of the whole township of Khayelitsha and creates a clear picture of the basic infrastructural disadvantages posed to the inhabitants every day. Under these living conditions people do not live stress free, glamorous lives and in some cases must go to extremes just to survive. The stories of Sifiso and Mandla, to which I now turn, showcase the hardships and criminal choices many like them have made as a result.

Elrena Van Der Spuy's and Adam Armstrong's article, “Policing of an urban periphery: The case of Khayelitsha” (2014) shines a light on the levels of crime and violence, feelings of fear, and lack of safety in Khayelitsha. According to submissions from complainant organizations and research experts, residents of Khayelitsha are exposed to high levels of interpersonal violence. Crime data also labels Khayelitsha as a crime ‘hotspot’ (referring to its heightened occurrence) with high rates of murder, assault, robbery, and sexual assault16. Since crime and violence are prominent aspects of the Khayelitsha community, youth are exposed to and in many cases, part-take in criminal activity from a very young age. Many crime victim surveys report high levels of fear and low levels of trust in the police, which are common factors that exacerbate crime. Community witness, Sifiso Zitwana, contextualizes this by sharing his experiences with the unsafe streets:

“...without living there they will not know what it feels like. Living in an informal settlement area, a place without lights, which is dark at night where sometimes you have to go and relieve yourself in the bushes. Sometimes you have to go and get water from a different street which is not your street. That is also not safe. Also, growing up in my community seeing people die or people getting assaulted until they die while you are young, those are the issues I’m talking about”\textsuperscript{17}.

These are some every day fears that residents of Khayelitsha face and must accept as a part of life there. Although within Sisifo’s anecdote it is easy to identify simple solutions such as added lighting, more toilet and water infrastructure, Khayelitsha’s criminal activity is so deeply rooted within its community that even when those basic necessities are added, the high levels of crime and violence will persist.

Many residents of Khayelitsha, like others living under similar conditions, have adopted a survival mindset that is very short-term and often involves criminal activity. Figure 1.4 exemplifies this attitude as young men from Khayelitsha pose in front of a structure with the phrase, “Get rich or die trying” painted on the front. This is a common mindset that prompts youths into choosing life paths in criminality.

\textsuperscript{17} Van der Spuy, Elrena, and Adam Armstrong. 384.
There is a perpetual cycle and passing down of this mindset that corrupts youth before they’re even old enough to make long-term decisions about their future. Living in a place like Khayelitsha forces residents to make tough decisions about their path to success. The already high levels of crime and violence make the criminal path of survival very inviting especially with the lack of resources in educational institutions and the high unemployment rates. The story of Mandla, although he is not from Khayelitsha, touches on key factors in his life leading him to become a criminal and remains relevant in the context of Khayelitsha. Themes like the absence of a father, being surrounded by crime, experiencing loss, violence at

---

18 Per Englund, 40-41.
home, and living in poverty are not only part of Mandla’s story, but also a part of the lives of a majority of the boys and men involved in crime in Khayelitsha.

Mandla grew up in Orlando, Soweto a township in the Gauteng Province with high levels of gang activity. He was one of three siblings who each had different fathers, and he personally had no contact to his own. While Mandla was in jail, one of his siblings died young from HIV/AIDS. Throughout his life he felt lost without a father figure and was unsure about his ability to achieve success as a man. This caused tensions with his mother because Mandla demanded more information about his father as his mother refused. In addition, he experienced violence within his family and at 14 ran away and stopped attending school, despite stating that he initially really enjoyed school. Soon after, he began his involvement in crime in order to get money because he had no other means of doing so. He formed a group of friends who committed crime together in order to outnumber victims. He was arrested for the first time at the age of 15 for stealing a woman’s phone. Mandla argues his reason for committing crime was to get money to impress his friends and attract women. However, the deeper cause of his involvement in crime, Mandla strongly believes, is a direct result of the absence of his father.

The stories of Sisifo and Mandla make it clear that living in the township of Khayelitsha can become a gateway to criminality. Their immediate environment exposed them to crime and violence and invited them to take part in it. Figure 1.5, a map from Janet Gie’s report on crime in Cape Town features the reported murder.

rates from 2007/2008 of different neighborhoods in Cape Town and show us how Khayelitsha compares to the rest of Cape Town. Khayelitsha is colored the darkest shade depicting the highest murder rate along with a neighboring township. In addition, the neighborhoods surrounding Khayelitsha, many of which are also townships and informal settlements, feature the higher rates of murder compared to the wealthier and often whiter parts of the city. The deep levels of poverty, lack of infrastructure, and high crime rates make Khayelitsha a very difficult place to police, seeing as crime levels have not changed much over the years and the police are not trusted.
Because of all these issues, the government established the Khayelitsha Commission of Inquiry in order to investigate the allegations of the police inefficiencies and their difficult relationship with the community. Khayelitsha is a difficult terrain for many policemen who can often be outwitted because of their

---


21 Van der Spuy, Elrena, and Adam Armstrong. 381.
unfamiliarity with the space. For example, group confrontations tend to occur frequently and the police quickly become outnumbered, so they often switch their focus from crime prevention to self-protection. Therefore, it is not surprising that Khayelitsha has seen little change in their crime levels since it seems like it is seen as a lost cause in the police world. Within the police world, the Khayelitsha station in the police world is seen as a bottom rank facility and as policemen actively avoid it, the state also neglects sending resources that way.

The clear signs of underdevelopment in the township of Khayelitsha create higher rates of crime, making the jobs of the policemen much harder. The police cannot solve these issues of underdevelopment; rather they need to be investigated as institutional and governmental problems. Since investigation into the development of the socio-economic issues of Khayelitsha is not taking place, Ben Bowling, cited by Van der Spuy, a professor of Criminology and Criminal Justice at Kings College London, claims that the police have no choice but to adopt ‘good enough’ policing. He claims that perfect policing characterized by both fairness and effectiveness is unattainable, thus the police should settle for fair enough and effective enough responses. This ‘good enough’ result is different depending on the community, but it allows the police to focus on achieving more realistic goals. Therefore, the police force is happy with their few successful cases and has given up on trying to achieve large-scale safety reform. In the long-term, the ‘good enough’ approach will have a minuscule effect on reducing levels of crime and violence in Khayelitsha.

---

22 Van der Spuy, Elrena, and Adam Armstrong. 403.
III. Concluding Thoughts

This chapter has briefly discussed the life, perceptions and people of Khayelitsha. I have also noted the goal of urban upgrading and tourism for the township that would allow it to live up to the newly embellished and positive representations. Despite the videos containing picturesque depictions of the township and the accounts of people speaking proudly of their life in Khayelitsha, these do not represent the full picture of their local reality. Khayelitsha is not only physically disconnected from the city by being on the outskirts, but is also socially and economically inferior. Moreover high levels of crime and violence and poverty instill fear in both residents and visitors while the police are often ineffective and not trusted. Once Khayelitsha is seen as an approachable and inviting community, more investment will go into its socio-economic development by both the government and the Cape Town community as a whole. Surface level changes to infrastructure and sanitation are steps in the right direction to gain the attention from investors who will see Khayelitsha as a place with growing potential for change. This can eventually lead to the more deeply rooted problems, like discrimination and inequality still persisting from the Apartheid regime, to be addressed and can allow for urban upgrading through a full transformation of the township.

It is unjust that a person’s living conditions/socio-economic status dictates an individual’s exposure to crime or the likelihood of involvement in crime. Crime and violence is linked to factors of poverty and informality, two distinct characteristics of Khayelitsha. It is common knowledge that crime in the township
will not be fixed by the police force alone. There need to be interventions on larger scales, attacking the institutional and inequitable structures that prevent Khayelitsha from developing and upgrading. By addressing the space and security of Khayelitsha, I argue that urban upgrading in the township needs to be seen as urban renewal through a process of transformation with limited relocation to bring the quality of life to more equitable standards. In Chapter 2, I further discuss the security aspect of Khayelitsha incorporating crime theory and explaining why it is related to the urban upgrading process.
Chapter 2 – Security

When writing on the topic of informal settlement upgrading in South Africa, crime is inevitably a dominant part of the narrative. In this chapter I will discuss how crime and underdevelopment are related and need to be addressed jointly when developing an urban upgrading scheme for Khayelitsha. I am using the term “underdevelopment” because it includes all environments that are not in sufficient condition, many parts of Khayelitsha fall into this category. The term covers a wide range of neighborhoods because there is no proof of one aspect of underdevelopment causing more crime than another, so I don’t want to use exclusionary language.

I. Policing in Khayelitsha

Khayelitsha exemplifies the interrelationship of crime and underdevelopment. The hardships that people face living in this township are extremely limiting and nearly inescapable. Criminologist Robert Agnew developed General Strain Theory stating that the experience of strain and stress culminates itself in frustration, negative emotion, and despair, which can result in resorting to crime in order to obtain basic life necessities. The deep levels of poverty, lack of infrastructure, and high crime rates make Khayelitsha a very difficult setting to police, seeing as crime levels have not changed much over the years. The people of the township live with high levels of fear and low levels of trust in the police. Thus, there is a vast disconnect between the community and police narrative providing
two opposing sides to life in Khayelitsha, making it much harder to tackle the issues of underdevelopment and crime in the township.

The community narrative revolves around primary and secondary victimization. Primary victimization takes place after an individual commits a criminal act, however the effects of the primary victimization create the secondary victimization through systems of state neglect. This manifests itself in police inefficiencies and delayed court proceedings etc. In areas of high crime, the volume of cases makes the system around policing much more inefficient, further developing negative relationships between the police and community. One of these inefficiencies culminates in poor data collection methods. When a police station is working on a lot of cases, files and records often go missing resulting in insufficient data to create reports on crime prevalence. This, in turn, negatively impacts the community because crime data is useful when designing urban plans to prevent violence (i.e. VPUU) especially when knowing exactly where crime occurs the most.

However, it should be noted that the police are working under very difficult conditions. It is rarely acknowledged by the community that the police are dealing with a harsh environment that is much more difficult to navigate than others. Police, on the other hand, claim that they are trying their best and are placed in a township with endemic disorder and social disorganization. The police claim their job is even harder to do as the community contradictorily relies on the police to decrease crime rates but also resist police intervention due to mistrust. Seven thematic areas emerge from the police narrative, which further explain the difficulty of policing
Khayelitsha and why crime rates continue to be high. The efficiency of policing is important to note because improving it can help decrease levels of crime.

One theme is the importance of context. It takes a long time for policemen to adjust to the nature of crime in Khayelitsha, which limits the productivity of their work. A second theme focuses on the systematic failures that get labeled as police failures, but require a deeper level of engagement. This theme will be addressed again later in this chapter. A third theme revolves around the lack of resources. This mostly speaks to the lack of human resources in Khayelitsha and the police to population ratio being much smaller (fewer police for more people) in Khayelitsha compared to other Cape Town neighborhoods. The Khayelitsha station in the police world is seen as a bottom rank facility and while policemen actively avoid it, the state also neglects sending resources that way. Another theme set out by the Commission states that they are truly aware of all the problems and have been working on tangible solutions. The fifth theme regards the difficulty to balance administrative and operational demand and control. As mentioned before, the police administration is highly disorganized where cases and files constantly get lost. This is a result of a lack of resources to keep things neat and disallows concrete crime control changes to be made. Another theme is the discovery that the police are also capable of being afraid and cannot monitor control of a place that they fear. This ties into the seventh theme of the loneliness of the policemen due to their lack in numbers. Since they are often alone at their placements in Khayelitsha, they can
much more easily experience violence from the community members when trying to control the streets\textsuperscript{23.}

There are clear signs of underdevelopment in the township of Khayelitsha, creating higher rates of crime and making the jobs of the policemen much harder. The police cannot solve these issues of underdevelopment, as they need to be investigated as urban planning problems involving institutional and governmental forces. Since the investigation into the socio-economic issues of Khayelitsha is not taking place, Ben Bowling claims that the police have no choice but to adopt ‘good enough’ policing. This is like a “Band-Aid fix” as mentioned in Chapter 2. Although it will not have a long-term positive effect, Bowling’s approach makes it easier for the police in Khayelitsha to remain as efficient as possible. It can be seen as a short-term solution to allow time for a long-term resolution.

II. Environmental Criminology and Spatial Ecology

While the police focus on ‘good enough’ policing is being adopted, the environmental side of criminology needs to be assessed, which can positively result in the reduction of crime rates. Breetzke and Horn address the importance of a spatial-ecological approach through modeling various socio-economic variables and offender rates in the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality in Gauteng, South Africa\textsuperscript{24.} Within the city, environmental criminology was mapped, collecting data on the high crime areas and the urban origins of offenders. This approach is necessary

\textsuperscript{23} Van der Spuy, Elrena, and Adam Armstrong. 402.
as environmental criminology in the past solely focused on where criminality occurred and neglected the residences of the criminals themselves. Arguably the latter is more important because spatial-ecology aims to prove that criminal behavior is a result of the spaces, which an individual inhabits and is exposed to. There are clear patterns of offender residences being in low socio-economic areas. The spatial patterns reveal that there are a higher number of offenders residing in the impoverished parts of Tshwane, a place very similar to Khayelitsha. This reinforces the fact that underdevelopment and high levels of crime go hand-in-hand and Breetzke and Horn explain four factors that are associated with the spatial-ecology of the offenders in Tshwane, which can directly be applied to Khayelitsha’s spatial framework.

The four factors are low social status and income, young and large families, unskilled earners, and high residential mobility. These factors are all causes and results of underdevelopment and create a more favorable environment for offending. Firstly, a low social status and income can be equated to the historical inequality present during the apartheid and the legacy it still leaves behind today. South Africa has one of the highest levels of inequalities in the world in terms of socio-economic status. A majority of informal settlements experience low social standing and income and the strain the inhabitants go through create ongoing tensions between individuals and families. These tensions often manifest themselves in violent criminal acts as a result of individuals trying to meet basic survival needs. The factor of young and large families makes the low social standing and income factor even more of a point of strain and stress. Households with more
than 5 persons often have a large portion of the family that is unmarried and between the ages of 0 and 14. These family structures with young, single, and unemployed individuals experience more pressure to provide for a growing family. It is also evident that parental absence and criminality are interrelated, which is the case with the story of Mandla, who is also from the Gauteng Province. Those individuals that are employed often fall into the third factor of unskilled earners. These individuals often work manual labor jobs and earn at or below minimum wage. Their lack of education puts them at a disadvantage for seeking opportunities in the job market, resulting in their economic strain when they gain more dependents and cannot easily mitigate the burden.

Finally, high residential mobility is the fourth factor and a strong driving force for criminality since it is a key characteristic life in a township or informal settlement. High residential mobility refers to the constant flow of people moving in and out of a space. When a neighborhood experiences high levels of mobility, there is a lack of a social networks between residents and a disadvantage in creating community informal control mechanisms, such as security watch systems keeping an eye on who is on the street. Due to high mobility and crime in certain areas, residents want to leave and move into new spaces. However, when entering those new areas they create more competition for limited resources and high levels of mobility, which adds to the levels of crime in their new habitat. This contradictory cyclical effect spreads the nature of crime due to constant human mobility inspired by the need to escape from underdevelopment.

25 Breetzke, Gregory D., and André Carl Horn. 186.
26 Breetzke, Gregory D., and André Carl Horn. 190.
This is another example of the need to find short-term solutions instead of long-term resolutions. Since, urban upgrading initiatives in township areas are not taking place regularly, residents cannot rely on outside institutions to improve criminality in their neighborhoods. Therefore, running from the crime is seen as a solution, but in the case of high residential mobility it can cause more harm than good. Eventually residents find themselves stuck in the same limited, vulnerable, underdeveloped spaces, which can only be improved by planning, governmental, and economic institutions. By explaining their four factors of spatial-ecology, Breetzke and Horn prove that underdevelopment is linked to higher levels of criminality. In addition, the story of the life of Mandla shared in Chapter 1 falls right into Breetzke and Horn’s four factor theory of low social status and income, young and large families, unskilled earners, and high residential mobility. Therefore, it is clear that patterns of underdevelopment and those living in it are more likely to be exposed to and involved in criminality.

III. Redefining Criminology

Since the interrelationship between underdevelopment and high levels of crime has been proven with many case studies and theories, it is time to rethink the way we approach criminology. Criminologist John Muncie speaks about the notion of decriminalizing criminology in an attempt to broaden the subject matter of criminology. From this emerges the concept of radical criminology offering two propositions – criminology needs to sever all institutional ties and move away from

questions of cause/remedy that make it dependent on government policies, and criminology should have a greater focus on the process of criminalization investigating how certain harmful acts/events come to be defined as crime while others do not. Muncie continues to focus on the impact of social harms, which are often not considered crime but can be more harmful than crime and can lead to higher levels of criminality. Some examples of social harm include racism, sexism, economic exploitation, and human rights violations. These have slowly driven the reconstruction of the meaning of crime, yet their recognition as criminality only comes from those with the power to make certain crimes visible, which are usually not residents of townships like Khayelitsha.

Further redefining crime brings about a constitutive criminology characterizing crime as having the power to deny others. Crime in this sense takes on two forms; harms of reduction in which the offended party experiences some immediate loss/injury, and harms of repression, which occur when power is used to restrict future human potential aspirations. This concept highlights the large range of hidden crimes that cause social harm, but would not be labeled as criminality by law. While hidden crimes and social harms need to be brought to the forefront of crime conversation, Muncie also recognizes that this can lead to the criminalization of all undesirable behavior by the criminal justice mainstream, which is not a beneficial outcome. Rather the need to highlight this forgotten side of crime is to once again shine a light on the inequitable interrelationship of underdevelopment and crime. These social harms and hidden crimes are often results of the hardships

---

28 Muncie, John. 4.
of living in underdeveloped conditions, thus increasing the strain and disadvantage of that population. The added difficulties and obstacles directly cause an increase in levels of criminality, but could potentially be mitigated by redefining criminology. This approach needs to be applied to Khayelitsha as well as other similar townships in South Africa. Crime is not a black and white concept and needs to be contextualized within township life. This will reveal that crime is an outcome of much larger restrictions and institutions in place, which is why we need to “redefine” it.

**IV. Concluding Thoughts**

In addition to the need to focus on redefining criminology, there needs to be a reassessment of our approach to fixing crime. Crime will not disappear with the good enough policing approach in Khayelitsha, rather intervention on a governmental and institutional scale needs to take place. By exploring poor policing efforts in Khayelitsha, the spatial-ecological approach, and the necessity to redefine criminology we come to see how underdevelopment has led to the increases in levels of crime. Khayelitsha’s high levels of crime can be explained by the four factors of Breetzke and Horn’s spatial-ecological approach, which are characteristics of underdevelopment. Khayelitsha has an innumerable number of cases like Mandla’s and the population experiences various forms of social harm on a daily basis. Thus, it becomes clear that Khayelitsha, due to its many forms of underdevelopment, experiences higher levels of crime. Figure 2.1 allows us to
visualize this connection by contrasting a map showcasing the location of informal settlements next to a map used in Figure 2.1 presenting murder rates by location.

**Figure 2.1:** (Left) Map of Cape Town depicting locations of informal housing. (Right) Map of Cape Town presenting murder rates by Police precinct.

New approaches to criminology almost mimic the new approaches to planning theory and practice that will be discussed in Chapter 4. Criminologists are looking for new ways to define crime and are approaching criminality by analyzing space, socio-economic levels, laws, institutions, and inequalities. Urban upgrading must be approached the same way and crime is a prominent subject of the upgrading process. Crime is important to consider when discussing informal

---


settlements, urban upgrading, and development because, as this chapter has proven, crime will always be a dominant part of the narrative. In Chapter 3, I will discuss how urban upgrading initiatives of the past have failed and in some cases increased crime in various case studies across South Africa.
Chapter 3 – Structural Reform: Failed Urban Upgrading Initiatives

This chapter will analyze past urban upgrading attempts. These attempts take place in Khayelitsha as well as other townships in Cape Town and Gauteng, South Africa. Although the locations differ, there seems to be a common theme of disappointment from the recipients of upgrading in the case studies. This disappointment comes from the lack of organization, thought, and preparation put into certain urban upgrading initiatives. A common narrative found among these failed initiatives is a lack of anticipation, a lack of a holistic approach, and neglect for the local reality of the spaces. The outcome of structural reform should be positive change, but past initiatives have not achieved this result.

I. Women in New Rest and Makhaza

In her article, “Competing Rationalities and informal settlement upgrading in Cape Town, South Africa: a recipe for failure”, Ruth Massey explains why urban upgrading can be completely contradictory to the needs of the residents. In her case studies in New Rest, Gugulethu and Makhaza, Khayelitsha, Massey finds that urban planners and locals often have competing rationalities. Both townships of Gugulethu and Khayelitsha have many similarities and both have very tight knit women’s social networks that are crucial for the survival of livelihoods in these areas.

The women in these townships play very important roles in creating a sense of social and cultural community among the township residents. Women head many households in townships and informal settlements since men are more mobile when participating in the migrant labor force, community in the Cape Town CBD to work.
The women are seen as the more permanent residents of the settlements and tend to be catalysts for self-organization and networking within communities. These social networks provide social, economic, and security opportunities to all settlement residents and are seen as vital components of their livelihood. For example, economically, these networks allow for informal trading among neighbors. The social systems are very unique to the local realities of the settlement and in order for the settlements to be successfully upgraded they need to be thoroughly understood. There exist formal groupings such as sewing groups, environmental committees, savings groups, burial societies, and community policing forums. On the other hand, informal groups consist of friends, relatives, and neighbors that provide monetary support, childcare, food contributions, shared resources, and care for the sick and elderly. The informal networks are crucial for survival in these settlements and the location of households relative to these networks is very important. These systems developed naturally and are based on interactive relationships and sharing. They are not financially focused or economically driven, but are more reciprocal and allow for day-to-day life to run smoothly for many residents. Without theses structures of social and interactive local governance, survival in these townships would be much more difficult. In Massey’s case study she identified key stakeholders and informants of New Rest and Makhaza in 2011. Semi-structured interviews were held with approximately 20 women from each settlement. It was quickly realized that the

32 Massey, Ruth T. 608.
rationality of the City and its upgrading techniques of upgrading did not complement the women's social networks. The City took a very economic and technocratic approach to their upgrading meaning they built as much as possible within their monetary and spatial limits. The City’s focus was just to provide as much housing as possible and there was no preliminary research on what the local communities prioritized. The interviews showcased that 96% of the women in Makhaza and 90% of the women in New Rest did not believe their needs were met. The reason for this was the fact that the new developments did not include enough spaces for the women to gather and meet in their formal and informal groups. The women complain that they have to create their own spaces for meetings and it costs some people more money to commute to new locations. These inconveniences are weakening the social networks and making them less accessible to all women. Women would typically meet in open spaces outdoors, under trees, or in public buildings. However, those outdoor spaces have been replaced with housing, which the government, not knowing about the importance of the women’s groups, thought would be the most efficient use of the space. Therefore, since women must now meet in each other’s homes and many of them aren’t conducive to large groups, the occurrence and attendance gone down, while some groups have completely dissolved.

Women also mention that the new layout and infrastructure of the settlement decreased safety. On one hand the new layout does not allow for as many cultural gatherings and activities. The women believe the cultural activities create better community trust and cohesion that would bring the youth and elders
together. However, the youth are no longer exposed to valued cultural traditions and women in both townships see this as a root cause of crime, drug and alcohol abuse, and teenage pregnancy. In addition, the women complain about the lack of adequate lighting and the positioning of transport routes making it dangerous to leave their homes at night (Massey). Therefore meetings/social events cannot be held after dark. Women in both settlements are concerned about the increased crime that has resulted from the design. They share:

“There are problems with the way the area has been designed. From the bus stop you have to cross the park which is dangerous especially at night. There’s no space for our children to play. The plan was totally wrong. They put the park next to the dam where it is dangerous and there is a lot of crime.”

(Women interviewed in Makhaza)33

“We used to meet frequently as women in open spaces and walk at whatever time of the night but now it does not happen because of the crime. There is not even a safe small park. We used to have cooking stokvels in open spaces and socials but not anymore because even the houses are too small. We used to meet under the big tree. We can't do that anymore”

(Women interviewed in New Rest)34

Informal settlements and townships create their own unique social, economic, cultural, and safety networks that are based on space and place. Therefore, when the City changed the space, it directly impacted these thriving networks. The City followed instructions to build as many houses as possible and has admitted to neglecting the importance of the women’s social networks. However, this problem goes beyond the mere neglect of the women in Makhaza and New Rest. Urban upgrading initiatives pay little attention to the positive aspects of a place and the

33 Massey, Ruth T. 610.
34 Massey, Ruth T. 611.
rationalities of the residents. The development and formalization of the spaces in the two townships was done for the residents. Therefore, it is shocking that the residents were not consulted about their needs and instead the government made assumptions about what the settlements needed most. Urban development is often approached as a numbers game in terms of its efficiency, but it would be much more efficient when viewed as a process of transformation without relocation aiming to bring the quality of life to more equitable standards with the rest of Cape Town. The term transformation includes the infrastructural upgrades, but also keeps in mind the local reality and aims to transform the existing community without relocating them into one that can integrate into the greater Cape Town metropolitan area.

II. The Case of Khayelitsha

Failures in structural reform have occurred several parts of Khayelitsha. There have been cases of urban upgrading with disregard for local realities, social networks, and rates of crime and violence. This section will cover the Violence Prevention through Urban Upgrading (VPUU).

Vanessa Barolsky, in her article about social cohesion in the global south, focuses on Khayelitsha and the VPUU initiative. Social cohesion, she states, is a characteristic of neighbors who are willing to intervene on behalf of the common good. She argues that this can be applied to social life and violence prevention throughout the world and identifies its unique application in Khayelitsha. As

---

discussed throughout this article, informal settlements build unique social networks as a survival mechanism. Therefore, Khayelitsha already has deeply rooted localized forms of social cohesion. For example, in Khayelitsha gangs exhibit widespread social cohesion and young men often join solely for social status and protection. The problem lies in the fact that the implementers of the VPUU did not take those into account.

The VPUU initiative was established in 2004 based on a partnership between the City and Cape Town and the German Development Bank. The project’s goal was to make structural and practical upgrading changes that would instill a sense of ownership among the residents of Khayelitsha. The VPUU implementers believed that Khayelitsha needed technical interventions to solve its underdevelopment and crime and violence issues. In reality, practical implementations will not address the deep socio-economic inequalities that exist within the Cape Town cityscape. In order to design out crime and violence one must address why it is happening in the first place, perhaps by using some of the suggested approaches I mention in Chapter 2. The VPUU design was also based on western city plans, which is a concept that does not translate to the spaces of Khayelitsha and Cape Town. There is a discrepancy between the formality of the VPUU plan and the informality of Khayelitsha.

It seems as though the VPUU implementers did little research to understand whom they were bringing development to. For example, they created business spaces that served as vendor kiosks, but charged rent. Previous to this intervention

---

36 Barolsky, Vanessa Emma. 23.
vendors would set up their goods in the same location for free. The kiosks are a slight improvement as the structure protects vendor’s goods from instances of bad weather, for example. However, the upgrade was not presented to the Khayelitsha residents in a realistic manner. Some vendors were under the impression that the VPUU implementers were trying to enforce contractual relationships with the residents. Yet, the voices of those vendors were not widely heard. The VPUU initiative disrupted social networks and had unintended consequences, but the failure is something the implementers have learned from. Barolsky concludes her paper by arguing that social cohesion is very relevant to understanding the space and security in a city like Cape Town and should be implemented in urban upgrading initiatives around the world. Khayelitsha, as evidenced by the women’s social networks and the VPUU project, still has a long way to go and it’s potential future development and urban upgrading practices will be discussed in Chapter 4.

37 Barolsky, Vanessa Emma. 27.
Chapter 4 – Structural Reform: Future Urban Planning and Development Practices

In order to wholly analyze the urban upgrading of townships, one must engage with the planning practices and theories on the topic. The process of transformation through to urban upgrading can be actualized through thorough planning that ensures long-term and sound solutions in order to bring the residents’ quality of life to more equitable standards. In addition, it is important to understand the context that the City of Cape Town provides. This chapter focuses on the spatial frameworks and planning theories and practices related to informality, upgrading, and Cape Town.

Developing cities face many challenges in the process of upgrading, one of them being navigating the discrepancy between ‘traditional’ forms of planning and the local reality of, in this case, Cape Town’s township. Today’s planning theories and practices emerged from the developed world and its cities. While these fit the scope of many existing cities, they do not have the ability to apply to every city. The universal ideal spatial plan remains an elusive concept and the city of Cape Town needs to focus on perfecting its own unique spatial framework.

I. Cape Town’s Spatial Framework

A UN Habitat report from 2009 calls for a departure from ‘traditional’ forms of planning advocating an approach that supports the livelihood strategies of the poor.38 This is the same approach that the Cape Town Spatial Development

---

Framework (CTSDF) wants to take in order to produce more equitable urban forms. Khayelitsha can end up benefitting from some of the transformation intended by the CTSDF. However, even within Cape Town, there is a misalignment between current planning systems and city-building dynamics. Nancy Odendaal and Adele McCann, professors at the University of Cape Town, published a study on the spatial planning of the Global South, in which this discrepancy is further explored by analyzing three themes: the treatment of space and place; the plan-making process and its political connotations; and the relationship between substantive issues and planning responses.

Firstly, Odendaal and McCann’s focus on the treatment of space and place builds on the notion of relational space, which allows for a more holistic view on geographies of relational complexity. This means recognizing how social, cultural, and economic relations inform the conceptualization of urban areas as transactional nodes. This will avoid the decontextualizing of space that happens when foreign plans are implemented in unfit spaces and ignore the diversity of stakeholders involved. Planners must move past the translation of plans across different contexts without understanding of endogenous dynamics and make plans more malleable. Odendaal and McCann refer to Pasty Healey’s theory when stating the aim for plan-making is to direct urban growth and frame the resources for doing so. Healy requests upgrading to go beyond infrastructural updates and add value to transformed spaces through resources such as education and employment. This can

---

39 Odendaal, Nancy and Adele McCann. 407.
only be done with an apt understanding of the local context and how its full potential can be maximized.

Next, the plan making process involves many actors, one of the more important ones being politicians. The quality of a place comes from the relationships among people, objects, and networks. A driving force of urban upgrading is investment and this is where politics come into play. Investors need to understand the long-term and short-term needs of the community in order to maximize efficient planning. This incorporates long-term strategic planning to maintain sustainability and inclusivity with short-term design-led physical approaches. It requires a strategy that combines a physical rebuilding as well as the social transforming upgrading approach that is so necessary for townships like Khayelitsha that need this approach.

Finally, the relationship between issues and planning responses brings all these theories together in stating that there is a disjuncture between diverse urbanization trends and master planning traditions. Odendaal and McCann focus on the specific aspect of informality and how it plays a role in both saving the livelihoods of many urban poor, but at the same time is neglected by government forces and international planners. There needs to be an understanding of how and why informality is positive and should be a base to build off of. Odendaal and McCann cite Graham and Marvin’s theory of splintering urbanism describing South African cities as having islands of prosperity existing in seas of poverty\(^40\). Resources

\(^{40}\) Odendaal, Nancy and Adele McCann. 409.
are directed to the elite few at the expense of many, which is a general narrative perfectly fitting to Cape Town’s spatial framework.

The 2012 CTSDF includes a very limited analysis of the city’s informal sectors (housing, employment, social). It does not promote the development of these parts of the city, but recognizes the need for further investigation in these areas. However, the lack of attention to informality compromises the CTSDF because it is based on contradictory notions of space and place. Informality is an important feature of the city and must be added to its planning narrative. This is an example of a design-led approach in a place that needs an evidence-based approach. Therefore, planners think design can solve the problems and do not pay attention to local realities and needs. The notion of relational space comes into play here because understanding the importance of informal relations in Cape Town could have resulted in a more comprehensive CTSDF. Odendaal and McCann conclude by critiquing the expectations of spatial frameworks. A spatial plan will not provide answers to tough urban development questions, but rather will continue the conversations surrounding the weaknesses of spatial plans and how they will continue to change and shape cities. There cannot be the reliance of a plan to be the end product of a city rather it is a tool to further mold the city into its next stage of development. The final, perfect plan does not exist for any city, but through careful and thorough urban planning it is possible to take big strides in the right direction. To put this into context, the spatial complexities of Khayelitsha need to be understood in order to achieve successful urban upgrading. There has not been a perfect initiative, but
learning from past ones has inspired different approaches that may provide more fruitful outcomes.

II. Methods, Rationalities, and Informality

John Abbot, a professor at the University of Cape Town, supports my argument of the need for the transformation of urban townships with his suggested method-based approach to informal settlement upgrading. He shares that there is a broad agreement that in situ upgrading is most efficient and can be achieved through a method-based approach. This approach includes a structured and interrelated set of actions that have a logical framework and an internal cohesion, which can lead to a defined outcome\(^{41}\). The aim is to create long-term sustainable upgrading to a local community with a mindset of the alleviation of vulnerability.

Abbott chooses the term vulnerability instead of poverty because poverty is hard to quantify and depends on the eyes of the observer. However, vulnerability can be more easily quantified objectively and Abbott’s study focuses on four elements of vulnerability of residents living in informal settlements. Firstly, informal settlements are physically marginalized environments. There is a high chance of physical challenged such as landslides, flooding, and high groundwater. In addition to these, there are social and health problems such as insecurity, crimes, and disease that affect inhabitants on a daily basis. Secondly, there is an absence of opportunities for asset retention and growth. Assets present themselves in various

---

ways such as social capital, resources, labor, and households. Vulnerability in this case is tied to asset ownership, therefore the more assets one has, the less vulnerable they are.

Thirdly, perceptions of poverty are linked to classifications of vulnerability. This brings up the question of who defines poverty and what that definition is based on. It is also important to recognize the residents’ definition of poverty and their hierarchy of priorities in order to most efficiently supply resources for upgrading. Finally, Abbott focuses on the compromised use of space. The way in which space is used in informal settlements often does not accommodate outside vehicles and resources to enter the space in order to help. For example, the lack of paved surfaces prevents sanitation trucks from entering the settlement to dispose of waste. This use of space puts the settlement in a compromised position that can be avoidable with improved planning practices. Overall, it is counterproductive to address one of the four elements of vulnerability while the others increase. Abbott’s list provides a holistic list of issues that need to be prioritized and addressed at the same time.

Abbott goes further to analyze the relationship of informal settlements to the rest of the city. Two vulnerabilities that distance the spaces of informal settlement from the rest of the urban population are social exclusion and settlement sustainability. Abbott argues that while the aim is to reduce vulnerability, it cannot be approached on a micro-scale, but instead needs to be included on a broader planning framework scale that seeks social integration and sustainability. Therefore, a way to address these two vulnerabilities is by turning the community outwards – spatially, socially, and economically in order to link with surrounding
communities\textsuperscript{42}. Here Abbott is in agreement with Graham and Marvin, as he believes a settlement should not be a lone island ostracized from greater society. In order to address all the vulnerabilities Abbott has highlighted, he asks for a “cross-sectoral planning methodology”\textsuperscript{43}. Past individual sectoral initiatives have failed and in order to achieve long-lasting impactful change, the issue must be approached in an interdisciplinary framework because the residents’ lives depend on multiple sectors of society. This places heavy emphasis on understanding and catering to the specific and unique needs of local residents in order to achieve efficient and successful urban upgrading.

Abbott’s method-based approach is malleable and emphasizes transformative, in situ upgrading that integrates the informal settlement into the rest of the city. This is the approach I refer to in my argument pertaining the reaching of equitable standards. It is important for Khayelitsha to be upgraded and become more integral part of the city of Cape Town in order achieve more equality among living spaces. It is becoming clear that urban upgrading entails much more than surface level intervention.

Professors Ruth Massey and Vanessa Watson both wrote articles on the competing and conflicting rationalities among the numerous actors involved in the practice of urban planning and development.

Massey writes about competing rationalities focusing on the contradictory nature between upgrading initiatives and the needs of residents. In this case, the City of Cape Town’s rationality in their technique of upgrading was not

\textsuperscript{42} Abbott, John. 323.
\textsuperscript{43} Abbott, John. 324.
complementary to the structure and nature of the site and the residents’ social networks (this is in reference to the case study mentioned in Chapter 3 about women in New Rest and Makhaza). Upgrading can take a very economic and technocratic focus that forgets about the importance of social and cultural aspects of a community. This is especially true for contexts like Khayelitsha because there is an overall lack of a formal economy and technology, making the other aspects of the township (i.e. culture, social networks, informal economy etc.) much more valuable. Such limited planning practice can do more harm than good in the long run with the destruction of informal, social, and cultural institutions. However, for the government, upgrading can be seen as a numbers game of providing as many services as possible without putting thought into the local realities of the recipients.

Similarly, Watson writes about the deep difference among actors involved in upgrading initiatives. She argues that having fundamentally different worldviews and value-systems is treated as superficial and the way in which planners ethically situate themselves in such situations has not been given sufficient attention\textsuperscript{44}. In addition, it is thought that shelter upgrade is directly linked to poverty reduction and sustainable urbanization, which makes the formalization of settlements seem like a fitting solution, but there is no evidence supporting this outcome. This is very much still an approach rooted in Western political and social theory and in order to combat it, Watson proposes communicative action theory. Her theory emphasizes the collaborative process of involving all stakeholders and ensuring an equitable representation of voices in decision-making regarding development planning. With

the proposition of this theory she assumes that community divides can be overcome in order to reach consensus on planning issues, that collaborative pressures from civil society-based groups can encourage state actions, and that collaboration can build a learning environment that increases local social capital\textsuperscript{45}.

Taking one step back, Watson also makes the case that we must return to concrete context based case research in order for planning theory to sufficiently assist planning practice. Otherwise planners will continue to make assumptions about unknown information due to a lack of research and understanding about the local community. Watson concludes with three concepts in relation to planning theory and practice – Haraway’s “embodied objectivity”, Campbell’s “situated judgment”, and Foucault’s “situational ethics”. With the concept of “embodied objectivity”, Haraway proposes seeing through the perspective of the subjugated. Campbell argues planning implementations need to be judged based on unique situation rather than fixed values. Finally, Foucault challenges planners to discover contextually grounded norms among the community members undergoing urban upgrading\textsuperscript{46}. These three ideas highlight some of the general themes discussed throughout this chapter regarding how the approach to planning needs to change. These theories can be applied to places like Khayelitsha in order to achieve urban renewal through a process of transformation with limited relocation to eventually bring its quality of life to more equitable standards.

Adding to the narrative of critiquing planning practices in the developing world, Faranak Miraftab shares his theory on insurgent planning. This theory has

\textsuperscript{45} Watson, Vanessa. 398.
\textsuperscript{46} Watson, Vanessa. 404-405.
three principles that promote inclusion and participatory citizenship. One guiding principle is taking a “counter-hegemonic” approach, meaning insurgent planning aims to destabilize normalized forms of dominance, giving citizens more rights to fight for their own terms of engagement. “Transgression” is another principle focusing on transgressing false dichotomies like formal/informal and building transnational solidarities of marginalized people. In addition, this principle transgresses time boundaries seeking historicized theories and staying away from Eurocentric visions. Finally, insurgent planning is “imaginative” by promoting the concept of a different world as being possible and necessary. This thorough framework for a new planning approach is indicative of how many, both small and more significant, changes can be made to planning theory and practice. All the proposed approaches defend informality and suggest we take a new perspective on informality.

Ananya Roy, in her piece on urban informality, goes further to defend informal systems. Similar to previous arguments on this topic, she proposes moving beyond the dichotomy of “first world models and third world problems.” Another dichotomy that needs dismantling is that of the two sectors – formal and informal. Instead, Roy urges readers to think of informality as a series of transactions that connect economies and spaces to one another rather than a separate sector. She frames informality as an expression of sovereignty in urban areas when the “formal”

---

living arrangements are not suitable for all. However, upgrading approaches do not view or treat informality the same way. She states:

“The limitations of urban upgrading are the limitations of the ideology of space. In such policy approaches, what is redeveloped is space, the built environment and physical amenities rather than people’s capacities or livelihoods. I have argued elsewhere that such an emphasis on the physical environment is an “aestheticization of poverty” (Roy, 2004), one that equates upgrading with aesthetics upgrading rather than the upgrading of livelihoods, wages, political capacities”49.

Within urban upgrading, material developments have limited positive impacts. On one hand, physical and infrastructural updates do help an informal settlement in terms of sanitation and access to water for example. On the other hand, these can be seen as “Band-Aid fixes” that do not attempt to address the structural inequalities that created the need for informal settlements. This is what Roy describes as the “aestheticization of poverty” and it unfortunately a very common narrative among urban upgrading initiatives.

III. Technology in the Gauteng Province

A new addition to the approaches in development and urban upgrading incorporates technology. Planners must understand the space in terms of numbers. It is important to know how many people and households are present in an informal settlement to, for example, calculate the number of facilities they need to build. In their paper, Mokoena and Musakwa propose using a web-based mobile GIS tool to conduct audits. These investigations will provide up-to-date, accurate, and comprehensive data to facilitate the development of informal settlements50.

49 Roy, Ananya. 150.
50 Mokoena, Baleseng Tlholohelo, and Walter Musakwa. “MOBILE GIS: A TOOL FOR INFORMAL
Occupancy audits were carried out for communities in the Ekurhuleni municipality in the Gauteng Province. The use of mobile GIS provided data that helped point to the most efficient housing solution for the community.

The study focuses on Ulana, an informal settlement in Ekurhuleni with 3,092 households according to the GIS occupancy audit done in 2015. During data collection, each household was given a designated barcode to avoid repetition. A GPS was used to collect the location of the dwelling while an android-based tablet was used to collect attributes of the households. Next, ArcGIS was used to sync the location and attribution data for spatial analysis. Demographic attributes, such as citizenship, gender, income, dependents and whether they had received subsidized housing in the past, were then analyzed. With these analyses it was possible to determine whether households qualified for housing subsidies.

The audit revealed that only 56.89% of households would be potential beneficiaries of subsidized housing. Some of the factors for determining the qualification for subsidized housing are household income, dependents, and age, so the mobile GIS data was key to gaining these results. The technology provides for quick, up-to-date information that would otherwise be collected via paper questionnaires. Without the GIS data it would have been more time consuming and less accurate to collect data and make a decision about urban upgrading going forward.

---

Mokoena, Baleseng Tlholohelo, and Walter Musakwa. 738.
It was decided in the Ulana informal settlement to move away from a subsidized housing scheme to an integrated development approach. This approach put together the collected GIS data in order to identify the settlements’ most pressing needs. Next, a plan for the integration of the settlement into the rest of the township and greater Cape Town metropolitan area will be put together. The Ulana informal settlement was lucky to have access to this technology prior to upgrading. With inaccurate data, the government could have chosen the less successful option. The value of the mobile GIS tool goes beyond providing enumeration and administrative assistance. It opens up possibilities of the social, economic, and spatial integration of informal settlements by helping create more successful urban upgrading schemes.

**IV. Concluding Thoughts**

I argue that urban upgrading in Khayelitsha will only be fully effective if it is approached as a process of transformation without relocation aiming to bring the quality of life to more equitable standards with the rest of Cape Town. This process of transformation includes more than physical improvements and must focus on giving access to Khayelitsha residents in order to find common ground with the rest of the city. Access can come in the forms of transportation, employment, and education to name a few. When approaching the project of upgrading Khayelitsha, future planners need to take into account all the above mentioned concepts, theories, and ideas in order to most effectively achieve transformation. I emphasize limited relocation because it allows the residents the opportunity to be given better
access to resources and with those to reach a more equal quality of life relative to the rest of the Cape Town metropolitan area.
Conclusion

The role of urban planners within the context of urban upgrading, transformation, and development is explained well in the following, “The master’s tools cannot dismantle the master’s house, but perhaps when strategically used, they can allow those on the outside to occupy the master’s house”\textsuperscript{52}. This quotation borrows a concept from an essay by poet Audre Lorde explaining that using the master’s tools will not bring about genuine change, change being the destruction of the master’s house. In terms of urban upgrading, it is important to note that urban planners are not necessarily tasked with the job of changing systems in society, but are challenged to understand societal structures and design spaces complimentary to it. This does not mean that urban planners are in support of the injustices of society, but rather they create the upmost efficient and equitable uses of space within a local framework. Roy proposes fitting society into the master’s house, meaning allowing everyone in society to benefit from the government and it’s institutions. Dismantling the whole master’s house is a much larger and more unrealistic undertaking, but as we have seen by the failed urban planning attempts and future suggestions, understanding and building according to a local context is the first vital step in bringing about efficient urban upgrading.

In Cape Town’s case, the legacy of the Apartheid regime left deeply rooted systems based on racism, inequality, and violence. When implementing urban upgrading projects, planning with these societal characteristics in mind brings about more successful development. For example, the ongoing inequality in Cape

\textsuperscript{52} Roy, Ananya. 150.
Town comes from the separated nature of the city. Black townships, like Khayelitsha, are extremely disconnected from non-residential use spaces, which are often commercial and office spaces. Therefore, those living outside the Cape Town Central Business District must commute quite far distances for work. This is a tricky and demanding commitment for a resident of Khayelitsha because of the inconsistency of transport and traffic in Cape Town, not to mention the expense of commuting. The most recent update moving forward is the publishing of the Cape Town Municipal Spatial Development Framework (MSDF) in April 2018, which proposes the spreading out of residential/non-residential spaces across Cape Town. They depict this spreading out in two maps titled “current situation” and “demand” (see Figure 5.1). This will reduce the need for Khayelitsha residents to commute far distances for employment opportunities. Rather, there will be more equitable access across the metropolitan area, which is clearly not the case as evidenced by the figure depicting the current situation.
Figure 5.1: “Municipal Spatial Development Framework” by City of Cape Town

Regarding the future of urban upgrading initiatives in Cape Town, it is time to put the theory into practice. There are countless written pieces on the inefficiencies of informal settlement upgrading, but very few successful cases. The MSDF was a promising document, but the immediate implementing of the development remains unclear. Overall urban upgrading implementation seems to be moving forward at a slow rate. Several works referenced in this paper about urban upgrading theory were published in the early 21st century, yet there still exist few successful cases of upgrading implementation. Going forward, I anticipate the number increasing due to the increasing support and knowledge of the urban upgrading critiques.

An unknown variable regarding the future of urban upgrading is that of gentrification. This has surprisingly not been widely mentioned in literature, but is a common outcome of upgrading and development. I take gentrification into consideration when arguing for the limited relocation of residents where upgrading is taking place. This puts emphasis on development being uniquely implemented for the current residents and their local contexts. If urban upgrading is done with this in mind, gentrification of the spaces can be avoided while the quality of life of citizens previously limited by inequality and lack of resources can increase. It is hard to predict how space transforms and how it relates to a metropolitan area, but this paper presents the opportunity of learning from the past as important and necessary. I hope urban upgrading implementations continue to be viewed with a critical eye, resulting in many more efficient and successful upgrading outcomes.
This paper has touched on the space of Khayelitsha and its representations and perceptions, the security of Khayelitsha and various criminological approaches, failed urban upgrading attempts, and future theories and practices. I ask the question, how are space, security, and structural reform pertinent to improving urban upgrading initiatives in the township of Khayelitsha? After analyzing the space, security, and problems of structural reform in Khayelitsha, I argue that urban upgrading in the township needs to be seen as urban renewal through a process of transformation with limited relocation to bring the quality of life to more equitable standards. The key components of this argument are transformation, limited relocation, and equitable standards. When approaching future upgrading projects, urban planners and other stakeholders must keep those components in mind while measuring the success and sustainability of their approach. Cape Town and Khayelitsha have a lot of potential brewing and will continue to be a pioneering case study in future urban upgrading and development research.
Bibliography


Cape Town Tourism. *Khayelitsha: The Love Cape Town Neighbourhood Series*, 2017. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NC5ANxK2uck&list=PLjia8aSDnJxn1XYGILCU5Ixi5chlt0REn&t=0s&index=7


Mokoena, Baleseng Tlholoheho, and Walter Musakwa. “MOBILE GIS: A TOOL FOR INFORMAL SETTLEMENT OCCUPANCY AUDIT TO IMPROVE INTEGRATED HUMAN SETTLEMENT IMPLEMENTATION IN EKURHULENI, SOUTH AFRICA.” *The International Archives of the Photogrammetry, Remote Sensing, and Spatial Information Sciences* 41 (July 14, 2016).


