Gendered Undoing Through Music in James Joyce’s ‘The Dead’

By Sara Rennert

Senior Thesis
Department of English
Haverford College
April 7th, 2016
Gendered Undoing Through Music in James Joyce’s ‘The Dead’

Experience and music play an important role in almost every work by James Joyce. Usually the two are not mutually exclusive, since Joyce’s knowledge and incorporation of music emerges from his own experiences. Joyce often takes stories from his own life and reshapes them into powerful prose. The characters and settings in Joyce feel so vibrant and realistic because they are, in fact, grounded in reality. The premise for “The Dead” is prompted by both experience and music: the experience comes from Joyce’s wife, Nora, who once recounted to him a tale of love and loss when she was a young girl in West Ireland, while the music comes from a song by Thomas Moore called “Oh, Ye Dead!” that Joyce’s brother Stanislaus mentions in a letter to Joyce who was living in Rome at the time (Ellman, 253). Joyce blends these two elements to create a seamless story about life and death. The semi-truths that inspire “The Dead” give the story its plausibility, but many music critics would agree that music also establishes the reality of Joyce’s characters and plot. But music in “The Dead” does more than sustain reality, it creates meaning. Joyce’s formal structure, rhetorical style, and use of external musical material all contribute to Joyce’s musical plan for “The Dead”.

James Joyce was quite the musical man; his father was a singer and over the years Joyce developed a great love of music and singing. Like his characters who encapsulate multiple aspects of a musical person, Joyce kept up with the musical trends and was well versed in musical terminology and basic musical theory. With this immense knowledge of music at hand it is easy to see how Joyce could employ a variety of musical methods to attain further meaning in “The Dead”. The broadest musical element used in “The Dead” is the general musical form of the text. Jack Weaver claims that *Dubliners* is a piece that works as a theme and variations and
“The Dead” is the final movement of the piece (27). He believes that each story in *Dubliners* exists on its own but works in variation of a greater theme that encapsulates the entire group of short stories. Though I agree with this statement, I would suggest that on an even smaller scale, “The Dead” itself works as a theme and variations, essentially emulating a simple sonata form.

Following the sonata form the first section, like the opening of a sonata, announces its general themes: the would-be Irish artist’s self-betrayal and the potentiality of life against the eventuality of death (Brunsdale, 37). We are introduced to Gabriel Conroy, the apparent protagonist, and his wife Gretta as they attend an annual holiday party at the house of Gabriel’s two matronly aunts. Gabriel, as it turns out, is not only an intellectual, but an Anglo-leaning intellectual as we learn from Miss Ivors, who while dancing with Gabriel, chastises him for writing for a West Briton paper. Gabriel’s Anglicized nature not only plays against the general question of Irishness that creeps up throughout the text but also plays an important role in relation to his wife. Gretta comes from Galway, a county in the west of Ireland; Gabriel’s displeasure for all things west of Dublin plays an important part later in the story when Gretta recounts a tale from her youth. Death, the greatest theme in the story, appears subtly in the first section with seemingly indifferent observations that only later get fully realized. It is snowing outside and Gabriel comments that Gretta would walk home in the snow if she were allowed to which is a subtle nod to Gretta’s past (Joyce, 180). The snow in this opening scene seems inconsequential but plays a vital role in the final scene of the story where Gabriel equates the falling of snow to the descent of the dead. Death also subtly makes its way into the first description of Gabriel’s aunt’s as their old age is immediately put into context: “Julia, though she was quite grey, was still the leading soprano in Adam and Eve’s, and Kate, being too feeble to go about much, gave music lessons to beginners on the old square piano in the little back room,”
This sentence at first seems purely introductory, but takes greater shape later in the novel when Gabriel supposes he will return to their house shortly to attend Aunt Julia’s funeral. These snippets are details that occur in minute form but later emerge into later key motifs relating to death.

The first variation in this theme occurs when Aunt Julia performs “Arrayed for the Bridal” in front of the entire dinner party. Gabriel Conroy notices how the youthfulness of the song contrasts with Julia’s old age:

“Her voice strong and clear in tone, attacked with great spirit the runs which embellish the air and though she sang very rapidly she did not miss even the smallest of the grace notes. To follow the voice, without looking at the singer’s face, was to feel and share the excitement of swift and secure flight,” (193).

The entire party is taken by Julia’s wonderful singing, especially Freddy Malins who is convinced that her voice has never sounded so fresh. But not even the youthfulness of the song can help Aunt Julia evade death as Gabriel later supposes that the next time he’ll come to visit his aunt’s home will be for Aunt Julia’s funeral. Before the guests go into dinner, Gabriel finds his wife trying to persuade Miss Ivors to stay for dinner; Gabriel seems to blame himself for her departure thinking that he has upset her during their earlier talk about his lacking Irish identity. Finally in this first variation, Gabriel gives a dinner speech that does more to further the political and social views of his character than further any previous motifs.

The second and final variation also serves as a recapitulation so that the themes that were subtly invoked in the opening movement and first variation come into play in full effect and carry the story to its end. This final movement starts when the party guests begin to leave and Gabriel notices Gretta on the top of the stairs listening to distant music: it is the tenor Bartell
D’Arcy singing “The Lass of Aughrim,” in another room. This song, sung in the “old Irish tonality,” reminds Gretta of a moment in her childhood when the sick boy she loved braved the rain to sing her goodbye before she left for Dublin. Gretta is deeply affected by this song and when the couple returns to the hotel they are staying at, Gabriel questions the root of Gretta’s distress. Gretta tells Gabriel of the memory resurrected by “The Lass of Aughrim” and falls asleep before Gabriel can get anything more out of her. In this final scene Gabriel Conroy cannot connect to his distant wife, who seems to be lost in the memory of her dead love.

The two variations are highlighted by the introduction of a new song. Joyce uses “Arrayed for the Bridal” and “The Lass of Aughrim” as markers for these variations but these songs also serve the purpose of adding meaning to the story without adding text. “Arrayed for the Bridal,” which highlights the entrance of the first variation is an upbeat song about a young woman preparing for her wedding day. This song is clearly ironic since the woman singing it is an old, unmarried matron who stands as the essential opposite of the main character of the song. “Arrayed for the Bridal” is an aria by the Romantic composer Vincenzo Bellini from the opera “The Puritans.” The Anglicized lyrics that describe the prospect of a happy wedding mock Aunt Julia’s spinsterhood as well as her nationality; however, her mastery of the demanding romantic bel canto style shows that a truly gifted artist can defy time, if only for a little while (Brunsdaile, 42). “The Lass of Aughrim,” which signals the final variation, was originally an old Scottish song, but was later translated and adapted by the Irish. The song tells the tale of a woman, who in the past had been seduced and abandoned by Lord Gregory, appears at the Lord’s door with a child in tow in hopes of shelter from the rain (Ellman, 257). The Lord is asleep and his mother, imitating the voice of her son, sends the woman away. When the Lord awakens and discovers his mother’s actions, he sets off in pursuit of the woman and his child. These two songs, therefore,
stand not only as signals of changing themes in Joyce’s musical format, but as vaults for stored meaning. Like icebergs, their presence in the text appears only on the surface, but if one looks beneath the surface, much can be said to how the specifics of their musicality further affect the text.

The songs utilized in “The Dead” play an important role in sound and meaning. Mitzi Brunsdale claims that the specific musical selections are “interwoven as signaling motifs into Joyce’s narrative,” (38). The songs echo the events in the story and this parallel allows the reader to attach any external meaning from the songs onto the plot. Brunsdale highlights the importance of musical selections as a purposeful extra-material way of incorporating meaning into the text.

For example, the title “The Dead” derives from Thomas Moore’s “Oh, Ye Dead”; Thomas Moore is one of the most famously well-known Irish songwriters so it comes as no surprise that Joyce would have access to his music. In this song “the living ask the dead why they have returned to haunt the resting places of their loved ones, the dead reply that they wish to visit the scenes of their happy youth, pretending they are alive just once more” (Brunsdale, 41). The meaning within and arising from the song plays strongly into the overarching meaning of the story. And the theme of the dead wishing to return to the living occurs in the form of Michael Furey, who comes back to haunt Gretta by reminding her of their happy youth, as well as when Aunt Julia sings her aria, “Arrayed for the Bridal,” and is able emulate youth through her performance. Critics agree that Joyce was happiest when multiple allusions supported a principle one, and established songs that carry pre-existing meaning are perfect tools for creating multiple allusions. Music, as well as prose, has the ability to function as allusion: “the spoken and the unspoken, the heard and the unheard, in both music and literature, take their power from the work of allusion,” (Bucknell, 32). Essentially, how music and prose reflect against pre-existing
notions helps to confirm authenticity. The incorporation of Thomas Moore’s “Oh, Ye Dead!” into the title of the story helps affirm the theme of death intermingling with the living through its pre-existing allusions.

It is important to note that nearly all of Joyce’s characters are bounded by music in “The Dead”. Many of the characters are performers, who understand musical terminology and keep up with the musical traditions of the time. Even the characters who have little musical talent enjoy music on a basic level. Throughout the dinner party the guests sing, listen to, and speak about music. Party guests dance to the piano tunes of Mary Jane, listen avidly to Aunt Julia’s moving ballad, and discuss opera over the dinner table. Florence Wazl notes that the guests have a taste for “florid operatic arias” and “sentimental ballads” that dwell on the past (Henke, 44). Out of all the characters who appears in the story, it seems that Gabriel is decidedly the least musical. Keeping this in mind, Gabriel also seems to be the quickest to judge music. Since Gabriel believes himself to be the most “intellectual” person at the dinner party, it is quite odd to see his ignorant and judging nature towards music. He immediately dismisses Mary Jane’s recital piece in noting that no one around seems to be paying attention; he is critical about Aunt Julia’s performance through his inability to see past her age, and finally points out the flaws in Bartell D’Arcy’s singing in claiming that Bartell D’Arcy “seemed uncertain of both his words and of his voice” (210). Gabriel, who in the faintest manner falls under Joyce’s umbrella of aspiring-artist characters, judges artistic expression very quickly without producing his own. The story is principally filtered through Gabriel, even though the narrator is speaking from the third person, so his skeptical comments flow directly to the reader with no authority to check them.

Now that I have established the many forms in which music is used to maintain reality and signal variations to the theme, we can now explore more deeply how music creates and alters
meaning in “The Dead”. I’ve pointed out the significant musical moments of the story and now must look to musical criticism to fully access the value of music in “The Dead”. Music adds meaning to the story because it can convey what words alone cannot. As Catherine Clement puts it: “music is the unconscious of the text”; music appeals directly to the emotional soul of a person as it bypasses language to affect its listener (21). In “The Dead” Joyce almost solely invokes vocal music, which is music that incorporates language. Two forms of musical presentation that play a vital role in “The Dead” are lyrical song and opera. In this instance, the term “lyrical” describes the quality of a song having lyrics as opposed to the way it is used in lyrical poetry, where the term “lyrical” highlights expressed emotion and imagination. Lyrical song is put in opposition of purely instrumental music and the theory I will discuss will pertain only to music that contains lyrics. Brad Bucknell claims that language, as compared to instrumental music, is an inferior method of communication to and with the emotions, because in speech, the sound produced is a sign or a means to an end, while in music the sound is both the sign and an end in itself (Bucknell, 28). Thus, lyrical song and opera, which combines language with instrumental music, creates a fluid relationship between speech and sound. The relationship is strenuous and the two components play against each other in an instance where music must be guarded from its own lack of intelligibility and language moves towards its most expressive pole (Bucknell, 30).

Zack Bowen argues that music is used “to orchestrate and reiterate existing themes” and that it is used as an “organizing agent with ‘The Dead’” (11). His argument posits that the themes and signifiers brought up through lyrical music in “The Dead” can be helpful to our understanding of the story and that their specific placement in the story helps organize these themes. Lyrical music orchestrates these themes primarily through the external reference of a
song and the existing meaning that is already attached to it. This technique is not exclusive to just music, but works for any form of external piece of art. For example, the tower scene from *Romeo and Juliet* appears in a painting in “The Dead”, which allows the theme of tragic love to permeate the story through that external reference. This is a helpful tool because the theme of tragic love has already been strongly established in *Romeo and Juliet*, so the reader simply adjusts the established theme that emerges from the painting and attaches it to the plot of “The Dead”. Joyce is very careful as to when he utilizes these external references so that the external references carry the greatest amount of meaning. I’ve already mentioned that the incorporation of the two main songs occurs during each variation: these songs are not only meant to highlight change but they help to organize meaning and reiterate themes as well.

Music organizes themes and signifiers through its mere incorporation in the text, but smaller functions, such as repetition and silence, also help with this organizing within music and within the language of “The Dead” itself. In regards to general repetition and silence, Jacques Attali, a leading critic in noise theory, directly links these elements to themes of death advocating the way silence evokes death and claiming that “death can be felt in all of the places of repetition” (126). Silence is a lack of sound or a non-existence and such silence is a simple way to evoke death. If sound creates and maintains meaning, then silence is the lack of meaning and therefore means nothing. Attali and many others view movement and change in music as comparable to life, and stillness and silence as comparable to death. Bucknell distinguishes between active and passive silence, claiming that silence can appear with or without the intent of the author. He says that silence doesn’t need to be a passive lack of sound but rather an incorporation that is deliberate (32). It is easy to link silence to death but linking repetition to death is more complicated because, on one hand, repetition is an excess of something and each
repeat modifies meaning which emulates change and hence life. However, looking at repetition from a different angle, repeating something can also be viewed as a sameness or a stillness which is like death. We see silence and repetition in the musical form of “The Lass of Aughrim” as well as in Joyce’s musically influenced plot structure. It is much easier to draw out moments of repetition than moments of silence, mainly because Joyce’s silences are carefully utilized in briefs moments. Repetition can easily be seen in the snow at the beginning and end of the story, as well as in the repeating “Lass of Aughrim” synopsis where Gretta and Michael, Romeo and Juliet, and Lord Gregory and the Lass all parallel on another. These repetitions are easier to notice, but their relation to death is more complicated; however, snow is seen as a metaphor for death and one of each pair suffers a fate equal to or similar to death. Silence is harder to notice, but looking closely one might notice the silence of Aunt Julia, except for when she sings “Arrayed for the Bridal” or notice the silence behinds Gabriel’s ending inner monologue: both of these silences function as a tool to evoke themes of death.

The main form of repetition in “The Dead” doesn’t come from repeating sentences or phrases over but from a musical and literary tool known as “double-voicing”. Vocal music takes the concise words and transforms them into complimentary expressive musical form. This action brings in the tool of “double-voicing”, where the song contains the intention of the lyricist as well as the reflected intention of the composer (Scott, 15). To posit a simplistic example, a song with happy lyrics but sung in a minor key would be representing lyrics that are at odds with the music. The two would fight against each other and the listener would take neither the pleasant words nor the melancholy music for granted. However, a happy song with happy lyrics is also a manner of double-voicing because the duality heightens the happiness of the song. Through this technique, inflections such as irony can be conveyed by having the narrator mock the style of the
music or the voice. Mikhail Bakhtin, who originally coined the term “double-voice” believes that this technique is most successfully used for satire or parody. Though “The Dead” is not either of these, it has keen moments of satiric or parodic interplay. Double-voicing is a common technique in narration as well as in music, where the thoughts and actions of the characters are either heightened or negated by the author. We could almost call Joyce’s process quadruple-voicing because he layers the double-voicing of the songs he incorporates onto the double-voicing of the text he has written.

It is important to understand that while I will go into depth into the musical structures of “Arrayed for the Bridal” and particularly “The Lass of Aughrim”, “The Dead” is a text that is meant to be read and that some readers may never have listened to the songs that are fundamental to the story. Therefore the text must perform musically without any actual music. Derek B. Scott keenly notes that, “there is a distinction between the way words are combined with music and the way words are treated musically (11). In the case of vocal music, words are combined with music, but this implementation is dulled in “The Dead” since the reader does not experience this aurally. Of the two major songs referenced in “The Dead,” only a couple stanzas from “The Lass of Aughrim” make it into the text:

\[
O, \text{ the rain falls on my heavy locks} \\[8pt]\]
\[
\text{And the dew wets my skin,} \\[8pt]\]
\[
\text{My babe lies cold...} \quad (210)
\]

The reader gains no aural musical reference from these three lines on a page and the isolated text is a small screenshot of a much larger song. To Joyce, “The Lass of Aughrim” would have been a popular folk song widely known throughout the country and a majority of the readership would immediately recognize the musical references included in the story and immediately be able to
utilize their external musical material. For these readers, the song in its textual form would lift off the page and rejoin with its music. Presently, more and more readers are not familiar with the musical references and, in truth, the wonderful utilization of vocal music that extends and emphasizes meaning is lost on a wide proportion of Joyce’s audience. If the reader is familiar with “The Lass of Aughrim” he or she will immediately grasp onto the musical reference and understand these three lines as the pleading of the young women to be let into Lord Gregory’s castle, but for those who are unfamiliar, the lines of the song remain on the page and one can only glean from the silent work, the impact of the lyrics on the story. The diction of those three lines of lyrics brings about through their words a sense of vulnerability and exposure as the Lass sings from outside Lord Gregory’s castle. The multitude of words that propagate suffering stand out as “rain”, “wet”, and “cold” intensify the woman’s condition. The “rain falls” and the “dew wets”, allowing nature to play an active role in the Lass’s suffering. The final line creates a sense of vulnerability as the women mentions her child who is also suffering and as Joyce adds an ominous final ellipse. Though Joyce’s utilization of music is prevalent throughout the story, this short excerpt is the only direct inclusion of the music’s lyrics into the text. The remainder of the lyrical music to which reference are made is only ever mentioned in title. This lack of lyrical incorporation throughout the story does not dull the importance of including words that are combined with music because its titular references provide an external link to this form of musical incorporation of text. In essence, the lyrics and tonality of the song play an important of a role in maintaining and refining meaning in the text even if one must look outside the text to find it. And perhaps the sole inclusion of a singular, brief lyrical moment, may serve, in its uniqueness, to heighten the most climatic moment of the story.
Since Joyce employs a variety of musical forms that range from speaking about music to distinct musical references, I must also include that Joyce on occasion does treat words musically. For example, for pages the young guest Freddy Malins is telling a story that nobody seems to be listening to, he keeps getting handed off from person to person, and it is with Mr. Browne that that he reaches the climax of his story in a very musical manner: “Freddy Malins exploded, before he had well reached the climax of his story, in a kind of high-pitched bronchitic laughter,” (185). Here Freddy’s “high-pitched bronchitic laughter” are words that are treated musically. This sentence to me seems like a literary version of a deceptive cadence for two major reasons, firstly because Freddy explodes before he reaches his climax, secondly because it is too early in the story to acknowledge a legitimate climax, and thirdly because Freddy Malins is a side character with no grand purpose set aside for him in the story. Perhaps Joyce is giving us a taste of what a deceptive cadence looks like musically: to be clear, a deceptive cadence is the end of an order of chords that finishes unexpectedly. In classical notation musical pieces only ended on perfect cadences so that any type of deception signifies that the piece cannot come to a close. Freddy’s climatic laughter provides a false finish since its incorporation has little to do with the order of events in the story.

Operatic form is a specific type of vocal music that is implemented throughout “The Dead”. This mainly comes about in discussion about opera singers at dinner and in Aunt Julia’s singing of “Arrayed for the Bridal” which is an excerpt from an opera. Catherine Clément’s book Opera, or the Undoing of Women, a seminal work that shows how classical opera structure constantly projects the death or downfall of the main female character, presents a model in opera that easily transitions into literature. Clément’s main argument is that on the opera stage, women perpetually sing their eternal undoing (5). She proceeds to list countless operas, pointing out in
each one how women are effectually undone (most of the time this is effected by death) by either their masculine counterparts or by the masculine composer/librettist. She keys in to how the heightened emotion invigorated in this moment of destruction is the height of emotion in the Opera, but more importantly into the violent and masculine-oriented gendered pattern that is countlessly repeated. If the main female character does not physically die, then her voice lifts up to die and signifies death figuratively (5). The male lead then survives the female and finds revelation and acceptance through his love’s death. Of all the operas Clement lists, Carmen by Georges Bizet stands as an ideal exemplification of this masculine commodity. Premiering in 1875, the opera tells the story of Carmen, a gypsy who seduces the soldier Don Jose, but when Don Jose loses Carmen’s love to the toreador Escamillo, Don Jose kills her in a fit of jealousy. In the final act, Carmen climatically sings her own undoing as she refuses Don Jose’s love. After Carmen is dead, Don Jose, realizing the terrible deed he has done in the name of love turns himself over to the police. Even though Carmen was written and composed by two French men in the 19th century, many musical critics prescribe a proto-feminist reading of “Carmen”: this is essentially because Carmen is a female protagonist who does not follow the desires and whims of men. However, Clement makes an excellent point that in the most climactic point of the opera, Carmen pays the ultimate price for her feministic nature by dying. So even though the proto-feminist argument succeeds in its depiction of Carmen, the argument can only be taken so far since in the ending is veritably masculine. This also shows that the way a story ends has heightened repercussions for the story itself, especially in its most climactic moment: an ending has the potential – in a similar vein to the function of “double-voicing” – to heighten or undo all that has been established previously.
This pattern Clement has found in opera can be transferred to “The Dead” because stylistically, Joyce’s works of prose categorically follow a slow progression towards modernity – in music just as in language – and within this progression “The Dead” fits into the period equated with the height of opera. The schema in simplistic terms follows as such: Chamber Music and Dubliners begins in a style that is reminiscent of the Baroque and Classical eras respectively, Stephen Hero and A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man follow in the Romantic style, and finally Ulysses and Finnegans Wake delve into the 20th century modernism of atonality and serialism. Though overall Joyce’s work follows this progression, it’s is a slightly simplistic understanding of his works since, for example, the first three chapters of Ulysses greatly resemble the Romantic style of Portrait and the end of Dubliners includes some Romantic characteristic as well. Some of Joyce’s musical moments are not so easily labeled, and even though this simple progression helps to generally understand the text from a historically musical perspective, we should take notice that complexities in the schema may arise. Following this stylistic format, it make sense that Joyce’s characters follow traditional operatic roles when the story is stylistically set in the musical period where opera thrived.

Jack Weaver makes an audacious and over-generalized claim that the style used in “The Dead” uses “apprenticeship techniques” that incorporate music in various easy ways, and I would argue against such a simplistic and potentially unhelpful shaping of Joyce’s stylistic techniques (22). Weaver essentially means that the fully realized techniques that are used in Ulysses and Finnegans Wake can be seen to a more simplistic effect in Joyce’s earlier works. But to pose a counterexample, modernist composer Arnold Schoenberg essentially “fully realizes” techniques used by Romantic composer Johannes Brahms, but this does not make the works created by Brahms any more simple or easy. No one would dare consider the work done
by Brahms to be “apprenticeship techniques,” therefore it is a drastic overstatement to assert these notions onto Joyce’s earlier works. “The Dead” may contain a multitude of forms that get fully realized in his later works, but this does not mean that Joyce incorporates these forms in “The Dead” in “various easy ways”. If the sonata form I pointed out earlier in “The Dead” is a predecessor for the fugue utilized in the “Sirens” chapter of *Ulysses*, this does not change the artistic complexity of evoking a musical sonata into textual form. Instead it shows the Joyce’s ability to move fluidly across genres, accessing different stylistic embellishments from different musical periods to accentuate his literary style.

“The Dead” reflects a paradigm of Classical opera and prose on a general scale, but Allan Hepburn takes this implementation of Classical era operas onto “The Dead” to a more specific scope as he compares characters in “The Dead” to operatic figures that adhere to specific gender roles. This transfer is quite applicable in “The Dead” due to the aforementioned musical progression of Joyce’s work even though there are no operatic references attributed specifically to the main characters. So to follow Hepburn’s initiative, we must successfully position the characters of the story in the proper operatic gender roles. Gabriel and Gretta Conroy are the male and female leads in this transference; their engendered relationship parallels the leads in operas such as *Madama Butterfly, Carmen, Turandot*, and *La Traviata*. In each of these operas – except perhaps for *Turandot* which was never finished by Puccini and has a happy ending that was added on later – the paradigm of the lead male character being directly responsible for the lead female character’s undoing is prevalent. Catherine Clement remarks that, “all the main female characters in these operas die a death prepared for them by a slow plot, woven by furtive, fleeting heroes, up to their glorious moment; a sung death. Signs of death are sprinkled throughout the opera, infinitesimal signs, infinitely interwoven with songs of love “(45).
The character of Gabriel Conroy is at least initially portrayed as an operatic hero because “The Dead” is a masculine narrative that gives us many more glimpses into the minds of men than the minds of women so that the reader empathizes more with the male characters (Wazl, 53). This is very easy to see since we are constantly given access to Gabriel’s mind, while we only access Gretta’s when she verbalizes what she’s thinking. However, Margot Norris disagrees with this appropriation, instead claiming that Joyce’s beautiful prose is inimical to the female subject which allows the reader to identify as both subjectively female and politically feminist (217). She thinks that even if the reader sees the world through a male character, Joyce’s writing has the ability to overcome this masculine domination. She sees any proto-masculine writing as purposely inviting skepticism into the reader’s mind. I would agree with both these points to the extent that the author and main character are male and we are thus forced to read “The Dead” with a masculine emphasis, but elements of Joyce’s subtle prose give way to the skepticism that Norris suggests. When Miss Ivors scolds Gabriel for writing in the West Briton newspaper, Gabriel retorts within his mind that “literature is above politics” and the reader is forced into skepticism due to Gabriel’s grandiose and exaggerated statement. Since Gabriel is our main character whose eyes we see through it makes sense that most of the male dynamic skepticism is invoked through Gabriel. Mitzi Brunsdale says that, “Gabriel’s heavy-handed humor reveals his egotistical dismissal of women and the resentful insecurity that underlies it” (38). Through this humor we see both his orientation towards masculine dominance and just how imperfect his notions are.

Gabriel’s masculine archetype and the skepticism that is subtly invoked is heightened through the way that Gabriel interacts with the women in the story, especially with his wife. Margot Norris keenly notes that Joyce wants us to be skeptical of Gabriel’s “romanticizing
infantilization of his wife,” (218). Gabriel takes an active role in suppressing Gretta’s desires and making the world around her unfamiliar. For example, Gabriel essentially keeps Gretta away from her home back in West Ireland. When Molly Ivors’ invitation to vacation in the Aran Isles reaches Gretta’s ears she can’t help but express her excitement:

   “His wife clasped her hands excitedly and gave a little jump.
   - O, do go, Gabriel, she cried. I’d love to see Galway again.
   - You can go if you like, said Gabriel coldly.” (191)

In this moment Gretta is struck with immense happiness at the prospect of seeing her family and childhood home. Gabriel’s instant dismissal and the fact that Gretta does not argue back represents that this general dismissal of female desire is normal for Gabriel in his relationship with his wife. Norris’s presentation of this argument shows that she views Gabriel as an actively misogynistic man who has gone to great lengths to isolate and oppress his wife, but it seems more probable that Gabriel falls prey to an unavoidable tradition of gender constructs that have been in place for centuries. Just as the men in the numerous operas mentioned by Catherine Clement inadvertently subject their female counterparts to gender-specific violence or death, Gabriel acts in the same manner with no intentional violence. This passivity does not deny nor does it pardon Gabriel for what he has done to his wife, but Norris’ analysis of Gabriel’s actions supposes a malicious nature which Gabriel does not possess.

The most successful form of Gabriel’s passive gendered oppression comes through the process of “othering”. This occurs when the man has alienated his wife so much from her family and friends that eventually he alienates her from himself so that the woman standing in front of him is no longer his wife but an “other” woman (Norris, 225). She stands as an idealized, yet foreign version of the woman he initially knew. This oppressive process often tends to
consequently work against the man who is actively isolating his wife since the alienated woman reciprocates this othering in labeling her husband as “another man”. This counter-process can easily be seen after Gabriel has heard Gretta’s story, as he comes to realize the full effect of his othering:

He watched her while she slept as though he and she had never lived together as man and wife. His curious eyes rested long upon her face and on her hair: and as he thought of what she must have been then, in that time of her first girlish beauty, a strange friendly pity for her entered his soul. He did not like to say even to himself that her face was no longer beautiful but her knew that it was no longer that face for which Michael Furey had braced death” (222)

Gabriel’s intrinsic desire to alienate his wife inevitably fails because at the end of the story this othering is returned upon himself. He realizes that instead of labeling Gretta as “other woman” he has been unconsciously working to label himself as “other man”. Gabriel’s is so far removed from his wife that it comes as a shock when he finally realizes that he’s never truly known her. The emotion of this shock sets in a page later when tears fill Gabriel’s eyes and he laments that he had never felt true love towards any woman (223).

Gabriel and Gretta clearly fit within the parameter of classical opera gender constructs but during this final scene in which Gabriel’s gendered othering is forcibly reciprocated upon himself, Joyce has the potential to undo all the gendered stereotypes that have been previously noted. Joyce skillfully alters the ending so that instead of the woman singing her eternal undoing at the expense of the man’s climatic epiphany, Gretta refuses to be made undone. This is because instead of singing her own undoing, Gretta instead evokes the music of others as protection: she listens to Bartell D’Arcy sing “The Lass of Aughrim” at the end of the party and uses this music later to protect herself from her husband’s advances. Clement argues that in music there is “something feminine that will never let itself be penetrated, never be had,” (13). Once Gretta
evokes “The Lass of Aughrim”, she is, in a sense, untouchable to her husband. Gabriel cannot access the greatness of the meaning of the music in relation to Gretta and thus can “penetrate” neither the music nor Gretta. This is possible because Gretta does not take up the role of singer; it is, instead, Bartell D’Arcy that brings “The Lass of Aughrim” to Gretta. This brings up two necessary arguments that allow Gretta to reject the traditional operatic ending: that masculinity is not seen directly when it performs and that Gretta cannot sing her own demise because she cannot sing (Hepburn, 200). The men who sing in “The Dead” are located either behind walls or in the past. Both Bartell D’Arcy and Michael Furey sing “The Lass of Aughrim” in “The Dead” but neither are physically seen doing so since D’Arcy is singing from another room and we only hear of Michael’s singing from Gretta’s burdened memory. We hear of great male singers during the dinner-time discussion, but all of these singers are rooted in the past. Normally the direct performance of both the male and female leads predicate their own suffering on stage, but in this case we do not see male performance and the female lead, Gretta, does not have the facility to effect this gendered ending. “The Dead” is full of musical characters, but Gretta is not one of them; she does not have the facilities to sing her own undoing and hence remains impervious to her husband’s desires.

Gretta then embodies “The Lass of Aughrim” and the incorporation of the song affects the plot in a number of ways. Jack Weaver states that “music and musical language serve as a means of connecting past and present,” so that initiating a song into the textual landscape of the piece automatically fits the characters into a past canon (18). The incorporation of any musical reference into a text will include all of the allusions from the music, into freeing the author from having to point actively to these allusions himself. “The Lass of Aughrim,” acting as the final musical reference, layers meaning and attaches the subtle revoking of a gendered operatic ending
onto the characters. “The Lass of Aughrim” even reaches outside of the text to parallel Joyce’s relationship with his life Nora, and even though this parallel does not add much to the musical reading of the story, it shows how widely a song can serve as a form of connection. In “The Lass of Aughrim” it is Lord Gregory who is at the window of the castle while the Lass stands outside in the rain. The most obvious transfer is Gretta (originally Nora) at the window of her house while Michael Furey stands outside. Gretta’s childhood sweetheart, Michael Fury, mimics the actions of the woman at the door of the Lord when he appears at Gretta’s window in poor weather to say goodbye before she leaves for Dublin. This transfer is the most direct because of the character’s physical position: one character stands out in the rain while the other stays warm inside. On a psychological level, Gabriel is the one standing outside the window of Gretta’s mind at the end of the story. Gretta does not allow her husband to access her thoughts or her psychological state even though he presses her for that information. At the same time, Gabriel parallels the figure of Lord Gregory in his treatment of women; his othering of women turns him into the Lord that can’t immediately recognize the women who has born him his child. Gabriel also parallels the Lord initially seducing the Lass in his initial actions towards the housemaid Lily. Julia Henigan claims that Gabriel’s mother’s hostility towards Gretta emulates the Lord’s mother’s hostility towards the lass (136). Joyce even includes parallels that have no association with the characters of “The Dead”: he notes that in the Morkan’s house there is a painting of the

---

1 Joyce first learned about “The Lass of Aughrim” from his wife Nora who recalled the song from her Galway girlhood (Brunsdaile, 44). It is befitting that Joyce learns the song from his wife since the entire premise of Gretta’s past romance with Michael Furey is based on a similar experience his wife had as a young girl. A young man by the name of Michael Bodkin courted the young Nora when she was a girl, but he contracted tuberculosis. On the day Nora was to leave for Dublin, Michael stole out of his sickbed to see Nora off. Clearly Joyce did not like to know that Nora’s heart was moved even in pity by another man, so he mitigated the story of “The Lass of Aughrim” onto a modern Dublin tale (Ellman, 252).
balcony scene from Shakespeare’s *Romeo and Juliet* and Margot Norris observes that Romeo braving Juliet’s hostile home to declare his love has a mirrors “The Lass of Aughrim” (228). The inclusion of this painting presents added significance when layered with the meaning of the song. Just as music helps establish the reality of Joyce’s characters the inclusion of a major English canonic reference that fits into the musical paradigm assist the affirmation of the music as a concrete allusion.

Gabriel mentions that the song is sung by Bartell D’Arcy in the “old Irish tonality” and that the tenor “seemed uncertain both of his words and of his voice” (210). Julia Henigan expands on this vague allocation of style, saying that Joyce almost certainly meant to suggest what is commonly called the ‘modality’ of many traditional Irish melodies. In this instance the term ‘modality’ refers to the European diatonic modes, especially those not corresponding to the modern major and minor keys. To be clear, the diatonic mode is a scale or a series of eight notes played only on the white keys of a piano. Starting on a different note will then produce a different diatonic mode. Many composers of the time would then use a pentatonic scale which narrows the diatonic into the first five series of notes. This scale structure differs drastically to our modern scale structure which is made of different keys in corresponding major and minor modes. These modes were created before major and minor modes existed, and while major and minor modes give us a great range of variety and flexibility, many instruments pre-1800 did not have the capacity to play in this way. This is why the tonality of “The Lass of Aughrim” is decidedly sad even though there are not many minor intervals. Henigan goes into greater detail in describing the songs tonal quality, ascribing “pentatonic character in the choice of stressed note or in whole phrases” or the “avoidance of a particular degree”, but she reluctantly sums these more complicated musical terms up as a specifically traditional Irish tone (141). According to
Mitzi Brunsdale, this difference in scale structure is the real reason why Bartell D’Arcy performs it so poorly and not because of his cold (44). D’Arcy is not accustom to this older and outdated musical form and hence he cannot sing the song to the best of his abilities.

This “old Irish tonality” is important in its effect of emotion and in its relation to Gretta’s childhood. The sadness invoked by “The Lass of Aughrim” is clear even without a learned musical background. Nora Joyce once wrote in a letter to her husband that listening to “The Lass of Aughrim” caused tears to come from her eyes (Henigan, 141). Joyce was apparently taken by both the parallels in the song’s plot as well as its emotional effectiveness. Julie Henigan explains that in pre-modern Ireland, traditional music was divided into three groups: weeping, laughing, and sleeping music. “The Lass of Aughrim” falls into the “weeping music” group because “it provokes a sense of sadness, even grief.” (142). The song repeats the same eight bars for the entirety of the song with little variation, but the melody and its accompaniment are so poignant that the songs simplicity positively effects its sadness. I have explained that “old Irish tonality” refers to a pre-modern modality folk music and songs of this sort would still be sung in the West of Ireland where a greater number of people speak Irish and perform songs in the folk tradition. This musical association with the nation’s West brings the song closer to Gretta and farther from her Anglicized husband. It is Gabriel who notes this “old Irish tonality” and this is a sign that Gabriel cannot connect with this music. His Anglo-leaning nature distances him from the impact of the music’s emotional prowess, bringing him to a point where he dismisses the music as other just as he dismisses his wife as other. The song is particularly catered towards Gretta, who is truly Irish, and the musical impact of the song allows Gretta to re-experience a grief she has suppressed during her marriage to Gabriel (Henigan, 145). It is easy to see how Gretta’s embracing of “The Lass of Aughrim” plays a part in her reconciliation of the dead. The song is,
for Joyce, “a symbol of the free and open expressions of love” and Gretta embodies this love in her memory of Michael Furey (Brunsdale, 44).

However much the song is catered towards Gretta and stays in her mind well into the night, Gabriel’s mind has moved onto other things once they reach the hotel. Even in the carriage he longs to be alone in the hotel with his wife: “When the others had gone away, when he and she were in their room in the hotel, then they would be alone together” (Joyce, 214). This desire intensifies even though he notices that Gretta is in a strange mood: “he was in such a fever of rage and desire that he did not hear her come from the window” (Joyce, 217). Finally before Gretta admits that the song and her young lost love are on her mind, she gives him a kiss and Gabriel is overwhelmed with passion: “he urged to cry to her from his soul, to crush her body against his, to overmaster her” (Joyce, 217). Gabriel’s passion increases in violence as well as intensity as it moves from subtle desire to forceful longing. Gabriel’s initial desire of being alone with his wife evolve into a wish to “crush her” and “overmaster her.” Gabriel’s words exude violence in their admiration of Gretta and in this moment Gabriel fully embodies the male archetype during an operatic ending, raising his inner voice as a singer would lift up his actual voice before taking the direct action to undo his female counterpart. But before Gabriel can strike his final blow, Gretta discloses how “The Lass of Aughrim” reminded her of importantly her first and truest love. She embodies the song, and Gabriel is left speechless and unable to carry out this process of undoing.

Gretta then falls asleep and Gabriel is left to ponder this interaction with his wife and the overall effect of the living upon the dead. Joyce leaves us with a vague interior monologue as the reader is allowed snippets of Gabriel’s mind as he reflects. This leads to an ambiguous ending in which a strong debate has arisen between critics as to whether, after Gretta falls asleep, Gabriel
achieves revelation and understanding or remains ignorant in his masculine-driven, egotistical world. Mitzi Brunsdale on a very general scale believes that this final scene “recapitulates Joyce’s themes and exalts them to an understanding of the relation between art and life in Gabriel’s epiphanic revelation, which is brought about through his wife’s story about Michael Furey,” (Brunsdale, 40). She believes that Gabriel is determined to seek a new level of growth and achievement as a human being in the “death” of his old being and the “resurrection” that Joyce felt to be essential to the creation of true art. In this layout, Gabriel heroically martyrs his old misogynistic self so that he may be reborn with a new sense of humanity. This reading sees Gabriel as well-intended, yet ending up in an unforeseeable situation that he quickly choses to amend. Gabriel admits inwardly that, “the time had come to set out on his journey westward,” which could be interpreted as a resolve to work both towards his Irish heritage and towards his wife (223). This “journey westward” also highlights Gabriel’s rebirth in its metaphorical movement toward death; the West is where the sun sets and the day ends or even dies and Gabriel sets out in this direction because death must occur before rebirth².

This reading of the ending of “The Dead” follows the nature of eiphany that is echoed throughout the end of many of Joyce’s works. To follow Jack Weaver’s earlier argument, the epiphanic ending is a theme and in each short story of Dubliners that ending is varied, echoing epiphany in different ways. For example “Araby”, the third short story in Dubliners, has an epiphanic ending that loosely echoes the ending of “The Dead”. In the story, a young boy narrates his desire to attend the Araby Bazaar in order to please the girl he dotes on. He manages

² Other than being highly sympathetic to the main character, this reading of the end of “The Dead” is understandable when one takes into account the potential echoing of Joyce onto Gabriel. If Gabriel is a projection of Joyce, then we can read an authorial intent for the male character to understand his wrongdoings and decide to amend them in the future.
to reach the bazaar right as the festivities reach a close and find disillusionment in his own actions. He concludes the story: “Gazing up into the darkness I saw myself as a creature driven and derided by vanity; and my eyes burned with anguish and anger” (35). In this final realization, the young boy sees his the folly of his action and the disenchantment that follows it. This ending’s variation is quite tangible to that in “The Dead”. The final story finishes: “His soul swooned slowly as he heard the snow falling faintly through the universe and faintly falling, like the descent of their last end, upon all the living and the dead.” Both endings deal with a contemplation, a realization that a character has achieved and finish on a strong final thought. “Araby” shows the concurrence of disenchantment in in *Dubliners* and how Joyce uses such an emotion for epiphanic revelation. The boy realizes that the actions that have brought him to the empty Araby Bazaar have stemmed from vanity and Gabriel realizes that his actions have played a part in othering his wife. It is important to keep in mind Joyce’s use of disenchantment and epiphanic endings when considering how “The Lass of Aughrim” shapes the ending of “The Dead”.

While some critics believe in Gabriel’s revelation and its promise of rebirth, others believe that Gabriel’s misogynistic actions are purposeful throughout the story and that he makes no such realization at the end. Norris believes that Gabriel plays an active role in othering his wife and though he is upset about its reciprocating affect, he does not wish to stop this behavior at any point. Though Norris’ argument appears to be a bit drastic, much of Gabriel’s final reflections support his active – and probably continuous – dismissal and othering of women: “it hardly pained him not to think how poor a part he, her husband, had played in her life” and “he did not like to say even to himself that her face was no longer beautiful but he knew that it was no longer the face for which Michael Furey has braved death” (222). These moments amplify the
continuity of Gabriel’s gendered othering, and his unwillingness to learn from his encounter with Gretta. Gabriel even admits on the penultimate page that he had never truly loved his wife, and his eyes fill with tears at the knowledge the she has felt that way toward some other and that he has never felt that way towards any women (223). Taking a similar authorial-based reasoning to the one mentioned in the previous argument, it is just as easily foreseeable that Joyce would take a personal experience and conflate his own character into something other than himself. Perhaps he noticed that it troubled him to learn that his wife, Nora, had once loved another man in such a way and he took these feelings of jealousy and distress and heightened them in his transfer into Gabriel.

These two opinions appear to be the extremes at each opposite end of the spectrum: Gabriel is either the helplessly passive husband with no malicious intent who, in heroic fashion, pardons his wife from a gendered undoing that he had never meant to do in the first place, or Gabriel is the active misogynist who is in a constant process of othering his wife, as well as all the other women around him, who then finds the process reverted back unto himself much to his displeasure. I believe it is more fitting to settle somewhere in the middle of this spectrum where Gabriel falls prey to a gender construction and tradition that has been in place for centuries. Just as the men in the numerous operas Clement references subject their female counterparts to gendered violence or death, Gabriel acts in the same manner with no incentive, or at the very least without any conscious volition. This does not pardon Gabriel for what he has done to his wife, but it does not posit Gabriel as the misogynist who actively strives to undo the women in his life. In this argument, Gabriel’s actions are not judged less harshly, but his intent is put into a more reasonable perspective.
A closer reading of the ending furthers this middle view where Gabriel’s othering is an action the modern reader cannot excuse, but his final contemplation can be understood as a successful epiphanic revelation due to feelings of disenchantment. Gretta’s mentioning of “The Lass of Aughrim” stands as the turning point of Gabriel’s revelation. Before Gretta brings up “The Lass of Aughrim”, Gabriel’s thoughts circle around domination and violence: Gabriel longs “to be master” and to “overmaster” his wife but understands that his desire “to take her as she was would be brutal” (217). As Gabriel deals with Gretta’s distant nature in the hotel his thoughts turn to those of violence and power. It is with these thoughts that we cannot excuse Gabriel for his overall treatment of women, no matter how deeply it is engrained into his psyche as a form of normalcy. However, Gretta in evoking “The Lass of Aughrim” does not only take action to prevent her own undoing but causes a change in Gabriel’s attitude as Gabriel’s cold jealousy quickly turns to humility and the shame of his errors comes crashing swiftly over him. Her statement: “O, I am thinking about that song, The Lass of Aughrim” stands as a visual and aural marker of the final cadence where Gabriel’s revelation is fully realized (218). Gabriel materializes the sum of his anger and jealousy into the form of a “vindictive being” who seemingly tries to reverse the process of reconciliation, but Gabriel “shook himself free of it with an effort of reason” and continues to listen to his wife (220). This “being” acts as the unfathomable side of Gabriel’s ego, urging him to continue the inadequate treatment of his wife. The emotion and vocal climax of both Gretta’s tale and “The Dead” occurs as she utters: “O, the day I heard that, that he was dead!” and then “overcome by emotion, flung herself face downward on the bed, sobbing in the quilt” (221). Amid this outburst of emotion, Gabriel finds that he can no longer intrude on Gretta’s grief, he leaves her on the bed and she falls asleep almost directly after this outburst of emotion and Gabriel is left alone with his thoughts. He
realizes that because of his treatment of Gretta and the history of her past love, the two had never truly lived together as man and wife (222). Gabriel’s revelation and rebirth begins as he lies down in bed next to Gretta, thinking about his wife and thinking about death. He compares his Aunt Julia’s imminent death to Michael Furey’s death saying “better pass boldly into that other world, in the full glory of some passion, than fade and wither dismally with age” (223). This reflects the sadness Gabriel feels that he has never felt any true passion or love towards someone else, and with dread, he sees himself following the path of Aunt Julia who is withering with age. Tears fill Gabriel’s eyes in the penultimate page as a physical reaction to the revelation he is in the process of making. Gabriel then reaches the point of his contested death and rebirth as his soul feels nearer to the dead:

“Tears gathered more thickly in his eyes and in the partial darkness he imagined he saw the form of a young man standing under a dripping tree. Other forms were near. His soul had approached that region, where dwell the vast hosts of the dead. He was conscious of, but could not apprehend, their wayward and flickering existence his own identity was fading out into a grey impalpable world: the solid world itself which these dead had one time reared and lived in was dissolving and dwindling” (223).

Gabriel first pictures Michael Furey as he was at Gretta’s window, in a final evocation of “The Lass of Aughrim.” The resonating image of the lover outside the tower haunts Gabriel as his thoughts turn away from Michael and reach more generally to death and the dead. Many critics consider this last section as the moment that evokes the inspiration for the title of the story, Thomas Moore’s “O, Ye Dead.” Henigan states that “the language of Moore’s song and the sense it imparts of the dead haunting the world of the living is vividly recalled” as the dead visit Gabriel in his moment of revelation (139). Just as the reader is drawn into this space where the
dead and living come into contact, Gabriel notices the snowfall outside. This snow resonates in two ways: first, it is a motif that brings us back to the very beginning of the story and second, it paints a visceral picture of this shared space. The final snow recalls one of Gabriel’s initial unintentionally prophetic statements in response to Lily asking if it was snowing outside: “Yes, Lily, he answered, and I think we’re in for a night of it” (177). The snow creates this connection from past to present, from living to dead, and from beginning to end. Gabriel pictures the snow falling throughout Ireland, moving its way westward until it reaches Michael Furey’s grave in Galway. The final sentence finds Gabriel’s old identity fading away with those of the dead, making the journey westward, and this death promises potential rebirth for Gabriel: “His soul swooned slowly as he heard the snow falling faintly through the universe and faintly falling, like the descent of their last end, upon all the living and the dead” (224). Gabriel’s swooning soul is the ultimate sign of rebirth as he makes this epiphanic revelation. It is not just Gabriel’s heart or his mind, but his soul that swoons with this realization; it is his soul that has come into contact with the dead, and his soul that feels the effect of this epiphany, which signals the success of Gabriel’s revelation and rebirth.

This reading of the ending allows for Gabriel to successfully come about his epiphany, but maintains a strong feminine arc where Gretta actively embodies music to oppose the overpowering male. Ellen Henke comments on Joyce’s overall literary feminism: “from Chamber Music to Finnegans Wake, Joyce deflates the male power drive that sanctions conquest as a form of master – whether in the political arena or in the theater of domestic conflict” (xiv). “The Dead” is so successful in deflating Gabriel’s male power because the plot falls into a pattern reminiscent of those operas and stories that sanction conquest as a form of mastery. Joyce surrounds the story in this format, from the character stereotypes to the multiplicity of musical
references. He is then able to create a poignant shift at the end of the story as the plot shifts into a significantly feminist ending. Contrary to what Gabriel believes, art is not above politics and political factors such as social class, gender, and age produce art (Norris, 219). Here Joyce successfully uses gender to produce a story that is not only artistically powerful, but politically – in terms of gender politics – important as well. Clement associates Joyce with the linguistic prowess to use language to affect gender in a subtle way. She speaks on lyrical music, saying that “the words give rise to the music and the music develops the language, gives it dialect, envelops it, thwarts or reinforces it (121). This is specifically true with the incorporation of “The Lass of Aughrim,” in which the song works in tandem with Joyce’s language to further meaning in the story. “The Lass of Aughrim” provides a pre-existing reference that Joyce can use to either reinforce or destabilize the plot of his story. In this case, “The Lass of Aughrim” destabilizes the story, allowing Gretta to reject her husband’s advances, refusing to be undone by the gendered construct set up by the story’s plot. The music in “The Dead” allows Joyce to open his narrative to the permeation of language by enduring aural references that enrich the story with depth and meaning.
WORKS CITED


WORKS CONSULTED

